



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

December 14, 2022

Ms. Karen Strand  
Deputy City Attorney  
City of Mesquite  
P.O. Box 850137  
Mesquite, Texas 75185-0137

OR2022-38690

Dear Ms. Strand:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 989779.

The Mesquite Police Department (the "department") received two requests from the same requestor for information pertaining to a specified complaint and the personnel files of five named department officers.<sup>1</sup> You state the department will release some of the requested information. You state the department will redact dates of birth pursuant to Open Records Letter No. 2015-24970 (2015) and certain other information pursuant to Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009).<sup>2</sup> You claim some of the submitted information is excepted from

---

<sup>1</sup> You state the department sent the requestor a cost estimate of charges pursuant to section 552.2615 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.2615. The estimate of charges required the requestor to provide a deposit for payment of anticipated costs under section 552.263 of the Government Code. *See id.* § 552.263(a). You inform us the department received the required deposit on September 22, 2022. *See id.* § 552.263(e) (if governmental body requires deposit or bond for anticipated costs pursuant to section 552.263, request for information is considered to have been received on date governmental body receives bond or deposit).

<sup>2</sup> Open Records Letter No. 2015-24970 is a previous determination issued to the department authorizing it to withhold the dates of birth of public citizens under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy without seeking a ruling from this office. *See* Open Records Decision No. 673 (2001) (listing elements of second type of previous determination under section 552.301(a) of the Government Code). Open Records Decision No. 684 serves as a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold certain categories of information, including direct deposit authorization forms under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy, an e-mail address of a member of the public under section 552.137 of the Government Code, a Form I-9 and attachments under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1324a of title 8 of the United States Code, a W-4 form under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 6103(a) of title

disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.115, 552.117, 552.1175, 552.130, 552.136, 552.139, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information protected by section 143.089 of the Local Government Code. The department states the City of Mesquite (the “city”) is a civil service city under chapter 143 of the Local Government Code. Section 143.089 provides for the maintenance of two different types of personnel files for each police officer employed by a civil service city: one that must be maintained as part of the officer’s civil service file and another that the police department may maintain for its own internal use. *See* Local Gov’t Code § 143.089(a), (g). Under section 143.089(a), the officer’s civil service file must contain certain specified items, including commendations, periodic evaluations by the police officer’s supervisor, and documents relating to any misconduct in any instance in which the department took disciplinary action against the officer under chapter 143 of the Local Government Code. *Id.* § 143.089(a)(1)-(3). Chapter 143 prescribes the following types of disciplinary actions: removal, suspension, demotion, and uncompensated duty. *Id.* §§ 143.051-.055; *see* Attorney General Opinion JC-0257 (2000) (written reprimand is not disciplinary action for purposes of Local Gov’t Code chapter 143). In cases in which a police department investigates a police officer’s misconduct and takes disciplinary action against an officer, it is required by section 143.089(a)(2) to place all investigatory records relating to the investigation and disciplinary action, including background documents such as complaints, witness statements, and documents of like nature from individuals who were not in a supervisory capacity, in the police officer’s civil service file maintained under section 143.089(a). *See Abbott v. Corpus Christi*, 109 S.W.3d 113,122 (Tex. App.—Austin 2003, no pet.).

All investigatory materials in a case resulting in disciplinary action are “from the employing department” when they are held by or are in the possession of the department because of its investigation into a police officer’s misconduct, and the department must forward them to the civil service commission for placement in the civil service personnel file. *Id.* Such records may not be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 143.089 of the Local Government Code. *See* Local Gov’t Code § 143.089(f); Open Records Decision No. 562 at 6 (1990). Information relating to alleged misconduct or disciplinary action taken must be removed from the police officer’s civil service file if the police department determines that there is insufficient evidence to sustain the charge of misconduct or that the disciplinary action was taken without just cause. *See* Local Gov’t Code § 143.089(b)-(c).

Section 143.089(g) authorizes a police department to maintain, for its own use, a separate and independent internal personnel file relating to a police officer. *See id.* § 143.089(g). Section 143.089(g) provides as follows:

---

26 of the United States Code, and a DD-214 form under section 552.140 of the Government Code without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision. *See* ORD 684.

A fire or police department may maintain a personnel file on a fire fighter or police officer employed by the department for the department's use . . . [T]he department may not release any information contained in the department file to any agency or person requesting information relating to a fire fighter or police officer. The department shall refer to the director or the director's designee a person or agency that requests information that is maintained in the fire fighter's or police officer's personnel file.

