



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

September 2, 2022

Mr. Kieran Hillis
Public Information Coordinator
Office of the Governor
P.O. Box 12428
Austin, Texas 78711

OR2022-26900

Dear Mr. Hillis:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 970165 (OOG ID# 290-22).

The Office of the Governor (the "governor's office") received a request for certain funding information pertaining to a specified program.¹ The governor's office claims the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.103 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions the governor's office claims and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the submitted information includes officers' Texas Commission on Law Enforcement ("TCOLE") identification number. Section 552.002(a) of the Government Code defines "public information" as the following:

¹ The governor's office states, and provides documentation showing, it sought and received clarification of the information requested. *See* Gov't Code § 552.222 (providing if request for information is unclear, governmental body may ask requestor to clarify request); *see also* *City of Dallas v. Abbott*, 304 S.W.3d 380, 387 (Tex. 2010) (holding that when a governmental entity, acting in good faith, requests clarification or narrowing of an unclear or overbroad request for information, the ten-day period to request an attorney general ruling is measured from the date the request is clarified or narrowed).

[I]nformation that is written, produced, collected, assembled, or maintained under a law or ordinance or in connection with the transaction of official business:

- (1) by a governmental body;
- (2) for a governmental body and the governmental body:
 - (A) owns the information;
 - (B) has a right of access to the information; or
 - (C) spends or contributes public money for the purpose of writing, producing, collecting, assembling, or maintaining the information; or
- (3) by an individual officer or employee of a governmental body in the officer's or employee's official capacity and the information pertains to official business of the governmental body.

Gov't Code § 552.002(a). In Open Records Decision No. 581 (1990), this office determined certain computer information, such as source codes, documentation information, and other computer programming, that has no significance other than its use as a tool for the maintenance, manipulation, or protection of public property is not the kind of information made public under section 552.021 of the Government Code. We understand the officers' TCOLE identification numbers are unique computer-generated numbers assigned to peace officers for identification in TCOLE's electronic database and may be used as access device numbers on the TCOLE website. Thus, we find the officers' TCOLE numbers do not constitute public information under section 552.002 of the Government Code. Therefore, the officers' TCOLE numbers are not subject to the Act and need not be released to the requestor.

Next, we note the remaining information is subject to section 552.022 of the Government Code. Section 552.022(a) provides, in relevant part:

(a) [T]he following categories of information are public information and not excepted from required disclosure unless made confidential under this chapter or other law:

...

- (3) information in an account, voucher, or contract relating to the receipt or expenditure of public or other funds by a governmental body[.]

Id. § 552.022(a)(3). The remaining information consists of information in an account, contract, or voucher relating to the receipt or expenditure of funds by the governor’s office that is subject to section 552.022(a)(3). This information must be released unless it is made confidential under the Act or other law. *See id.* The governor’s office seeks to withhold the information subject to section 552.022(a)(3) under section 552.103 of the Government Code. However, section 552.103 is discretionary in nature and does not make information confidential under the Act. *See Dallas Area Rapid Transit v. Dallas Morning News*, 4 S.W.3d 469, 475-76 (Tex. App.—Dallas 1999, no pet.) (governmental body may waive Gov’t Code § 552.103); *see also* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions). Therefore, the governor’s office may not withhold the remaining information under section 552.103 of the Government Code. However, as section 552.101 of the Government Code applies to confidential information, we will consider the governor’s office’s argument under section 552.101 for the information it marked.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses sections 418.176 and 418.177 of the Texas Homeland Security Act (the “HSA”), chapter 418 of the Government Code. Section 418.176 provides, in relevant part, as follows:

(a) Information is confidential if the information is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental entity for the purpose of preventing, detecting, responding to, or investigating an act of terrorism or related criminal activity and:

(1) relates to staffing requirements of an emergency response provider, including a law enforcement agency, a fire-fighting agency, or an emergency services agency [or]

(2) relates to a tactical plan of the provider[.]

Id. § 418.176(a)(1)-(2). Section 418.177 provides:

Information is confidential if the information:

(1) is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental entity for the purpose of preventing, detecting, or investigating an act of terrorism or related criminal activity; and

(2) relates to an assessment by or for a governmental entity, or an assessment that is maintained by a governmental entity, of the risk or vulnerability of persons or property, including critical infrastructure, to an act of terrorism or related criminal activity.

Id. § 418.177. The fact that information may generally be related to emergency preparedness does not make the information *per se* confidential under the provisions of the HSA. *See* Open Records Decision No. 649 at 3 (1996). As with any confidentiality provision, a governmental body asserting these sections must adequately explain how the responsive information falls within the scope of the provisions. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(e)(1)(A) (governmental body must explain how claimed exception to disclosure applies).

The governor's office states release of the information it marked "reveals tactical plans and capabilities of emergency response providers in relation to operations at a border of the State of Texas [(the "state")] as well as "possible vulnerabilities related to law enforcement efforts at the border, including staffing levels, capabilities, and locations of law enforcement" and "release of the information at issue could aid terrorists and other criminals in avoiding detection and in the commission of crimes against critical infrastructure related to the state's border." Based upon these representations and our review, we find the information at issue relates to staffing requirements and tactical plans of emergency response providers maintained by the governor's office for the purpose of preventing, detecting, responding to, or investigating an act of terrorism or related criminal activity. Accordingly, the governor's office must withhold the information it marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with sections 418.176 and 418.177 of the Government Code.

We note some of the remaining information is subject to section 552.130 of the Government Code.² Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See id.* § 552.130. Accordingly, the governor's office must withhold the vehicle identification numbers within the remaining information under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the officers' TCOLE numbers are not subject to the Act and need not be released to the requestor. The governor's office must withhold the information it marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with sections 418.176 and 418.177 of the Government Code. The governor's office must withhold the vehicle identification numbers within the remaining information under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The governor's office must release the remaining information pursuant to section 552.022(a)(3) of the Government Code.

² The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Gerald A. Arismendez
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

GAA/jxd

Ref: ID# 970165

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)