



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

November 7, 2022

Mr. James Kopp  
Assistant City Attorney  
City of San Antonio  
P.O. Box 839966  
San Antonio, Texas 78283-3966

OR2022-34497

Dear Mr. Kopp:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 983371 (COSA File Nos. W465662, W465664, and W465666).

The City of San Antonio (the "city") received three requests from the same requestor for information pertaining to the requestor and specified communications between named entities. You state you have no information responsive to one of the requests.<sup>1</sup> You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.152 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.152 of the Government Code provides:

Information in the custody of a governmental body that relates to an employee or officer of the governmental body is excepted from [required public disclosure] if, under the specific circumstances pertaining to the employee or officer, disclosure of the information would subject the employee or officer to a substantial threat of physical harm.

Gov't Code § 552.152. The city represents the release of the undercover officers' identities would subject the officers to a substantial threat of physical harm. Therefore, we find

---

<sup>1</sup> The Act does not require a governmental body that receives a request for information to create information that did not exist when the request was received. *See Econ. Opportunities Dev. Corp. v. Bustamante*, 562 S.W.2d 266 (Tex. Civ. App.—San Antonio 1978, writ dismissed); Open Records Decision Nos. 605 at 2 (1992), 563 at 8 (1990), 555 at 1-2 (1990), 452 at 3 (1986), 362 at 2 (1983).

section 552.152 is applicable to the identities of the undercover officers within the information at issue. Accordingly, the city must withhold the identifying information of the undercover officers, which you marked, under section 552.152 of the Government Code.<sup>2</sup> However, we find you have failed to demonstrate the release of the remaining information at issue would subject an employee or officer to a substantial risk of physical harm. Accordingly, the city may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.152 of the Government Code.

Section 552.108(b)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure the internal records and notations of law enforcement agencies and prosecutors when their release would interfere with law enforcement and crime prevention. *Id.* § 552.108(b)(1); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 531 at 2 (1989) (quoting *Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977)). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(b)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.108(b)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). Section 552.108(b)(1) is intended to protect “information which, if released, would permit private citizens to anticipate weaknesses in a police department, avoid detection, jeopardize officer safety, and generally undermine police efforts to effectuate the laws of this State.” *See City of Fort Worth v. Cornyn*, 86 S.W.3d 320 at 327 (Tex. App.—Austin 2002, no pet.). This office has concluded section 552.108(b)(1) excepts from public disclosure information relating to the security or operation of a law enforcement agency. *See, e.g.*, ORDs 531 (release of detailed use of force guidelines would unduly interfere with law enforcement), 252 (1980) (section 552.108 of the Government Code is designed to protect investigative techniques and procedures used in law enforcement), 143 (1976) (disclosure of specific operations or specialized equipment directly related to investigation or detection of crime may be excepted). Section 552.108(b)(1) is not applicable, however, to generally known policies and procedures. *See, e.g.*, Open Records Decision Nos. 531 at 2–3 (Penal Code provisions, common law rules, and constitutional limitations on use of force not protected), 252 at 3 (governmental body failed to indicate why investigative procedures and techniques requested were any different from those commonly known).

You state some of the remaining information, if released, would interfere with law enforcement or prosecution of crime. However, we find you have not demonstrated release of any of the remaining information at issue would interfere with law enforcement or crime prevention. Accordingly, the city may not withhold any of the remaining information at issue under section 552.108(b)(1) of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes. As part of the Texas Homeland Security Act (the “HSA”), sections 418.176 through 418.182 were added to chapter 418 of the Government Code. Section 418.176 provides, in relevant part, as follows:

---

<sup>2</sup> As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure of this information.

(a) Information is confidential if the information is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental entity of the purpose of preventing, detecting, responding to, or investigating an act of terrorism or related criminal activity and:

(1) relates to staffing requirements of an emergency response provider, including a law enforcement agency, a fire-fighting agency, or an emergency services agency;

(2) relates to a tactical plan of the provider; or

(3) consists of a list or compilation of pager or telephone numbers, including mobile and cellular telephone numbers of the provider.

*Id.* § 418.176(a). The fact that information may generally be related to emergency preparedness does not make the information *per se* confidential under the provisions of the HSA. *See* Open Records Decision No. 649 at 3 (1996) (language of confidentiality provisions controls scope of its protection). Furthermore, the mere recitation by a governmental body of a statute's key terms is not sufficient to demonstrate the applicability of the claimed provision. As with any confidentiality statute, a governmental body asserting this section must adequately explain how the responsive information falls within the scope of the provision. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(e)(1)(A) (governmental body must explain how claimed exception to disclosure applies).

You state release of the information at issue "could compromise the ability of the police department to respond to incidents, by suggesting which types of incidents have specific, advance action plans, and the tactics to be used." However, upon review, we find you have failed to demonstrate the information at issue relates to staffing requirements or tactical plans maintained by the city for the purpose of preventing, detecting, responding to, or investigating an act of terrorism or related criminal activity. Accordingly, the city may not withhold any portion of the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 418.176 of the Government Code.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release.<sup>3</sup> *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. The city must withhold the information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the city must withhold the identifying information of the undercover officers, which you marked, under section 552.152 of the Government Code. The city must withhold

---

<sup>3</sup> The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 at 2 (1987), 480 at 5 (1987).

the information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The city must release the remaining information.<sup>4</sup>

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

D. Michelle Case  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

DMH/mo

Ref: ID# 983371

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)

---

<sup>4</sup> We note the information being released contains information to which the requestor has a right of access under section 552.023 of the Government Code. See Gov't Code § 552.023(a) ("person or a person's authorized representative has special right of access, beyond right of general public, to information held by governmental body that relates to person and that is protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person's privacy interests"); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individual requests information concerning himself). Accordingly, if the city receives another request for this same information from a different requestor, the city must again seek a ruling from this office.