*Id.* In *City of San Antonio v. Texas Attorney General*, 851 S.W.2d 946 (Tex. App.—Austin 1993, writ denied), the court addressed a request for information contained in a police officer's personnel file maintained by the police department for its use and the applicability of section 143.089(g) to that file. The records included in the departmental personnel file related to complaints against the police officer for which no disciplinary action was taken. The court determined section 143.089(g) made these records confidential. *See City of San Antonio*, 851 S.W.2d at 949; *see also City of San Antonio v. San Antonio Express-News*, 47 S.W.3d 556 (Tex. App.—San Antonio 2000, pet. denied) (restricting confidentiality under Local Gov't Code § 143.089(g) to “information reasonably related to a police officer's or fire fighter's employment relationship”); Attorney General Opinion JC-0257 at 6-7 (2000) (addressing functions of Local Gov't Code § 143.089(a) and (g) files).

You state the information you marked is contained within the department's internal files maintained pursuant to section 143.089(g) of the Local Government Code. Based on this representation and our review, we find the information you marked is confidential under section 143.089(g) of the Local Government Code and the department must withhold it under section 552.101 of the Government Code.<sup>3</sup>

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 411.083 of the Government Code, which pertains to criminal history record information (“CHRI”). CHRI generated by the National Crime Information Center (“NCIC”) or by the Texas Crime Information Center is confidential under federal and state law. CHRI means “information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions.” Gov't Code § 411.082(2). Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI obtained from the NCIC network or other states. *See* 28 C.F.R. § 20.21. The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990); *see generally* Gov't Code ch. 411 subch. F. Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI the Texas Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F, or subchapter E-1, of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice

---

<sup>3</sup> As our ruling on this information is dispositive, we need not address the remaining argument against its disclosure.

agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Thus, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with Government Code chapter 411. Upon review, we find the information you marked consists of CHRI which the department must withhold under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code and federal law.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 411.192 of the Government Code, which governs the release of information maintained by DPS concerning the licensure of an individual to carry a concealed handgun. Section 411.192 provides, in relevant part:

(a) [DPS] shall disclose to a criminal justice agency information contained in its files and records regarding whether a named individual or any individual named in a specified list is licensed under this subchapter. Information on an individual subject to disclosure under this section includes the individual's name, date of birth, gender, race, zip code, telephone number, e-mail address, and Internet website address. Except as otherwise provided by this section and by Section 411.193, all other records maintained under this subchapter are confidential and are not subject to mandatory disclosure under the [Act].

(b) An applicant or license holder may be furnished a copy of disclosable records regarding the applicant or license holder on request and the payment of a reasonable fee.

*Id.* § 411.192(a)-(b). Upon review, we find you failed to demonstrate the applicability of section 411.192 to any portion of the remaining information. Thus, the department may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 411.192 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the Medical Practice Act (the "MPA"), which governs access to medical records. Occ. Code §§ 151.001-168.202. Section 159.002 of the MPA provides:

(a) A communication between a physician and a patient, relative to or in connection with any professional services as a physician to the patient, is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient's behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

*Id.* § 159.002(a)-(c). Information that is subject to the MPA includes both medical records and information obtained from those medical records. *See id.* §§ 159.002, .004. The information we have marked consists of medical records subject to the MPA. Accordingly, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 159.002 of the Occupations Code. However, none of the remaining information constitutes a record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that was created or is maintained by a physician. Accordingly, the department may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 in conjunction with the MPA.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information subject to chapter 550 of the Transportation Code. Section 550.065 applies only to a written report of an accident required under section 550.061, 550.062, or 601.004. Transp. Code § 550.065(a)(1). Chapter 550 requires the creation of a written report when the accident resulted in injury to or the death of a person or damage to the property of any person to the apparent extent of \$1,000 or more. *Id.* §§ 550.061 (operator's accident report), .062 (officer's accident report). An accident report is privileged and for the confidential use of the Texas Department of Transportation or a local governmental agency of Texas that has use for the information for accident prevention purposes. *Id.* § 550.065(b). However, a governmental entity shall release an accident report in accordance with subsections (c) and (c-1). *Id.* § 550.065(c), (c-1). Section 550.065(c) provides a governmental entity shall release an accident report to a person or entity listed under this subsection. *Id.* § 550.065(c).

In this instance, the requestor is not a person listed under section 550.065(c). Thus, the submitted accident report, which we marked, is confidential under section 550.065(b), and the department must withhold it under section 552.101 of the Government Code. However, section 550.065(c-1) requires the department to create a redacted accident report that may be requested by any person. *Id.* § 550.065(c-1). The redacted accident report may not include the information listed in subsection (f)(2). *Id.* Therefore, the requestor has a right of access to the redacted accident report. Thus, the department must release the redacted accident report to the requestor pursuant to section 550.065(c-1) of the Transportation Code.

