



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

September 1, 2022

Ms. Lauren Azopardi
Assistant City Attorney
City of Fort Worth
200 Texas Street, 3rd Floor
Fort Worth, Texas 76102

OR2022-26681

Dear Ms. Azopardi:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 969714 (PIR No. P008041-060922).

The Fort Worth Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a specified incident. You state the department will release some of the requested information. You claim some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information. We have also received and considered comments from the requestor. *See* Gov't Code § 552.304 (interested party may submit comments stating why information should or should not be released).

Initially, we note the submitted information consists of department police officers' body worn camera recordings. Body worn cameras are subject to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code. Chapter 1701 provides the procedures a requestor must follow when seeking a body worn camera recording. Section 1701.661 provides, in relevant part, the following:

(a) A member of the public is required to provide the following information when submitting a written request to a law enforcement agency for information recorded by a body worn camera:

(1) the date and approximate time of the recording;

(2) the specific location where the recording occurred; and

(3) the name of one or more persons known to be a subject of the recording.

Occ. Code § 1701.661(a). Upon review, we find the requestor does not provide the requisite information under section 1701.661(a) for one of the submitted body worn camera recordings. As the body worn camera recording at issue, which we have indicated, was not properly requested pursuant to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code, our ruling does not reach this information and it need not be released.¹ However, pursuant to section 1701.661(b), a “failure to provide all the information required by [s]ubsection (a) to be part of a request for recorded information does not preclude the requestor from making a future request for the same recorded information.” *Id.* § 1701.661(b). Further, we note the instant request includes the information required by section 1701.661(a) with respect to the remaining body worn camera recordings. *Id.* Accordingly, we find the requestor properly requested the remaining body worn camera recordings at issue.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of constitutional privacy. Constitutional privacy consists of two interrelated types of privacy: (1) the right to make certain kinds of decisions independently and (2) an individual’s interest in avoiding disclosure of personal matters. Open Records Decision No. 455 at 4 (1987). The first type protects an individual’s autonomy within “zones of privacy” which include matters related to marriage, procreation, contraception, family relationships, and child rearing and education. *Id.* The second type of constitutional privacy requires a balancing between the individual’s privacy interests and the public’s need to know information of public concern. *Id.* The scope of information protected is narrower than that under the common law doctrine of privacy; the information must concern the “most intimate aspects of human affairs.” *Id.* at 5 (quoting *Ramie v. City of Hedwig Village, Texas*, 765 F.2d 490 (5th Cir. 1985)). Because “the right of privacy is purely personal,” that right “terminates upon the death of the person whose privacy is invaded.” *Moore v. Charles B. Pierce Film Enters., Inc.*, 589 S.W.2d 489, 491 (Tex. Civ. App.— Texarkana 1979, writ ref’d n.r.e.); Open Records Decision No. 272 (1981) (“the right of privacy is personal and lapses upon death”). However, the United States Supreme Court has determined that surviving family members can have a privacy interest in information relating to their deceased relatives. *See Nat’l Archives & Records Admin. v. Favish*, 541 U.S. 157 (2004).

Thus, because the submitted photographs relate to a deceased individual, they may not be withheld from disclosure based on his privacy interests. However, you state you notified the deceased individual’s family members of the request for information and of their right to assert a privacy interest in the submitted information. We note the requestor represents the decedent’s family and we have received comments from the requestor stating the family does not object to release of the photographs in this instance. Under section 552.023 of the Government Code, “[a] person or a person’s authorized representative has a special right

¹ As we are able to make this determination, we need not address your argument against disclosure of this information.

of access, beyond the right of the general public, to information held by a governmental body that relates to the person and that is protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person's privacy interests." Gov't Code § 552.023; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individual requests information concerning herself or person for whom she is authorized representative). Accordingly, the department may not withhold any of the information at issue from the requestor under section 552.101 of the Government Code on the basis of constitutional privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country.² *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the department must withhold all visible license plates and registration stickers under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, as the body worn camera recording we have indicated was not properly requested pursuant to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code, our ruling does not reach this information and it need not be released. The department must withhold all visible license plates and registration stickers under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.³

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Jennifer Copeland
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JC/jm

² The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

³ We note the requestor has a right of access beyond that of the general public to some of the information being released. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023(a); ORD 481 at 4. Accordingly, if the department receives another request for this information from an individual other than this requestor, the department must again seek a ruling from this office.

Ref: ID# 969714

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)