



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

November 17, 2022

Ms. P. Armstrong
Assistant City Attorney
City of Dallas
1400 Botham Jean Boulevard
Dallas, Texas 75215

OR2022-35883

Dear Ms. Armstrong:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the “Act”), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 984558 (Reference Nos. D025791 and D027144).

The Dallas Police Department (the “department”) received two requests from different requestors for information pertaining to a specified incident. You state the department released some of the requested information. You claim some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.130, 552.136, 552.137, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

Initially, we note, and you acknowledge, the department failed to comply with section 552.301 of the Government Code with regard to the first request. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.301(b), (e). Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body’s failure to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption that the requested information is public and must be released unless there is a compelling reason to withhold the information from disclosure. *See id.* § 552.302; *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342, 350 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.3d 379, 381 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ). The need of a governmental body, other than the governmental body that failed to timely seek

¹ We assume the “representative sample” of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

an open records decision, to withhold information under section 552.108 of the Government Code can provide a compelling reason sufficient to overcome the presumption of openness. *See* Open Records Decision No. 586 (1991). Because you inform us, and provide documentation showing, the Dallas County District Attorney's Office (the "district attorney's office") objects to the release of the information at issue, we will consider whether the department may withhold the information at issue under section 552.108 of the Government Code on behalf of the district attorney's office. Additionally, because sections 552.101, 552.130, and 552.136 can provide compelling reasons to overcome the presumption of openness, we will also address the applicability of these sections to the information at issue.²

Next, we note the information at issue includes a court-filed document. Section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code provides for required public disclosure of "information that is also contained in a public court record," unless it is "made confidential under [the Act] or other law[.]" Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(17). We have marked the document that is subject to section 552.022(a)(17). Although you seek to withhold this information under section 552.108 of the Government Code, this is exception is a discretionary exception and does not make information confidential under the Act. *See id.* § 552.007; Open Records Decision No. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally); 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions), 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 subject to waiver). As such section 552.108 does not make information confidential for the purposes of section 552.022. Accordingly, the marked court document may not be withheld under section 552.108. However, we will address your arguments against disclosure of the remaining information not subject to section 552.022(a)(17).

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). Section 552.108 may be invoked by any proper custodian of information relating to a pending investigation or prosecution of criminal conduct. *See* Open Records Decision No. 474 at 4-5 (1987). Where a governmental body has custody of information relating to a pending case of another law enforcement agency, the custodian of records may withhold the information if it provides this office with a demonstration the information relates to a pending criminal case and representation from the law enforcement agency that it wishes to have the information withheld. The district attorney's office objects to the release of the information at issue because it relates to a pending criminal investigation, and release of the information would interfere with the investigation and prosecution of the case. Based upon this representation, we conclude the release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of*

² We note section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office. *See* Gov't Code § 552.147(b).

Houston, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the information you marked. Accordingly, the department may withhold the information you marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code on behalf of the district attorney's office.³

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. The court of appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). Thus, the department must withhold all public citizens' dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. Gov't Code § 552.130. We note, however, because section 552.130 is designed to protect the privacy of individuals, the second requestor has a right of access to her client's motor vehicle record information pursuant to section 552.023 of the Government Code. *See id.* § 552.023(a) (governmental body may not deny access to person to whom information relates or person's agent on ground that information is considered confidential by privacy principles); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individuals request information concerning themselves). Accordingly, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information you marked from the first requestor under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must release the marked court-filed document pursuant to section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code. The department may withhold the information you marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code on behalf of the district attorney's office. The department must withhold all public citizens' dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the motor vehicle record information you marked from the first requestor under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

³ As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address the remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Jahna Ward
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JW/jxd

Ref: ID# 984558

Enc. Submitted documents

c: 2 Requestors
(w/o enclosures)