



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

November 1, 2022

Ms. Kelley Messer
First Assistant City Attorney
City of Abilene
P.O. Box 60
Abilene, Texas 79604

OR2022-33916

Dear Ms. Messer:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 981764 (ORR# 22-1734).

The Abilene Police Department (the "department") received a request for records related to an internal affairs investigation of a named former department employee. The department claims the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception the department claims and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). This office has also held

¹ We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

common-law privacy protects the identifying information of a juvenile victim of abuse or neglect. *See* Open Records Decision No. 394 (1983); *cf.* Fam. Code § 261.201. However, this office has concluded the public has a legitimate interest in information that relates to public employees and their conduct in the workplace. *See, e.g.,* Open Records Decision Nos. 562 at 10 (1990) (personnel file information does not involve most intimate aspects of human affairs but in fact touches on matters of legitimate public concern), 470 at 4 (1987) (job performance does not generally constitute public employee's private affairs), 444 at 3 (1986) (public has obvious interest in information concerning qualifications and performance of government employees), 405 at 2 (1983) (manner in which public employee's job was performed cannot be said to be of minimal public interest), 329 (1982) (reasons for employee's resignation ordinarily not private). Upon review, we find some of the submitted information, which we marked, satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Therefore, the department must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we find the department has not demonstrated any of the remaining information at issue is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public concern. Thus, the department may not withhold any portion of the remaining information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Some of the remaining information is subject to section 552.117 of the Government Code.² Section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure the home address, home telephone number, emergency contact information, and social security number of a current or honorably retired peace officer, as well as information that reveals whether the current or honorably retired peace officer has family members, regardless of whether the current or honorably retired peace officer complies with sections 552.024 and 552.1175 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.117(a)(2), .003(1-b) (defining "honorably retired" for purposes of the Act). Section 552.117(a)(2) applies to current or honorably retired peace officers as defined by article 2.12 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. Further, section 552.117(a)(11) excepts from public disclosure the home address, home telephone number, emergency contact information, and social security number of a current or former member of the United States Army, Navy, Air Force, Coast Guard, or Marine Corps, as well as information that reveals whether the individual has family members. *See id.* § 552.117(a)(11). Moreover, section 552.117(a)(19) excepts from disclosure the home address and telephone number, emergency contact information, social security number, and family member information of a firefighter or volunteer firefighter or emergency medical services personnel as defined by Section 773.003 of the Health and Safety Code, regardless of whether the current or former employee complies with section 552.024 or 552.1175. *See id.* § 552.117(a)(19). We note, for purposes of section 552.117, "family member" means a spouse, minor child, or adult child who resides in the person's home. *See id.* § 552.117(c) (providing "family member" has meaning assigned by Fin. Code § 31.006(d)). We also note section 552.117 is applicable to personal cellular telephone numbers, provided the cellular telephone service is not paid for by a governmental body. *See* Open Records Decision No. 506 at 5-6 (1988) (section 552.117

² The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

not applicable to cellular telephone numbers paid for by governmental body and intended for official use). Some of the remaining information, which we marked, pertains to individuals who are subject to sections 552.117(a)(2), 552.117(a)(11), and 552.117(a)(19) of the Government Code. Accordingly, the department must withhold the information we marked under sections 552.117(a)(2) and 552.117(a)(11) of the Government Code; and, if a governmental body does not pay for the cellular telephone service, the department must withhold the cellular telephone number we marked under section 552.117(a)(19) of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the information we marked under subsections 552.117(a)(2) and 552.117(a)(11) and of the Government Code; and, if a governmental body does not pay for the cellular telephone service, the department must withhold the cellular telephone number we marked under section 552.117(a)(19) of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Claire V. Morris Sloan
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CVMS/eb

Ref: ID# 981764

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)