



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

October 11, 2022

Ms. Patricia M. Borschow
Assistant General Counsel
El Paso Water Utilities – Public Service Board
P.O. Box 511
El Paso, Texas 79961-0511

OR2022-31064

Dear Ms. Borschow:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the “Act”), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 978099 (EPCAD No. 12742).

The El Paso Water Utilities – Public Service Board (the “board”) received a request for a specified study. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.103 of the Government Code. In addition, you state release of the submitted information may implicate the proprietary interests of Parkhill. Accordingly, you state you notified Parkhill of the request for information and of the right to submit arguments to this office as to why the submitted information should not be released. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.305(d); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 542 (1990) (statutory predecessor to section 552.305 permits governmental body to rely on interested third party to raise and explain applicability of exception in the Act in certain circumstances). We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note an interested third party is allowed ten business days after the date of its receipt of the governmental body’s notice under section 552.305(d) to submit its reasons, if any, as to why information relating to that party should be withheld from public disclosure. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.305(d)(2)(B). As of the date of this letter, we have not received comments from Parkhill explaining why the submitted information should not be released. Therefore, we have no basis to conclude Parkhill has a protected proprietary interest in the submitted information. *See, e.g., id.* § 552.110 (requiring the provision of specific factual evidence demonstrating the applicability of the exception). Accordingly, the board may not withhold the submitted information on the basis of any proprietary interest Parkhill may have in the information.

Next, we note the submitted information is subject to section 552.022 of the Government Code. Section 552.022(a) provides, in relevant part:

(a) [T]he following categories of information are public information and not excepted from required disclosure unless made confidential under this chapter or other law:

(1) a completed report, audit, evaluation, or investigation made of, for, or by a governmental body, except as provided by Section 552.108[.]

Id. § 552.022(a)(1). The submitted information consists of a completed report that is subject to section 552.022(a)(1). The board must release the information at issue pursuant to section 552.022(a)(1) unless it is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code or expressly made confidential under the Act or other law. *See id.* Although you raise section 552.103 of the Government Code for the submitted information, this section is a discretionary exception to disclosure and does not make information confidential under the Act. *See Dallas Area Rapid Transit v. Dallas Morning News*, 4 S.W.3d 469, 475-76 (Tex. App.—Dallas 1999, no pet.) (governmental body may waive Gov’t Code § 552.103); *see also* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions). Therefore, none of the submitted information may be withheld under section 552.103. However, as section 552.101 of the Government Code can make information confidential for purposes of section 552.022, we will consider the applicability of this exception to the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information protected by other statutes. As part of the Texas Homeland Security Act, sections 418.176 through 418.182 were added to chapter 418 of the Government Code. These provisions make confidential certain information related to terrorism. Section 418.181 provides,

Those documents or portions of documents in the possession of a governmental entity are confidential if they identify the technical details of particular vulnerabilities of critical infrastructure to an act of terrorism.

Id. § 418.181. The fact that information may relate to a governmental body’s security concerns does not make the information *per se* confidential under the Texas Homeland Security Act. *See* Open Records Decision No. 649 at 3 (1996) (language of confidentiality provision controls scope of its protection). Furthermore, the mere recitation by a governmental body of a statute’s key terms is not sufficient to demonstrate the applicability of a claimed provision. As with any exception to disclosure, a governmental body asserting one of the confidentiality provisions of the Texas Homeland Security Act must adequately

explain how the responsive records fall within the scope of the claimed provision. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(e)(1)(A) (governmental body must explain how claimed exception to disclosure applies).

You state the submitted information identifies specific locations and details of the water, storm, and wastewater systems belonging to the City of El Paso (the "city"), including dams and conveyance systems. You assert, and we agree, the city's water, storm, and wastewater systems are critical infrastructure. *See generally id.* § 421.001 (defining "critical infrastructure" to include "all public or private assets, systems, and functions vital to the security, governance, public health and safety, economy, or morale of the state or the nation"). You also assert release of the information would allow criminals to exploit vulnerabilities in the city's water, storm, and wastewater systems. Based upon your representations and our review, we find the information we marked reveals the technical details of particular vulnerabilities of critical infrastructure to an act of terrorism. Thus, the board must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 418.181 of the Government Code. However, we find you have failed to demonstrate the remaining information identifies the technical details of particular vulnerabilities of critical infrastructure to an act of terrorism. Therefore, the board may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 418.181 of the Government Code. The board must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Kimbell Kesling
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

KK/jxd

Ref: ID# 978099

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

Third Party
(w/o enclosures)