



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

November 10, 2022

Ms. Mary E. Miller
Assistant District Attorney
Denton County Sheriff's Office
127 North Woodrow Lane, Suite 300
Denton, Texas 76205

OR2022-35217

Dear Ms. Miller:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 984262 (ORR# 2022-401).

The Denton County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff's office") received a request for information pertaining to five named individuals at a particular address from a stated period of time. You state the sheriff's office has released some information. You claim some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.130, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has

significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public.

The present request requires the sheriff's office to compile unspecified law enforcement records concerning the named individuals. We find this request for unspecified law enforcement records implicates the named individuals' right to privacy. Therefore, to the extent the sheriff's office maintains law enforcement records depicting any of the named individuals as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the sheriff's office must withhold any such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

However, information that refers to an individual solely as a victim, witness, or involved person is not part of a compilation of the individual's criminal history and may not be withheld under section 552.101 on that basis. We note you have submitted information in which the named individuals are not depicted as suspects, arrestees, or criminal defendants. This information does not implicate the privacy interests of the individuals and may not be withheld as a compilation of criminal history. Accordingly, we will address your arguments against disclosure of this information.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Upon review, we find the remaining information contains visible motor vehicle record information. You state the sheriff's office lacks the technological capability to redact the confidential information in the video recordings at issue. Based upon this representation, we conclude the sheriff's office must withhold the information you marked and the video recordings we have indicated in their entireties, under section 552.130 of the Government Code.¹ *See* Open Records Decision No. 364 (1983).

As stated above, section 552.101 of the Government of the Code encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. *Indus. Found.*, 540 S.W.2d at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). The Third Court of Appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). Upon review, we find some of the submitted information satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, with the exception of the information we have marked for release, the sheriff's office must withhold the information

¹ As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address the remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

you marked, and the additional information we have marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, the sheriff's office has failed to demonstrate any of the remaining information is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate concern to the public. Therefore, the sheriff's office may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information made confidential by chapter 772 of the Health and Safety Code, which authorizes the development of local emergency communication districts. Section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code applies to an emergency communication district for a county with a population of more than 20,000 and makes confidential the originating telephone numbers and addresses of 9-1-1 callers that are furnished by a 9-1-1 service supplier. *See* Open Records Decision No. 649 (1996). The sheriff's office indicates it is part of an emergency communication district that is subject to section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code. The sheriff's office seeks to withhold names and telephone numbers of callers under section 772.318. We conclude the sheriff's office must withhold the telephone numbers at issue under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code if they consist of the originating telephone numbers and addresses furnished by a 9-1-1 service supplier. We note names of callers are not made confidential by section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code. Accordingly, the sheriff's office may not withhold any of the remaining information it marked under section 552.101 on that basis.

In summary, to the extent the sheriff's office maintains law enforcement records depicting any of the named individuals as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the sheriff's office must withhold any such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The sheriff's office must withhold the information you marked and the video recordings we have indicated in their entirety, under section 552.130 of the Government Code. With the exception of the information we have marked for release, the sheriff's office must withhold the information you marked, and the additional information we have marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The sheriff's office must withhold the telephone numbers at issue under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code if they consist of the originating telephone numbers and addresses furnished by a 9-1-1 service supplier. The sheriff's office must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable

charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Erin Groff
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

EMG/pt

Ref: ID# 984262

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)