



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

December 16, 2022

Ms. Montana A. Anderson
Litigation & PIA Paralegal
City of Abilene
P.O. Box 60
Abilene, Texas 79604-0060

OR2022-39242

Dear Ms. Anderson:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 990846 (City Request #22-2093).

The City of Abilene (the "city") received a request for information pertaining to two named individuals during a specified period of time. You state the city will redact motor vehicle record information pursuant to section 552.130(c) of the Government Code and dates of birth pursuant to Open Records Letter No. 2019-32652 (2019).¹ You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.²

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial

¹ Section 552.130(c) of the Government Code allows a governmental body to redact the information described in section 552.130(a) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. *See Gov't Code* § 552.130(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). *See id.* § 552.130(d), (e). Open Records Letter No. 2019-32652 is a previous determination issued to the city authorizing it to withhold certain public citizens' dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy without requesting a ruling from this office.

² We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988)*. This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides, in part, as follows:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). Upon review, we find report number 22078832 was used or developed in an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect conducted by the city’s police department. *See id.* §§ 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of this section as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes), 261.001(1), (4) (defining “abuse” and “neglect” for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code). Accordingly, we find this information is subject to section 261.201 of the Family Code.

In this instance, however, the requestor is a representative of the Texas Department of Family and Protective Services (“DFPS”). Section 261.105(a) provides “[a]ll reports received by a local or state law enforcement agency that allege abuse or neglect by a person responsible for a child’s care, custody, or welfare shall be referred immediately to [DFPS].” *See id.* § 261.105(a). We note the person suspected of child abuse or neglect in the information at issue was responsible for the children’s care, custody, or welfare. *See id.* § 261.001(5)(B) (person responsible for child’s care, custody, or welfare includes a member of the child’s family or household as defined by chapter 71 of the Family Code). Accordingly, section 261.105(a) is applicable, and the city may not withhold this information from this requestor under section 552.101 of the Government Code on the basis of the confidentiality of section 261.201(a). *See* Attorney General Opinion No. GA-0879 (2011) (law enforcement agency is required to furnish information about alleged child abuse or neglect by person responsible for child’s care, custody, or welfare to DFPS). We also note a statutory right of access prevails over a claim under common-law privacy. *See Collins v. Tex Mall, L.P.*, 297 S.W.3d 409, 415 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2009, no pet.); *see also CenterPoint Energy Houston Elec. LLC v. Harris County Toll Rd. Auth.*, 436 F.3d 541, 544 (5th Cir. 2006). Accordingly, the city may not withhold report number 22078832 under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976).

To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. This office has found a compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. United States Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. However, information that refers to an individual solely as a victim, witness, or involved person is not a compilation of the individual's criminal history and may not be withheld under section 552.101 on that basis.

The present request requires the city to compile the named individuals' criminal history and implicates the named individuals' right to privacy. Therefore, with the exception of report number 22078832, to the extent the city maintains law enforcement records listing either of the named individuals as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the city must withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

As noted above, the requestor is an investigator with the DFPS. Section 411.114(a) of the Government Code states, in pertinent part,

(2) The [DFPS] shall obtain from the [Department of Public Safety ("DPS")] criminal history record information ["CHRI"] maintained by the [DPS] that relates to a person who is:

...

(I) an alleged perpetrator in a report the [DFPS] receives alleging that the person has abused, neglected, or exploited a child, an elderly person, or a person with a disability, provided that:

(i) the report alleges the person has engaged in conduct that meets the applicable definition of abuse, neglect, or exploitation under Chapter 261, Family Code, or Chapter 48, Human Resources Code; and

(ii) the person is not also the victim of the alleged conduct[.]

...

(4) Subject to Section 411.087, the [DFPS is] entitled to:

...

(B) obtain from any other criminal justice agency in this state [CHRI] maintained by that criminal justice agency that relates to a person described by Subdivision (2) or (3)[.]

Gov't Code § 411.114(a)(2)(I), (4)(B). CHRI consists of "information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions." *Id.* § 411.082(2). Thus, the requested information may contain CHRI, and this requestor has a right of access under section 411.114 to CHRI in information held by the city if it involves an alleged perpetrator in a report of child abuse or neglect.