We note the remaining information includes information that is excepted from disclosure under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code.<sup>4</sup> Section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure "information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." Gov't Code § 552.102(a). The Texas Supreme Court held section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure the dates of birth of state

---

<sup>4</sup> The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

employees in the payroll database of the Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts. *Tex. Comptroller of Pub. Accounts v. Attorney Gen. of Tex.*, 354 S.W.3d 336, 348 (Tex. 2010). Upon review, we find the department must withhold the submitted employees' dates of birth under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code.<sup>5</sup>

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). This office has also found that personal financial information not relating to the financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is excepted from disclosure under common-law privacy. *See* Open Records Decision No. 600 (1992) (public employee's withholding allowance certificate, designation of beneficiary of employee's retirement benefits, direct deposit authorization, and employee's decisions regarding voluntary benefits programs, among others, protected under common-law privacy). However, information pertaining to the work conduct and job performance of public employees is subject to a legitimate public interest and therefore generally not protected from disclosure under common-law privacy. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 444 at 5-6 (1986) (public has interest in public employee's qualifications and performance and the circumstances of public employee's resignation or termination), 423 at 2 (1984). Additionally, information pertaining to leave of public employees is generally a matter of legitimate public interest. *See* Open Records Decision No. 336 at 2 (1982) (names of employees taking sick leave and dates of sick leave taken not private). We note that the fact that a public employee is sick is public information, but specific information about illnesses is excepted from disclosure. *See* ORD 470 at 4.

Upon review, we find some of the remaining information satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, with the exception of the information we have marked for release, the department must withhold the information you marked and the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, the department has failed to demonstrate the information we have marked for release is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public interest. Therefore, the department may not withhold any portion of the information we have marked for release under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.108(b)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure the internal records and notations of law enforcement agencies and prosecutors when their release would interfere with law enforcement and crime prevention. Gov't Code § 552.108(b)(1); *see also*

---

<sup>5</sup> As our ruling on this information is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against its disclosure.

Open Records Decision No. 531 at 2 (1989) (quoting *Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977)). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(b)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.108(b)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706. Section 552.108(b)(1) is intended to protect "information which, if released, would permit private citizens to anticipate weaknesses in a police department, avoid detection, jeopardize officer safety, and generally undermine police efforts to effectuate the laws of this State." *See City of Fort Worth v. Cornyn*, 86 S.W.3d 320, 327 (Tex. App.—Austin 2002, no pet.). This office has concluded section 552.108(b)(1) excepts from public disclosure information relating to the security or operation of a law enforcement agency. *See, e.g.*, Open Records Decision Nos. 531 (release of detailed use of force guidelines would unduly interfere with law enforcement), 252 (1980) (section 552.108 of the Government Code is designed to protect investigative techniques and procedures used in law enforcement), 143 (1976) (disclosure of specific operations or specialized equipment directly related to investigation or detection of crime may be excepted). Section 552.108(b)(1) is not applicable, however, to generally known policies and procedures. *See, e.g.*, Open Records Decision Nos. 531 at 2-3 (Penal Code provisions, common law rules, and constitutional limitations on use of force not protected), 252 at 3 (governmental body failed to indicate why investigative procedures and techniques requested were any different from those commonly known).

The department states portions of the remaining information, if released, would interfere with law enforcement or prosecution of crime. The department informs us the information at issue, which it marked, relates to department officers' "assignments and shifts/schedules." The department argues "release of unit assignments and shifts/schedules would jeopardize officer safety and generally undermine officers' efforts to effectuate the laws of this State." Based on these representations and our review, we agree the release of the information you marked would interfere with law enforcement. Accordingly, the department may withhold the information you marked under section 552.108(b)(1) of the Government Code.

Section 552.115 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[a] birth or death record maintained by the bureau of vital statistics of the Texas Department of Health or a local registration official[.]" Gov't Code § 552.115(a). Section 552.115 is applicable only to information maintained by the bureau of vital statistics or local registration officials. *See* Open Records Decision No. 338 (1982) (finding that statutory predecessor to section 552.115 excepted only those birth and death records which are maintained by the bureau of vital statistics and local registration officials). We note none of the information consists of a birth or death record maintained by the bureau of vital statistics of the Texas Department of Health or a local registration official. Therefore, the department may not withhold any of the information at issue under section 552.115 of the Government Code.

