



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

November 29, 2022

Ms. Jessica Redding
Public Information Coordinator
Dallas Independent School District
9400 North Central Expressway
Dallas, Texas 75231

OR2022-36788

Dear Ms. Redding:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 983039 (Ref. No. R022181-081822).

The Dallas Independent School District (the "district") received a request for certain information pertaining to district contracts with two specified entities during a stated period of time. Although you take no position regarding whether the submitted information is excepted from disclosure, you state release of the information at issue may implicate the proprietary interests of 3i Contracting, LLC, and Devpro Commercial Contractors, Inc.¹ Accordingly, you state, and provide documentation demonstrating, the district notified these interested third parties of the request for information and of their right to submit arguments to this office as to why the submitted information should not be released. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 542 (1990) (statutory predecessor to section 552.305 permits governmental body to rely on interested third party to raise and explain applicability of exception in the Act in certain circumstances). We have reviewed the submitted information.

An interested third party is allowed ten business days after the date of its receipt of the governmental body's notice under section 552.305(d) to submit its reasons, if any, as to why information relating to that party should be withheld from public disclosure. *See* Gov't

¹ We note, in a letter dated November 8, 2022, we asked the district to provide additional information pursuant to section 552.303 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.303(c)-(d) (if attorney general determines that information in addition to that required by section 552.301 is necessary to render decision, written notice of that fact shall be given to governmental body and requestor, and governmental body shall submit necessary additional information to attorney general not later than seventh calendar day after date of receipt of notice). As of the date of this letter, this office has not received a response to our correspondence.

Code § 552.305(d)(2)(B). As of the date of this letter, we have not received comments from either of the third parties explaining why the information at issue should not be released. Thus, we have no basis to conclude the third parties have a protected proprietary interest in the information at issue. *See, e.g., id.* § 552.110 (requiring the provision of specific factual evidence demonstrating the applicability of the exception). Therefore, the district may not withhold any portion of the submitted information on the basis of any proprietary interest the third parties may have in it.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code exempts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.”² *Id.* § 552.101. This section encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. The Third Court of Appeals has concluded public citizens’ dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). Accordingly, the district must withhold the dates of birth of public citizens under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.136(b) of the Government Code provides, “[n]otwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a government body is confidential.” Gov’t Code § 552.136(b); *see id.* § 552.136(a) (defining “access device”). This office has determined an insurance policy number is an access device number for purposes of this exception. *See* Open Records Decision No. 684 at 9 (2009). Accordingly, the district must withhold all insurance policy, debit and credit card, bank account, and routing numbers within the remaining information under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

We note some of the remaining information appears to be protected by copyright. A custodian of public records must comply with the copyright law and is not required to furnish copies of records that are copyrighted. Open Records Decision No. 180 at 3 (1977). A governmental body must allow inspection of copyrighted materials unless an exception applies to the information. *Id.*; *see* Open Records Decision No. 109 (1975). If a member of the public wishes to make copies of copyrighted materials, the person must do so unassisted by the governmental body. In making copies, the member of the public assumes the duty of compliance with the copyright law and the risk of a copyright infringement suit.

In summary, the district must withhold the dates of birth of public citizens under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The district must withhold all insurance policy, debit and credit card, bank account, and routing numbers within the remaining information under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The district must release the remaining information; however, any information subject to copyright may only be released in accordance with copyright law.

² The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Blake Brennan
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

BBX/pt

Ref: ID# 983039

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

c: Third Parties
(w/o enclosures)