



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

October 11, 2022

Ms. LaNetra S. Lary  
Assistant County Attorney  
Fort Bend County  
401 Jackson Street, 3rd Floor  
Richmond, Texas 77469

OR2022-31200

Dear Ms. Lary:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 977041 (ORR# 0912).

The Fort Bend County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff's office") received a request for records related to a specified arrest of a named individual. The sheriff's office claims the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.130, and 552.136 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions the sheriff's office claims and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.108 of the Government Code provides, in relevant part:

(a) Information held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime is excepted from [required public disclosure] if:

(1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime; [or]

(2) it is information that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime only in relation to an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication[.]

Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1)-(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the information at issue would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706, 710 (Tex. 1977). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must

demonstrate the information at issue relates to a closed criminal investigation that concluded in a final result other than conviction or deferred adjudication. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.108(b)(1), .301(e)(1)(A) (governmental body must provide comments explaining why exceptions raised should apply to information requested).

The sheriff's office claims section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code for the submitted information, and states release of the information would interfere with the prosecution and investigation of a crime. The sheriff's office also informs us the investigation is closed. Further, the sheriff's office provided a statement demonstrating the case at issue resulted in a conviction. In light of these representations, we are unable to determine whether the submitted reports relate to ongoing criminal cases or to closed cases that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. Additionally, we find the sheriff's office has failed to establish these arguments are complementary as contemplated by the court of appeals in *City of Carrollton v. Paxton*, 490 S.W.3d 187, 196 (Tex. App.—Austin 2016, pet. denied). Thus, we find the sheriff's office has failed to demonstrate the applicability of section 552.108(a)(1) to the information at issue. Therefore, the sheriff's office may not withhold any of the submitted information under section 552.108 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. The Third Court of Appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at \*3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). Thus, the sheriff's office must withhold all public citizens' dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we find the sheriff's office has not demonstrated any of the remaining information at issue is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public concern. Thus, the sheriff's office may not withhold any portion of the remaining information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the sheriff's office must withhold the motor vehicle record information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.136 of the Government Code provides, “[n]otwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential.” *Id.* § 552.136(b). Section 552.136(a) defines “access device” as “a card, plate, code, account number, personal identification number, electronic serial number, mobile identification number, or other telecommunications service, equipment, or instrument identifier or means of account access that alone or in conjunction with another access device may be used to . . . obtain

money, goods, services, or another thing of value [or] initiate a transfer of funds other than a transfer originated solely by paper instrument.” *Id.* § 552.136(a). Upon review, we find the sheriff’s office has not demonstrated any portion of the remaining information consists of an access device number for purposes of section 552.136. Accordingly, the sheriff’s office may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

In summary, the sheriff’s office must withhold all public citizens’ dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The sheriff’s office must withhold the motor vehicle record information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The sheriff’s office must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Claire V. Morris Sloan  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

CVMS/pt

Ref: ID# 977041

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)