In this instance, the submitted information reveals one of the named individuals is an alleged perpetrator in a report of abuse or neglect of a child. Therefore, the city must release to the requestor the type of allegation made and whether there was an arrest, information, indictment, detention, conviction, or other formal charges and their dispositions from any requested information depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant. *See Collins*, 297 S.W.3d at 415; *CenterPoint Energy*, 436 F.3d at 544. To the extent it exists, the city must withhold any remaining information depicting either of the named individuals as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. We note you have submitted information that does not list either of the named individuals as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant. This information does not consist of a compilation of the named individuals' criminal history, and it may not be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis. Accordingly, we will address the applicability of other exceptions to disclosure of this information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 58.008 of the Family Code, which provides, in part:

(b) Except as provided by Subsection (c), law enforcement records concerning a child and information concerning a child that are stored by electronic means or otherwise and from which a record could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

- (1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult records;
- (2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as adult records, accessible only under controls that are separate and distinct from the controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and
- (3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subsection (c) or Subchapter B, D, or E.

Fam. Code § 58.008(b); *see id.* § 51.03(a)-(b) (defining "delinquent conduct" and "conduct indicating a need for supervision" for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). Section

58.008(b) is applicable to records of juvenile conduct that occurred before, on, or after September 1, 2017. *See* Act of May 28, 2017, 85th Leg., R.S., ch. 746, § 22. The juvenile must have been at least 10 years old and less than 17 years of age when the conduct occurred. *See* Fam. Code § 51.02(2) (defining “child” for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). We find report number 22101823 involves a juvenile offender, so as to fall within the scope of section 58.008(b). It does not appear that any of the exceptions in section 58.008 apply; therefore, the city must withhold report number 22101823 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.008(b) of the Family Code.³

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by section 411.083 of the Government Code, which pertains to criminal history record information (“CHRI”). CHRI generated by the National Crime Information Center (“NCIC”) or by the Texas Crime Information Center is confidential under federal and state law. CHRI means “information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions.” Gov’t Code § 411.082(2). Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI obtained from the NCIC network or other states. *See* 28 C.F.R. § 20.21. The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990); *see generally* Gov’t Code ch. 411 subch. F. Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI the Texas Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F, or subchapter E-1, of the Government Code. *See* Gov’t Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Thus, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with Government Code chapter 411. You assert section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code for the remaining information. Upon review, we find you have failed to demonstrate any of the information at issue consists of confidential CHRI. Therefore, the city may not withhold any portion of the information at issue under section 552.101 of the Government Code on this basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by section 730.004 of the Transportation Code, which provides “an agency may not disclose personal information about any person obtained by the agency in connection with a motor vehicle record.” Transp. Code § 730.004. “Personal information” means “information that identifies a person,” and includes a person’s photograph, social security number, date of birth, driver identification number, name, address but not the zip code, e-mail address, telephone number, and medical or disability information. Transp. Code § 730.003(6). The Texas Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) is an “agency” for purposes of chapter 730. *See id.* § 730.003(1) (“agency” is state agency that compiles or maintains motor vehicle

³ As our ruling is dispositive, we need not consider your remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

records). The city states some of the submitted information consists of records that were obtained by the city from DPS. *See id.* § 730.007(a)(2)(A)(i) (personal information may be disclosed to government agency in carrying out its functions). An authorized recipient of personal information may not re-disclose the personal information and to do so is a misdemeanor offense. *Id.* § 730.013(a), (d). Upon review, we find the remaining information is not confidential under section 730.004 or 730.013 of the Transportation Code, and the city may not withhold that information under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

As noted above, section 552.101 of the Government Code encompasses common-law privacy, which is subject to the two-part test described above. *See Indus. Found.*, 540 S.W.2d at 685. To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered highly intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has found personal financial information not relating to the financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 600 (1992), 545 (1990) (deferred compensation information, participation in voluntary investment program, election of optional insurance coverage, mortgage payments, assets, bills, and credit history). This office has also held common-law privacy protects the identifying information of juvenile victims of abuse or neglect. *See* Open Records Decision No. 394 (1983); *cf.* Fam. Code § 261.201. Upon review, we find the information we marked satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, the city must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

In summary, the city must release report number 22078832 pursuant to section 261.105 of the Family Code. With the exception of report number 22078832, to the extent the city maintains law enforcement records listing either of the named individuals as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the city must (1) release CHRI pertaining to the named individual who is an alleged perpetrator in a report of abuse or neglect of a child from any such information to this requestor pursuant to section 411.114 of the Government Code and (2) withhold the remainder of any such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The city must withhold report number 22101823 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.008(b) of the Family Code. The city must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The city must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open

Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Nick Ybarra
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

NY/pt

Ref: ID# 990846

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)