



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

December 20, 2022

Ms. Tessa K. Meredith  
Counsel for the City of Italy  
Messer, Fort & McDonald  
6371 Preston Road, Suite 200  
Frisco, Texas 75034

OR2022-39649

Dear Ms. Meredith:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 987067 (ORR No. I092822BD).

The City of Italy (the "city"), which you represent, received a request for information pertaining to a specified incident. Although you take no position as to whether the submitted information is excepted under the Act, you state release of the submitted information may implicate the interests of the Ellis County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff's office"). Accordingly, you state you notified the sheriff's office of the request for information and of the right to submit arguments to this office. *See* Gov't Code § 552.304 (interested party may submit comments stating why information should or should not be released). We have received comments from the sheriff's office. We have considered the submitted arguments and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). Section 552.108 may be invoked by any proper custodian of information relating to a pending investigation or prosecution of criminal conduct. *See* Open Records Decision No. 474 at 4-5 (1987). Where a governmental body has custody of information relating to a pending case of another law enforcement agency, the custodian of records may withhold the information if it provides

this office with a demonstration the information relates to a pending criminal case and representation from the law enforcement agency that it wishes to have the information withheld. The sheriff's office objects to the release of the information at issue because it relates to a pending criminal investigation, and release of the information would interfere with the investigation and prosecution of the case. Based upon this representation, we conclude the release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the information at issue. Therefore, the city may withhold the marked information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code on behalf of the sheriff's office.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the doctrine of the common-law privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. The Third Court of Appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at \*3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). We note the requestor has a right of access to her own date of birth as well as her spouse's date of birth. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023(a) (person or person's authorized representative has special right of access to records that contain information relating to the person that are protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person's privacy interests); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individuals request information concerning themselves). Accordingly, the city must withhold the remaining public citizen's date of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. We note section 552.130 protects personal privacy. Therefore, the requestor has a right of access to her own motor vehicle record information as well as her spouse's motor vehicle record information pursuant to section 552.023 and it may not be withheld from her under section 552.130. *See id.* § 552.023(a), ORD 481 at 4. Thus, the city must withhold the motor vehicle record information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the city may withhold the marked information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code on behalf of the sheriff's office. The city must withhold the remaining public citizen's date of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The city must withhold the motor vehicle record information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The city must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Kimbell Kesling  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

KK/pt

Ref: ID# 987067

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)

Interested Party  
(w/o enclosures)