



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

December 1, 2022

Ms. Cynthia Trevino  
Counsel for the City of Universal City  
Denton Navarro Rocha Bernal & Zech, P.C.  
2517 North Main Avenue  
San Antonio, Texas 78212-4685

OR2022-37119

Dear Ms. Trevino:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 983192 (ORR# 22-323).

The Universal City Police Department (the "department"), which you represent, received a request for information pertaining to a named individual. You claim some of the information was not properly requested pursuant to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code. You also claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered your arguments and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (finding significant privacy interest in compilation of individual's criminal history by recognizing distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of criminal history

information). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public.

The requestor asks, in part, for all information held by the department concerning a named individual. Therefore, to the extent the department maintains any unspecified law enforcement information depicting the individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, such information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, the requestor also asks for information pertaining to a specific incident. Because the requestor specifically asks for this information, it is not part of a compilation of the individual's criminal history and may not be withheld on that basis. Additionally, information that refers to an individual solely as a victim, witness, or involved person is not part of a compilation of the individual's criminal history and may not be withheld under section 552.101 on that basis. We note you have submitted information in which the named individual is not depicted as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant. This information does not implicate the privacy interests of the individual and may not be withheld as a compilation of criminal history. Accordingly, we will address your arguments against disclosure of this information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides, in relevant part:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act], and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under [chapter 261 of the Family Code] and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under [chapter 261 of the Family Code] or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). Upon review, we find the information we marked was used or developed in an investigation under chapter 261 of the Family Code. *See id.* §§ 101.003(a) (defining "child" for purposes of section 261.201), 261.001(1), (4) (defining "abuse" and "neglect" for purposes of section 261.201 of Family Code). The department does not indicate it has adopted a rule that governs the release of this type of information. Therefore, we assume no such rule exists. Accordingly, the department must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code.<sup>1</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> As our ruling is dispositive, we need not consider your remaining arguments against disclosure nor the applicability of section 1701.661 of the Occupations Code to the submitted body worn camera recordings. *See generally* Occ. Code § 1701.661(a), (e).

As noted above, section 552.101 of the Government Code encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which is subject to the two-part discussed above. *Indus. Found.*, 540 S.W.2d at 685. Under the doctrine of the common-law privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. The Third Court of Appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at \*3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). Thus, the department must withhold the date of birth we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

However, we note the requestor is a representative of the United States Army Criminal Investigation Division (the "Army") and may have a right of access to some of the information at issue. Section 411.089(a) of the Government Code provides "[a] criminal justice agency is entitled to obtain from the [Texas Department of Public Safety ("DPS")] any criminal history record information ["CHRI"] maintained by [DPS] about a person." *See Gov't Code* § 411.089(a). In addition, section 411.087(a)(2) of the Government Code provides the following:

(a) [A] person, agency, department, political subdivision, or other entity that is authorized by this subchapter or Subchapter E-1 to obtain from [DPS CHRI] maintained by [DPS] that relates to another person is authorized to:

...

(2) obtain from any other criminal justice agency in this state [CHRI] maintained by that criminal justice agency that relates to that person.

*Id.* § 411.087(a)(2). CHRI is defined as "information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions." *See id.* § 411.082(2). However, a criminal justice agency that receives CHRI from another criminal justice agency pursuant to section 411.087(a)(2) may only receive such information for a criminal justice purpose. *See id.* §§ 411.083(c), .087(b); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 655 (1997) (discussing limitations on release of criminal history record information). Thus, to the extent the requestor represents a "criminal justice agency," the requestor is authorized to obtain CHRI concerning the named individual from the department pursuant to section 411.087(a)(2) of the Government Code, but only for a criminal justice purpose. *See Gov't Code* §§ 411.083(c), .087(a)(2). The requestor informs us he intends to use the requested information in connection with a court martial. Thus, we understand the requestor is engaged in the administration of criminal justice and intends to use CHRI for a criminal justice purpose. Accordingly, to the extent it exists, the requestor has a right of access to any CHRI of the named individual under section 411.087(a)(2) of the Government Code. A statutory right of access prevails over a claim under common-law privacy. *See Collins v. Tex Mall, L.P.*, 297 S.W.3d 409, 415 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2009, no pet.) (statutory provision controls and preempts common law only when statute directly

---

conflicts with common-law principle); *see also CenterPoint Energy Houston Elec. LLC v. Harris County Toll Rd. Auth.*, 436 F.3d 541, 544 (5th Cir. 2006) (common law controls only where there is no conflicting or controlling statutory law). Therefore, the department must release any CHRI pertaining to the named individual pursuant to section 411.087(a)(2) of the Government Code, to the extent such information exists. To the extent the department maintains any remaining unspecified law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Although the requestor is a representative of a criminal justice agency and intends to use the information for a criminal justice purpose, we are unable to determine whether the requestor intends to use the information at issue for purposes consistent with the Family Code. *See* Gov't Code §§ 411.083(c), .087(a)(2); *see also* Fam. Code § 261.201(a). Accordingly, we must rule conditionally. If the department determines the requestor intends to use the CHRI purposes consistent with the Family Code, then the department must release the CHRI from the information we marked pursuant to section 411.087 of the Government Code, but withhold the remaining information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. However, if the department determines the requestor does not intend to use the CHRI for purposes consistent with the Family Code, then the department must withhold the information we marked in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. *See* Fam. Code § 261.201(b)-(g), (k) (listing entities authorized to receive section 261.201 information); Open Records Decision Nos. 655, 440 at 2 (1986) (construing predecessor statute).

In summary, the department must release any CHRI pertaining to the named individual pursuant to section 411.087(a)(2) of the Government Code, to the extent such information exists. To the extent the department maintains any remaining unspecified law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. If the department determines the requestor intends to use the CHRI purposes consistent with the Family Code, then the department must release the CHRI from the information we marked pursuant to section 411.087 of the Government Code, but withhold the remaining information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. However, if the department determines the requestor does not intend to use the CHRI for purposes consistent with the Family Code, then the department must withhold the information we marked in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. The department must withhold the date of birth we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Joseph Hoggatt  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

JWH/pt

Ref: ID# 983192

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)