Section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure the home address, home telephone number, emergency contact information, and social security number of a current or honorably retired peace officer, as well as information that reveals whether the current or honorably retired peace officer has family members, regardless of whether the current or honorably retired peace officer complies with sections 552.024 and 552.1175 of the Government Code. Gov't Code § 552.117(a)(2); *see also id.*

§ 552.003(1-b) (defining “honorably retired” for purposes of the Act). We note, for purposes of section 552.117, “family member” means a spouse, minor child, or adult child who resides in the person’s home. *See id.* § 552.117(c) (providing “family member” has meaning assigned by Fin. Code § 31.006(d)). Section 552.117(a)(2) applies to peace officers as defined by article 2.12 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. We note section 552.117 is also applicable to personal cellular telephone numbers, provided the cellular telephone service is not paid for by a governmental body. *See* Open Records Decision No. 506 at 5-6 (1988) (section 552.117 not applicable to cellular telephone numbers paid for by governmental body and intended for official use). We note a post office box number is not a “home address” for purposes of section 552.117(a). *See* Open Records Decision No. 622 at 4 (1994) (legislative history makes clear that purpose of Gov’t Code § 552.117 is to protect public employees from being harassed at home). Accordingly, the department must withhold the information you marked and the additional information we have marked under section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code; however, the department may only withhold the marked personal cellular numbers under section 552.117(a)(2) if a governmental body does not pay for the cellular telephone service.<sup>6</sup>

Section 552.1175 of the Government Code protects the home address, home telephone number, emergency contact information, social security number, and family member information of certain individuals, when that information is held by a governmental body in a non-employment capacity and the individual elects to keep the information confidential. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.1175. Section 552.1175 applies, in part, to “current or honorably retired peace officers as defined by Article 2.12, Code of Criminal Procedure[.]” *Id.* § 552.1175(a)(1); *see also id.* § 552.003(1-b). We note, for purposes of section 552.1175, “family member” means a spouse, minor child, or adult child who resides in the person’s home. *Cf. id.* § 552.117(c). Upon review, we find the department must withhold the information you marked under section 552.1175 if the individuals to whom this information pertains are currently or honorably retired peace officers as defined by Article 2.12, Code of Criminal Procedure and elect to restrict access to their information in accordance with section 552.1175(b) of the Government Code. However, the department may not withhold the information you marked under section 552.1175 if the individuals are not currently or honorably retired peace officers as defined by Article 2.12, Code of Criminal Procedure, or no elections are made.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator’s license, driver’s license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See id.* § 552.130. Accordingly, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information you marked and the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.136 of the Government Code states “[n]otwithstanding any other provision of this chapter, a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential.” *Id.* § 552.136;

---

<sup>6</sup> As our ruling on this information is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against its disclosure.

*see also id.* § 552.136(a) (defining “access device”). This office has determined insurance policy numbers are access device numbers for purposes of section 552.136. *See* ORD 684 at 9 (2009). You explain the submitted employee numbers are “directly tied to the [d]ebit [c]ard provided to employees by the [c]ity for payroll purposes[.]” Based on this representation, we conclude the department must withhold the employee numbers and insurance policy numbers you marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code.<sup>7</sup>

Section 552.147 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure the social security number of a living person. Gov’t Code § 552.147. Upon review, we agree the department may withhold the social security numbers you marked under section 552.147 of the Government Code. However, the remaining information you marked, which we have marked for release, is not subject to section 552.147 and may not be withheld on that basis.

In summary, the department must withhold the information you marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 143.089(g) of the Local Government Code. The department must withhold the information you marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code and federal law. The department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 159.002 of the Occupations Code. The department must withhold the accident report we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 550.065(b) of the transportation Code but must release the redacted accident report to the requestor pursuant to section 550.065(c-1) of the Transportation Code. The department must withhold the submitted employees’ dates of birth under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code. With the exception of the information we have marked for release, the department must withhold the information you marked and the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department may withhold the information you marked under section 552.108(b)(1) of the Government Code. The department must withhold the information you marked and the additional information we have marked under section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code; however, the department may only withhold the marked personal cellular numbers under section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code if a governmental body does not pay for the cellular telephone service. The department must withhold the information you marked under section 552.1175 of the Government Code if the individuals to whom this information pertains are currently or honorably retired peace officers as defined by Article 2.12, Code of Criminal Procedure and elect to restrict access to their information in accordance with section 552.1175(b) of the Government Code. The department must withhold the motor vehicle record information you have marked and the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must withhold the employee numbers and insurance policy numbers you marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The department may withhold the social security numbers you marked under section 552.147 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.

---

<sup>7</sup> As our ruling on this information is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against its disclosure.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Jennifer Copeland  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

JC/jxd

Ref: ID# 989779

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)