



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

October 26, 2022

Ms. April Earley
Senior Assistant City Attorney
City of Tyler
P.O. Box 2039
Tyler, Texas 75710

OR2022-33213

Dear Ms. Earley:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 981024 (Ref. No. 1290).

The City of Tyler (the "city") received a request for certain information pertaining to a specified incident involving a named individual. You state the city has released some information to the requestor. You claim some of the submitted information was not properly requested pursuant to section 1701.661 of the Occupations Code. You also claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.103 of the Government Code. We have considered your arguments and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

Initially, we note the submitted information includes city police officers' body worn camera recordings. Body worn cameras are subject to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code. Chapter 1701 provides the procedures a requestor must follow when seeking a body worn camera recording. Section 1701.661(a) provides:

A member of the public is required to provide the following information when submitting a written request to a law enforcement agency for information recorded by a body worn camera:

(1) the date and approximate time of the recording;

¹ We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. See Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

(2) the specific location where the recording occurred; and

(3) the name of one or more persons known to be a subject of the recording.

Occ. Code § 1701.661(a). In this instance, the requestor does not provide the requisite information under section 1701.661(a). As the body worn camera recordings at issue were not properly requested pursuant to section 1701.661(a) of the Occupations Code, our ruling does not reach this information and the city need not release it.² However, pursuant to section 1701.661(b), a “failure to provide all the information required by [s]ubsection (a) to be part of a request for recorded information does not preclude the requestor from making a future request for the same recorded information.” *Id.* § 1701.661(b).

Next, we note some of the remaining information may have been the subject of a previous request for information, as a result of which this office issued Open Records Letter No. 2020-28384 (2020). In that ruling, we determined, in relevant part, the city must release the information at issue pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code. We note the Act does not permit the selective disclosure of information. Section 552.007 of the Government Code provides if a governmental body voluntarily releases information to any member of the public, the governmental body may not withhold such information from further disclosure unless its public release is expressly prohibited by law or the information is confidential by law. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.007; Open Records Decision No. 518 at 3 (1989); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 400 (1983) (governmental body may waive right to claim permissive exceptions to disclosure under the Act, but it may not disclose information made confidential by law). Accordingly, pursuant to section 552.007, the city may not now withhold the information that was previously released unless its release is expressly prohibited by law or the information is confidential by law. You seek to withhold the information at issue under section 552.103 of the Government Code. However, section 552.103 is a discretionary exception and does not make information confidential under the Act. *See Dallas Area Rapid Transit v. Dallas Morning News*, 4 S.W.3d 469, 475-76 (Tex. App.—Dallas 1999, no pet.) (governmental body may waive section 552.103); *see also* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions). Accordingly, to the extent the information at issue was previously released in Open Records Letter No. 2020-28384, the city may not now withhold the information under section 552.103 of the Government Code. In that instance, because sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code make information confidential under the Act, we will address the applicability of these sections to the information previously ordered released.³ Furthermore, to the extent the information at issue was not previously ordered released in Open Records Letter No. 2020-28384, we will address your argument under section 552.103 of the Government Code.

² As we are able to make this determination, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure of this information.

³ The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

Next, we note the remaining information is subject to section 552.022 of the Government Code. Section 552.022(a) provides, in relevant part:

[T]he following categories of information are public information and not excepted from required disclosure unless made confidential under this chapter or other law:

- (1) a completed report, audit, evaluation, or investigation made of, for, or by a governmental body, except as provided by Section 552.108[.]

Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(1). The information at issue is part of a completed investigation that is subject to section 552.022(a)(1) of the Government Code. The city must release this information pursuant to section 552.022(a)(1) unless it is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code or expressly made confidential under the Act or other law. Although you raise section 552.103 of the Government Code for the information at issue, this section is a discretionary exception to disclosure and does not make information confidential under the Act. *See Dallas Area Rapid Transit*, 4 S.W.3d at 475-76; ORDs 665 at 2 n.5, 663 at 5. Therefore, no portion of the remaining information may be withheld under section 552.103. However, because sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code make information confidential under the Act, we will address the applicability of these sections to the information at issue.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information made confidential by other statutes, such as chapter 411 of the Government Code, which pertains to criminal history record information (“CHRI”). CHRI generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center is confidential under federal and state law. CHRI means “information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions.” *Id.* § 411.082(2). Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI obtained from the federal government or other states. *See* 28 C.F.R. § 20.21; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). However, the federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. *See* ORD 565. Section 411.083 of the Government Code makes CHRI maintained by the Texas Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) confidential, and only allows for the dissemination of this information as provided in subchapters E-1 and F of chapter 411 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 411.083(a). Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize the dissemination of CHRI to a criminal justice agency, but a criminal justice agency may only release CHRI to another criminal justice agency if it is for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Certain other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency, but may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090-.127. Thus, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the

Government Code in conjunction with chapter 411. We further note Federal Bureau of Investigation (“FBI”) numbers constitute CHRI generated by the FBI. However, we note section 411.083 does not apply to active warrant information or other information relating to one’s current involvement with the criminal justice system. *See id.* § 411.081(b) (police department allowed to disclose information pertaining to person’s current involvement in criminal justice system). We also note driving record information is not made confidential by the confidentiality provisions that govern CHRI. *See id.* § 411.082(2)(B) (definition of CHRI does not include driving record information). Upon review, we find the information we have marked consists of CHRI that is confidential under section 411.083. Accordingly, the city must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code and federal law.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. The Third Court of Appeals has concluded public citizens’ dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). In this instance, we note the requestor is acting as the authorized representative of the individual named in the present request, who is the requestor’s adult son. Thus, the requestor has a right of access to information pertaining to herself and her adult son that would otherwise be confidential under common-law privacy. *See Gov’t Code* § 552.023 (person or person’s authorized representative has special right of access to records that contain information relating to the person that are protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person’s privacy interests); ORD 481 at 4 (privacy theories not implicated when individual requests information concerning herself). Accordingly, with the exception of the dates of birth belonging to the requestor and her adult son, the city must withhold all dates of birth within the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure information relating to a motor vehicle operator’s or driver’s license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country. *See Gov’t Code* § 552.130. We note section 552.130 is designed to protect the privacy of individuals. Thus, the requestor has a right of access to motor vehicle record information pertaining to herself and her adult son, and it may not be withheld from the requestor under section 552.130. *See id.* § 552.023; ORD 481 at 4. Accordingly, with the exception of the motor vehicle record information pertaining to the requestor and her adult son, the city must withhold all audible and visible license plates, license plate numbers and states of issuance, registration stickers, and driver’s license information within the remaining recordings and photographs at issue and the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, as the body worn camera recordings at issue were not properly requested pursuant to section 1701.661(a) of the Occupations Code, our ruling does not reach this

information and the city need not release it. The city must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code and federal law. With the exception of the dates of birth belonging to the requestor and her adult son, the city must withhold all dates of birth within the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. With the exception of the motor vehicle record information pertaining to the requestor and her adult son, the city must withhold all audible and visible license plates, license plate numbers and states of issuance, registration stickers, and driver's license information within the remaining recordings and photographs at issue and the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The city must release the remaining information to this requestor.⁴

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Blake Brennan
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

BBX/pt

Ref: ID# 981024

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

⁴ As noted above, the requestor has a special right of access to some of the information being released in this instance. See Gov't Code § 552.023(a); ORD 481 at 4. Because such information is confidential with respect to the general public, if the city receives another request for this information from a different requestor, the city must again seek a ruling from this office.