



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

December 12, 2022

Lieutenant Luis Martinez
Laredo Police Department
4712 Maher Avenue
Laredo, Texas 78041

OR2022-38255

Dear Lt. Martinez:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 990893 (LPD Ref. Nos. W026581-083022 and W026665-090622).

The Laredo Police Department (the "department") received two requests from different requestors for information pertaining to a specified incident. The department claims the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception the department claims and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the submitted information includes police officers' body worn camera recordings. Body worn cameras are subject to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code. Chapter 1701 provides the procedures a requestor must follow when seeking a body worn camera recording. Section 1701.661 provides, in relevant part, the following:

(a) A member of the public is required to provide the following information when submitting a written request to a law enforcement agency for information recorded by a body worn camera:

- (1) the date and approximate time of the recording;
- (2) the specific location where the recording occurred; and
- (3) the name of one or more persons known to be a subject of the recording.

Occ. Code § 1701.661(a). In this instance, the requestors do not provide the requisite information under section 1701.661(a) for some of the body worn camera recordings at issue, which we have indicated. As these body worn camera recordings were not properly requested pursuant to chapter 1701, our ruling does not reach this information and it need not be released. However, pursuant to section 1701.661(b), a “failure to provide all the information required by [s]ubsection (a) to be part of a request for recorded information does not preclude the requestor from making a future request for the same recorded information.” *Id.* § 1701.661(b). We note the instant requests include the information required by section 1701.661(a) with respect to the remaining body worn camera recordings. *Id.* § 1701.661(a). Accordingly, we find the requestors properly requested the remaining body worn camera recordings at issue and we will address the department’s argument against their disclosure.

Next, we must address the department’s obligations under section 552.301 of the Government Code, which prescribes the procedures a governmental body must follow in asking this office to decide whether requested information is excepted from public disclosure. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.301. Pursuant to section 552.301(b), a governmental body must ask for a decision from this office and state the exceptions that apply within ten business days of receiving the written request. *See id.* § 552.301(b). Further, pursuant to section 552.301(e), a governmental body must submit to this office within fifteen business days of receiving an open records request (1) written comments stating the reasons why the stated exceptions apply that would allow the information to be withheld, (2) a copy of the written request for information, (3) a signed statement or sufficient evidence showing the date the governmental body received the written request, and (4) a copy of the specific information requested or representative samples, labeled to indicate which exceptions apply to which parts of the documents. *See id.* § 552.301(e). The department received the requests for information on August 30, 2022, and September 6, 2022. The department does not inform us it was closed for any business days between August 30, 2022, and September 27, 2022. This office does not count the date the request was received or holidays for purposes of calculating a governmental body’s deadlines under the Act. Accordingly, the department was required to provide the information required by section 552.301(b) by September 14, 2022, and September 20, 2022, respectively. Moreover, the department was required to provide the information required by section 552.301(e) by September 21, 2022, and September 27, 2022, respectively. However, the envelopes in which the department provided the information required by sections 552.301(b) and 552.301(e) were postmarked September 27, 2022, and September 28, 2022, respectively. *See id.* § 552.308(a)(1) (describing rules for calculating submission dates of documents sent via first class United States mail, common or contract carrier, or interagency mail). Consequently, we conclude the department failed to comply with the procedural requirements mandated by section 552.301 of the Government Code.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body’s failure to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption that the requested information is public and must be released unless there is a compelling reason to withhold the information from disclosure. *See id.* § 552.302;

Simmons v. Kuzmich, 166 S.W.3d 342 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ). The department claims section 552.108 of the Government Code for the remaining information. However, we find the department has failed to establish a compelling reason to address its claimed exception. Nevertheless, sections 552.101, 552.130, and 552.136 of the Government Code can provide compelling reasons to overcome the presumption of openness.¹ Therefore, we will address the applicability of sections 552.101, 552.130, and 552.136 to the remaining information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. The Third Court of Appeals has concluded public citizens’ dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). However, because “the right of privacy is purely personal[,]” that right “terminates upon the death of the person whose privacy is invaded[.]” *Moore v. Charles B. Pierce Film Enters., Inc.*, 589 S.W.2d 489, 491 (Tex. Civ. App.—Texarkana 1979, writ ref’d n.r.e.); *see also Justice v. Belo Broadcasting Corp.*, 472 F. Supp. 145, 146-47 (N.D. Tex. 1979) (“action for invasion of privacy can be maintained only by a living individual whose privacy is invaded” (quoting RESTATEMENT (SECOND) OF TORTS § 652I (1977))); *see* Attorney General Opinions JM-229 (1984) (“the right of privacy lapses upon death”), H-917 (1976) (“We are . . . of the opinion that the Texas courts would follow the almost uniform rule of other jurisdictions that the right of privacy lapses upon death.”); Open Records Decision No. 272 (1981) (the right of privacy is personal and lapses upon death). Thus, the department must withhold all living public citizens’ dates of birth, including any audible dates of birth within the remaining video recordings, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator’s license, driver’s license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.130. We note, because section 552.130 protects privacy interests, the requestors have a right of access to their client’s motor vehicle record information pursuant to section 552.023 of the Government Code. *See id.* § 552.023(b) (governmental body may not deny access to person to whom information relates or person's agent on ground that information is considered confidential by privacy principles); ORD 481 at 4 (privacy theories not implicated when individuals request information concerning themselves). Further, as noted above, the right of privacy

¹ The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

lapses at death. Thus, motor vehicle record information that pertains solely to deceased individuals may not be withheld under section 552.130. *See Moore*, 589 S.W.2d at 491; *see also* Attorney General Opinions JM-229; H-917; ORD 272. Accordingly, with the exception of the information pertaining to the requestors' client or solely to a deceased individual, the department must withhold the information we have marked and all audible and visible license plates and registration stickers in the remaining video recordings under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.136 of the Government Code provides, “[n]otwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential.” Gov’t Code § 552.136(b); *see id.* § 552.136(a) (defining “access device”). This office has determined insurance policy numbers are access device numbers for purposes of section 552.136. Open Records Decision No. 684 at 9 (2009). Accordingly, the department must withhold all visible insurance policy numbers in the remaining video recordings under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

In summary, as the requestors did not properly request the body worn camera recordings we have indicated pursuant to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code, our ruling does not reach this information and the department is not required to release it. The department must withhold all living public citizens' dates of birth, including any audible dates of birth within the remaining video recordings, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. With the exception of the information pertaining to the requestors' client or solely to a deceased individual, the department must withhold the information we have marked and all audible and visible license plates and registration stickers in the remaining video recordings under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must withhold all visible insurance policy numbers in the remaining video recordings under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.²

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable

² As previously noted, the requestor may have a right of access to some of the information being released. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023(a); ORD 481 at 4. If the department receives another request for this information from an individual without such a right of access, we note section 552.130(c) of the Government Code allows a governmental body to react the information described in section 552.130(a) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 553.130(e). *See id.* § 552.130(d), (e).

charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Gerald A. Arismendez
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

GAA/eb

Ref: ID# 990893

Enc. Submitted documents

c: 2 Requestors
(w/o enclosures)