



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

October 31, 2022

Mr. John Fleming
County Attorney
Nacogdoches County
101 West Main Street, Room 230
Nacogdoches, Texas 75961

OR2022-33600

Dear Mr. Fleming:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 981213.

The Nacogdoches County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff's office") received a request for all information pertaining to a specified incident on a stated date. You state the sheriff's office has released basic information pursuant to section 552.108(c) of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.108(c). You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the claimed exceptions and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" *Id.* § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state Exhibits C-1, C-2, and D relate to an open and pending criminal investigation. Based upon this representation, we conclude the release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection,

investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to Exhibits C-1, C-2, and D.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure “basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime.” *See* Gov’t Code § 552.108(c). Section 552.108(c) refers to the basic information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Accordingly, with the exception of basic information, which you state the sheriff’s office has released, the sheriff’s office may withhold Exhibits C-1, C-2, and D under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.¹

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information protected by the Medical Practice Act (the “MPA”), subtitle B of title 3 of the Occupations Code, which governs release of medical records. Section 159.002 of the MPA provides, in relevant part:

- (a) A communication between a physician and a patient, relative to or in connection with any professional services as a physician to the patient, is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.
- (b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.
- (c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient’s behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

Occ. Code § 159.002(a)-(c). Information that is subject to the MPA includes both medical records and information obtained from those medical records. *See id.* §§ 159.002, .004. This office has determined the protection afforded by section 159.002 extends only to records created by either a physician or someone under the supervision of a physician. *See*

¹ As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address the remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

Open Records Decision Nos. 487 (1987), 370 (1983), 343 (1982). Upon review, we find some of the remaining information constitutes records of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that were created or is maintained by a physician or someone under the supervision of a physician and information obtained from a patient's medical records. Accordingly, the sheriff's office must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the MPA. However, we find none of the remaining information constitutes medical records subject to the MPA. Therefore, the sheriff's office may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). The court of appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied). (mem. op.). Upon review, we find some of the remaining information satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, the sheriff's office must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

In summary, with the exception of basic information, which you state the sheriff's office has released, the sheriff's office may withhold Exhibits C-1, C-2, and D under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. The sheriff's office must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the MPA. The sheriff's office must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The sheriff's office must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open->

[government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued](#) or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

James M. Graham
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JMG/pt

Ref: ID# 981213

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)