



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

September 20, 2022

Ms. Tiffany Bangs
Assistant County Attorney
Harris County Attorney's Office
1019 Congress Street, 15th Floor
Houston, Texas 77002-1700

OR2022-28912

Dear Ms. Bangs:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 972911 (C.A. File No. 22PIA0748).

The Harris County Constable, Precinct 4 (the "constable's office") received a request for information related to a specified incident. You indicate you have no information responsive to portions of the request.¹ You indicate you have released some information to the requestor. You claim some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state the information you have

¹ The Act does not require a governmental body that receives a request for information to create information that did not exist when the request was received. *See Econ. Opportunities Dev. Corp. v. Bustamante*, 562 S.W.2d 266 (Tex. Civ. App.—San Antonio 1978, writ dismissed); Open Records Decision Nos. 605 at 2 (1992), 563 at 8 (1990), 555 at 1-2 (1990), 452 at 3 (1986), 362 at 2 (1983).

indicated pertains to an active criminal investigation. Based on this representation, we conclude the release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the information you have indicated. Accordingly, the constable's office may withhold the information you have indicated under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.”² Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. The Third Court of Appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). However, we note the requestor has a right of access to his client's date of birth and this information may not be withheld from him under common-law privacy. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023 (person or person's authorized representative has special right of access to records that contain information relating to the person that are protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person's privacy interests); ORD 481 at 4 (privacy theories not implicated when individual requests information concerning herself). Accordingly, with the exception of the date of birth of the requestor's client, the constable's office must withhold all dates of birth within the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. We note section 552.130 protects personal privacy. Accordingly, the requestor has a right of access to his client's motor vehicle record information. *See id.* § 552.023(a); ORD 481 at 4. In this instance, the requestor may have a right of access to the motor vehicle record information at issue under section 552.023 of the Government Code. However, because we are unable to determine whether the information at issue belongs to the requestor's client, we must rule conditionally. To the extent the motor vehicle record information at issue belongs to the requestor's client, he has a right of access under section 552.023 to this information, and the constable's office may not withhold such information under section 552.130 from the requestor. To the extent the motor vehicle record information at issue does not belong to

² The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

the requestor's client, the constable's office must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the constable's office may withhold the information you have indicated under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. With the exception of the date of birth of the requestor's client, the constable's office must withhold all dates of birth within the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. To the extent the motor vehicle record information at issue does not belong to the requestor, the constable's office must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The constable's office must release the remaining information to this requestor.³

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Tim Neal
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

TN/jm

Ref: ID# 972911

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

³ As noted above, the requestor has a special right of access to some of the information being released in this instance. See Gov't Code § 552.023(a); ORD 481 at 4. Because such information is confidential with respect to the general public, if the constable's office receives another request for this information from a different requestor, the constable's office must again seek a ruling from this office.