



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

November 21, 2022

Ms. Claudene Marshall
Assistant General Counsel
Texas A&M University System
301 Tarrow Street, 6th Floor
College Station, Texas 77840-7896

OR2022-36316

Dear Ms. Marshall:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 986050 (ORR# G002064-081922).

The Texas A&M University (the "university") received a request for information, including communications regarding College Products, Inc. ("CPI").¹ Although you take no position as to whether the submitted information is excepted under the Act, you state release of the submitted information may implicate the proprietary interests of CPI. Accordingly, you state, and provide documentation showing, you notified CPI of the request for information and of its right to submit arguments to this office as to why the submitted information should not be released. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 542 (1990) (statutory predecessor to section 552.305 permits governmental body to rely on interested third party to raise and explain applicability of exception in the Act in certain circumstances). We have received comments from CPI. We have considered the submitted arguments and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.110(b) of the Government Code states, "[e]xcept as provided by [s]ection 552.0222, information is [excepted from required disclosure] if it is demonstrated based on

¹ You state the university sought and received clarification of the information requested. *See* Gov't Code § 552.222 (providing if request for information is unclear, governmental body may ask requestor to clarify request); *see also* *City of Dallas v. Abbott*, 304 S.W.3d 380, 387 (Tex. 2010) (holding that when a governmental entity, acting in good faith, requests clarification or narrowing of an unclear or overbroad request for information, the ten-day period to request an attorney general ruling is measured from the date the request is clarified or narrowed).

specific factual evidence that the information is a trade secret.” Gov’t Code § 552.110(b). Section 552.110(a) defines a trade secret as all forms and types of information if:

- (1) the owner of the trade secret has taken reasonable measures under the circumstances to keep the information secret; and
- (2) the information derives independent economic value, actual or potential, from not being generally known to, and not being readily ascertainable through proper means by, another person who can obtain economic value from the disclosure or use of the information.

Id. § 552.110(a). Section 552.110(c) of the Government Code states:

Except as provided by Section 552.0222, commercial or financial information for which it is demonstrated based on specific factual evidence that disclosure would cause substantial competitive harm to the person from whom the information was obtained is [excepted from required disclosure].

Id. § 552.110(c). Additionally, we note section 552.0222(b) lists certain types of information to which section 552.110 does not apply. *See id.* § 552.0222(b). CPI argues some of its information at issue consists of trade secrets and commercial or financial information subject to section 552.110(c). Upon review, we find CPI has demonstrated portions of its information constitutes commercial or financial information, the release of which would cause substantial competitive harm. Accordingly, the university must withhold the information we marked under section 552.110(c) of the Government Code.² However, to the extent any of the customer information CPI seeks to withhold has been made available to the public by CPI, including but not limited to on its website or social media accounts, such information is not confidential under section 552.110(c). Further, we find some of the remaining information at issue is subject to section 552.0222(b) and may not be withheld on the basis of section 552.110. Additionally, we find CPI has failed to provide specific factual evidence demonstrating the remaining information at issue is a trade secret or constitutes commercial or financial information, the release of which would result in substantial competitive harm. Therefore, the university may not withhold any of the remaining information at issue under section 552.110(b) or 552.110(c) of the Government Code.

Section 552.1101 of the Government Code provides, in relevant part, as follows:

- (a) Except as provided by [s]ection 552.0222, information submitted to a governmental body by a vendor, contractor, potential vendor, or potential contractor in response to a request for a bid, proposal, or qualification is excepted from [required disclosure] if the vendor, contractor, potential vendor, or potential contract that the information relates to demonstrates based on specific factual evidence that disclosure of the information would:

² As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address the remaining argument against disclosure of this information.

(1) reveal an individual approach to:

(A) work;

(B) organization structure;

(C) staffing;

(D) internal operations;

(E) processes; or

(F) discounts, pricing methodology, pricing per kilowatt hour, cost data, or other pricing information that will be used in future solicitation or bid documents, and

(2) give advantage to a competitor.

Id. § 552.1101(a). CPI raises section 552.1101(a) of the Government Code for portions of its remaining information, asserting disclosure of the information at issue would reveal an individual approach to work, organizational structure, staffing, internal operations, and processes. However, upon review, we find CPI has failed to provide specific factual evidence demonstrating any portion of its remaining information is subject to section 552.1101(a). Therefore, the university may not withhold any portion of the remaining information at issue under section 552.1101(a) of the Government Code.

Section 552.136 of the Government Code provides, “Notwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential.”³ *Id.* § 552.136(b); *see id.* § 552.136(a) (defining “access device”). This office has determined insurance policy numbers are access device numbers for purposes of section 552.136. *See* Open Records Decision No. 684 at 9 (2009). Accordingly, the university must withhold the insurance policy numbers within the remaining information under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

We note some of the remaining information appears to be protected by copyright. A custodian of public records must comply with the copyright law and is not required to furnish copies of records that are copyrighted. Open Records Decision No. 180 at 3 (1977). A governmental body must allow inspection of copyrighted materials unless an exception applies to the information. *Id.*; *see* Open Records Decision No. 109 (1975). If a member of the public wishes to make copies of copyrighted materials, the person must do so unassisted by the governmental body. In making copies, the member of the public assumes the duty of compliance with the copyright law and the risk of a copyright infringement suit.

³ The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

In summary, the university must withhold the information we marked under section 552.110(c) of the Government Code. The university must withhold the insurance policy numbers within the remaining information under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The university must release the remaining information; however, any information subject to copyright may only be released in accordance with copyright law.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

D. Michelle Case
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

DMH/pt

Ref: ID# 986050

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)