



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

October 27, 2022

Ms. S. McClellan
Assistant City Attorney
City of Dallas
1400 Botham Jean Boulevard
Dallas, Texas 75215

OR2022-33296

Dear Ms. McClellan:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the “Act”), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 980873 (ORR# D023972).

The Dallas Police Department (the “department”) received a request for information pertaining to the requestor’s child. The department indicates it will withhold information pursuant to section 552.136(c) of the Government Code.¹ The department claims some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code.² We have considered the claimed exception and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.³

¹ Section 552.136 of the Government Code permits a governmental body to withhold the information described in section 552.136(b) without the necessity of seeking a decision from this office. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.136(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.136(e). *See id.* § 552.136(d), (e).

² We note the department did not comply with the requirements of section 552.301 of the Government Code. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.301(b), (e). Nevertheless, section 552.101 of the Government Code can provide a compelling reason to overcome the presumption of openness caused by a failure to comply with section 552.301.

³ We assume the “representative sample” of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses section 58.008 of the Family Code, which provides, in part, the following:

(b) Except as provided by Subsection (c), law enforcement records concerning a child and information concerning a child that are stored by electronic means or otherwise and from which a record could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

- (1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult records;
- (2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as adult records, accessible only under controls that are separate and distinct from the controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and
- (3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subsection (c) or Subchapter B, D, or E.

...

(d) Law enforcement records concerning a child may be inspected or copied by:

- (1) a juvenile justice agency, as defined by Section 58.101;
- (2) a criminal justice agency, as defined by Section 411.082, Government Code;
- (3) the child; or
- (4) the child’s parent or guardian.

(e) Before a child or a child’s parent or guardian may inspect or copy a record concerning the child under Subsection (d), the custodian of the record shall redact:

- (1) any personally identifiable information about a juvenile suspect, offender, victim, or witness who is not the child; and
- (2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under [the Act], or any other law.

Fam. Code § 58.008(b), (d), (e); *see also id.* § 51.03(a)-(b) (defining “delinquent conduct” and “conduct indicating a need for supervision” for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). Section 58.008(b) is applicable to records of juvenile conduct that occurred before, on, or after September 1, 2017. The juvenile must have been at least 10 years old and less than 17 years of age when the conduct occurred. *See id.* § 51.02(2) (defining “child” for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). We find the submitted information involves juvenile offenders, so as to fall within the scope of section 58.008(b). However, the requestor is a parent of one of the juvenile offenders at issue and has access to the information pursuant to section 58.008(d). *See id.* § 58.008(d). Therefore, the department may not withhold the submitted information from the requestor under section 552.101 on the basis of section 58.008(b). *See id.* § 58.008(d). Nevertheless, the department must withhold the personally identifiable information concerning the other juvenile offender, which we have marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.008(e)(1) of the Family Code. *Id.* § 58.008(e)(1). The remaining information is not confidential under section 58.008(e)(1) and the department may not withhold it under section 552.101 on that ground. Section 58.008(e)(2) provides information that is subject to any other exception to disclosure under the Act or other law must be redacted. *See id.* § 58.008(e)(2). Thus, pursuant to section 58.008(e)(2) we will consider whether the remaining information is otherwise excepted from disclosure.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. The Third Court of Appeals has concluded public citizens’ dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). The department must withhold the date of birth we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

In summary, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.008(e)(1) of the Family Code. The department must also withhold the date of birth we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must release the remaining information.⁴

Finally, the department asks this office to issue a previous determination permitting it to withhold information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.008(b) of the Family Code without requesting a ruling from this office. *See Gov’t Code* § 552.301(a) (allowing governmental body to withhold information subject to previous determination); Open Records Decision No. 673 (2001). However, we decline to do so at this time. Accordingly, this letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue

⁴ Because the requestor has a special right of access to the information being released, the department must again seek a decision from this office if it receives a request for the same information from another requestor.

in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us. Therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

James L. Coggeshall
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JLC/jxd

Ref: ID# 980873

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)