



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

November 8, 2022

Mr. Ruben H. Nevarez, Jr.
Assistant County Attorney
El Paso County
500 East San Antonio, Room 503
El Paso, Texas 79901

OR2022-34827

Dear Mr. Nevarez:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 983645 (File No. 0666-22-PI).

The El Paso County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff's office") received a request for information pertaining to a specified incident. You state you have released some information to the requestor. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the submitted information contains court-filed documents. Section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code provides for required public disclosure of "information that is also contained in a public court record[,] unless the information is expressly made confidential under the Act or other law. Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(17). You seek to withhold the court-filed documents, which we marked, under section 552.108 of the Government Code. However, this section is a discretionary exception to disclosure that protects a governmental body's interests and does not make information confidential under the Act. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 664 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions), 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to Gov't Code § 552.108 subject to waiver). Therefore, you may not withhold the court-filed documents, which we marked, under section 552.108. As no further exceptions to disclosure have been raised, the sheriff's office must release the court-filed documents we marked pursuant to section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code. However, we will address your argument for the information not subject to section 552.022(a)(17).

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). The sheriff’s office states the remaining information pertains to a pending criminal prosecution. We note, however, the information at issue includes a DIC-24 Statutory Warning, a DIC-25 Notice of Suspension, and a citation. These documents have previously been provided to the arrestee. Because this information has previously been released to the arrestee, we find the sheriff’s office has not shown release of the documents will interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1)*. Nevertheless, upon review, we conclude the release of the remaining information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the remaining information.

However, we note section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov’t Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Thus, with the exception of the DIC-24 Statutory Warning, the DIC-25 Notice of Suspension, the citation, and basic information, which generally must be released, the sheriff’s office may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.”¹ Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the doctrine of the common-law privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. The Third Court of Appeals has concluded public citizens’ dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). Thus, the sheriff’s office must withhold the public citizen’s date of birth we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

¹ The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the sheriff's office must withhold the motor vehicle record information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the sheriff's office must release the court-filed documents we marked pursuant to section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code. With the exception of the DIC-24 Statutory Warning, the DIC-25 Notice of Suspension, the citation, and basic information, which must be released, the sheriff's office may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. The sheriff's office must withhold the public citizen's date of birth we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The sheriff's office must withhold the motor vehicle record information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The sheriff's office must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Kimbell Kesling
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

KK/jxd

Ref: ID# 983645

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)