



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

October 3, 2022

Mr. Trenton M. Dietz
Assistant City Attorney
City of Abilene
P.O. Box 60
Abilene, Texas 79604-0060

OR2022-30409

Dear Mr. Dietz:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 975573 (Request 22-1507).

The City of Abilene (the "city") received a request for information pertaining to three named individuals and two specified addresses during a specified time period, including information pertaining to a specified incident. You state the city will redact motor vehicle record information pursuant to section 552.130(c) of the Government Code and dates of birth pursuant to Open Records Letter No. 2019-32652 (2019).¹ You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.²

¹ Section 552.130(c) of the Government Code allows a governmental body to redact the information described in section 552.130(a) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). *See id.* § 552.130(d), (e). Open Records Letter No. 2019-32652 is a previous determination issued to the city authorizing it to withhold certain public citizens' dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy without requesting a ruling from this office.

² We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. This office has found that a compilation of an individual’s criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep’t of Justice v. Reporters Comm. For Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (finding significant privacy interest in compilation of individual’s criminal history by recognizing distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of criminal history information). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen’s criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public.

The present request, in part, seeks all information pertaining to the named individuals. Thus, this portion of the request requires the city to compile unspecified law enforcement records concerning the named individuals, thus implicating the named individuals’ right to privacy. However, we find the part of the request that seeks information pertaining to a specified incident does not implicate the named individual’s privacy interests. You have submitted information that is responsive to this part of the request. Because information pertaining to the specified incident was specifically requested it may not be withheld as part of a criminal history compilation. However, to the extent the city maintains unspecified law enforcement records depicting the named individuals as suspects, arrestees, or criminal defendants, the city must withhold any such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. We note information that refers to an individual solely as a victim, witness, or involved person is not part of a compilation of the individual’s criminal history and may not be withheld under section 552.101 on that basis. We note you have submitted information that does not list the named individuals as suspects, arrestees, or criminal defendants. This information does not constitute part of a criminal history compilation of the named individuals and may not be withheld under section 552.101 on that basis. In addition, the city has failed to demonstrate this information is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public interest. Therefore, the city may not withhold the information that does not list the named individuals as suspects, arrestees, or criminal defendants under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 411.083 of the Government Code, which pertains to criminal history record information (“CHRI”). CHRI generated by the National Crime Information Center (“NCIC”) or by the Texas Crime Information Center is confidential under federal and state law. CHRI means “information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions.” *Id.*

§ 411.082(2). Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI obtained from the NCIC network or other states. *See* 28 C.F.R. § 20.21. The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990); *see generally* Gov't Code ch. 411 subch. F. Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI the Texas Department of Public Safety ("DPS") maintains, except DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F, or subchapter E-1, of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Thus, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with Government Code chapter 411. We note, however, records relating to routine traffic violations are not considered criminal history information. *Cf. id.* § 411.082(2)(B) (criminal history record information does not include driving record information). You assert section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code for the remaining information. Upon review, we find you have failed to demonstrate any of the information at issue consists of confidential CHRI. Therefore, the city may not withhold any portion of the information at issue under section 552.101 of the Government Code on this basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses chapter 772 of the Health and Safety Code, which authorizes the development of local emergency communication districts. Section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code applies to an emergency communication district for a county with a population of more than 20,000 and makes confidential the originating telephone numbers and addresses of 9-1-1 callers that are furnished by a 9-1-1 service supplier. *See* Open Records Decision No. 649 (1996). We understand the city is part of an emergency communication district that is subject to section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code. Thus, to the extent the information at issue consists of the originating telephone numbers or addresses of 9-1-1 callers furnished by a 9-1-1 service supplier, the city must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code. To the extent the information at issue does not consist of the originating telephone numbers or addresses of 9-1-1 callers provided by a 9-1-1 service supplier, the city may not withhold any of the information at issue under section 552.101 on that ground.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by section 730.004 of the Transportation Code, which provides "an agency may not disclose personal information about any person obtained by the agency in connection with a motor vehicle record." Transp. Code § 730.004. "Personal information" means "information that identifies a person," and includes a person's photograph, social security number, date of birth, driver identification number, name, address but not the zip code, e-mail address, telephone number, and medical or disability information. Act of May 31, 2021, 87th Leg., R.S., S.B. 15, § 5 (to be codified at Transp. Code § 730.003(6)). The Texas Department of Public Safety ("DPS") is an "agency" for purposes of chapter 730. *See* Transp. Code § 730.003(1) ("agency" is state agency that compiles or maintains motor vehicle records). The city states some of the submitted information consists of records that were obtained by

the city from DPS. *See id.* § 730.007(a)(2)(A)(i) (personal information may be disclosed to government agency in carrying out its functions). An authorized recipient of personal information may not re-disclose the personal information and to do so is a misdemeanor offense. *Id.* § 730.013(a), (d). We note the requestor has a right of access to her client's information pursuant to section 730.006 of the Transportation Code. *See id.* § 730.006 (personal information obtained by agency in connection with motor vehicle record shall be disclosed to requestor who demonstrates requestor has obtained written consent of the person who is subject of the information). Upon review, we find the remaining information is not confidential under section 730.004 or 730.013 of the Transportation Code, and the city may not withhold that information under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

In summary, to the extent the city maintains unspecified law enforcement records depicting the named individuals as suspects, arrestees, or criminal defendants, the city must withhold any such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. To the extent the information at issue consists of the originating telephone numbers or addresses of 9-1-1 callers furnished by a 9-1-1 service supplier, the city must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code. The city must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Jennifer Copeland
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JC/pt

Ref: ID# 975573

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)