



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

November 18, 2022

Mr. Abel Aguirre
Legal Compliance Specialist
City of Garland
P.O. Box 469002
Garland, Texas 75046-9002

OR2022-36034

Dear Mr. Aguirre:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 984031 (ORR# GCA22-1120).

The Garland Police Department (the "department") received a request for records related to a specified incident. We understand the department will redact dates of birth of members of the public pursuant to the previous determination issued in Open Records Letter No. 2016-00831 (2016).¹ The department claims the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.130, and 552.137 of the Government Code.² We have considered the exceptions the department claims and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we must address the department's obligations under section 552.301 of the Government Code, which prescribes the procedures a governmental body must follow in asking this office to decide whether requested information is excepted from public disclosure. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301. Pursuant to section 552.301(b), a governmental body must ask for a decision from this office and state the exceptions that apply within ten business days of receiving the written request. *See id.* § 552.301(b). The department received the request for information on August 24, 2022. We understand the department

¹ Open Records Letter No. 2016-00831 authorized the department to withhold dates of birth of members of the public under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy without the necessity of requesting an attorney general's decision. *See* Open Records Decision No. 673 at 7-8 (2001) (listing elements of second type of previous determination under section 552.301(a) of the Government Code).

² Although the department does not raise section 552.137 of the Government Code in its brief, we understand the department to raise this exception based on its markings.

was closed on September 5, 2022. The department does not inform us it was closed for any additional business days between August 24, 2022, and September 8, 2022. Accordingly, the department was required to provide the information required by section 552.301(b) by September 8, 2022. However, the envelope in which the department provided the information required by section 552.301(b) was postmarked September 9, 2022. *See id.* § 552.308(a)(1) (describing rules for calculating submission dates of documents sent via first class United States mail, common or contract carrier, or interagency mail). Accordingly, we conclude the department failed to comply with the procedural requirements mandated by section 552.301 of the Government Code.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption that the requested information is public and must be released unless there is a compelling reason to withhold the information from disclosure. *See id.* § 552.302; *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ). The department claims sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.130, and 552.137 of the Government Code for the submitted information. Because sections 552.101, 552.130, and 552.137 can provide compelling reasons to overcome the presumption of openness, we will address the department's arguments under these exceptions against release of the submitted information. However, we find the department has failed to establish a compelling reason to address its remaining claimed exception.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Upon review, we find the department has not demonstrated any of the information at issue is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public concern. Thus, the department may not withhold any portion of the information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information it marked and the additional information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.137 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body" unless the member of the public consents to its release or the e-mail address is of a type specifically excluded by subsection (c). *See* Gov't Code

§ 552.137(a)-(c). The e-mail address at issue is not excluded by subsection (c). Therefore, the department must withhold the personal e-mail address it marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owner affirmatively consents to its public disclosure.

In summary, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information it marked and the additional information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must withhold the personal e-mail address it marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owner affirmatively consents to its public disclosure. The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Claire V. Morris Sloan
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CVMS/mo

Ref: ID# 984031

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)