



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

August 24, 2022

Mr. Dorwin L. Sargent, III
Counsel for the Town of Hickory Creek
Law Office of Dorwin L. Sargent III, PLLC
624 West University Drive, #127
Denton, Texas 76201

OR2022-25611

Dear Mr. Sargent:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 965829 (TOHC File No.20220607.01).

The Town of Hickory Creek (the "town"), which you represent, received a request for the personnel file of a named individual. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.102, 552.117, 552.1175, 552.130, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

Initially, we note the submitted information includes an officer's Texas Commission on Law Enforcement ("TCOLE") identification number. Section 552.002(a) of the Government Code defines "public information" as the following:

[I]nformation that is written, produced, collected, assembled, or maintained under a law or ordinance or in connection with the transaction of official business:

(1) by a governmental body;

¹ We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

(2) for a governmental body and the governmental body:

(A) owns the information;

(B) has a right of access to the information; or

(C) spends or contributes public money for the purpose of writing, producing, collecting, assembling, or maintaining the information; or

(3) by an individual officer or employee of a governmental body in the officer's or employee's official capacity and the information pertains to official business of the governmental body.

Gov't Code § 552.002(a). In Open Records Decision No. 581 (1990), this office determined certain computer information, such as source codes, documentation information, and other computer programming, that has no significance other than its use as a tool for the maintenance, manipulation, or protection of public property is not the kind of information made public under section 552.021 of the Government Code. We understand an officer's TCOLE identification number is a unique computer-generated number assigned to peace officers for identification in TCOLE's electronic database and may be used as an access device number on the TCOLE website. Thus, we find the officer's TCOLE number does not constitute public information under section 552.002 of the Government Code. Therefore, the officer's TCOLE number is not subject to the Act and need not be released to the requestor.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 of the Government Code encompasses former section 1701.454 of the Occupations Code, which relates to the availability of public information submitted to TCOLE. We note the submitted information includes F-5 forms that were created prior to the effective date of the amendment of section 1701.454 by the Seventy-ninth- Legislature. *See* Act of May 25, 2005, 79th Leg., R.S., ch. 1298, § 4, 2005 Tex. Gen. Laws 4094, 4096. Thus, the F-5 forms at issue are governed by the previous version of section 1701.454. *See* Act of May 25, 2005, 79th Leg., R.S., ch. 1298, § 6, 2005 Tex. Gen. Laws 4094, 4096. Former section 1701.454 provides as follows:

(a) A report or statement submitted to [TCOLE] under this subchapter is confidential and is not subject to disclosure under [the Act] unless the person resigned or was terminated due to substantiated incidents of excessive force or violations of the law other than traffic offenses.

(b) Except as provided by this subsection, a [TCOLE] member or other person may not release the contents of a report or statement submitted under this subchapter. The report or statement may be released only by the

[TCOLE] employee having the responsibility to maintain the report or statement and only if:

(1) the head of a law enforcement agency or the agency head's designee makes a written request on the agency's letterhead for the report or statement accompanied by the agency head's or designee's signature; and

(2) the person who is the subject of the report or statement authorizes the release by providing a sworn statement on a form supplied by [TCOLE] that includes the person's waiver of liability regarding an agency head who is responsible for or who takes action based on the report or statement.

Occ. Code § 1701.454 (repealed 2005). Upon review, we find the F-5 forms created prior to the effective date of the amendment of section 1701.454 are not subject to release under the provisions of former section 1701.454. This information does not reflect the officer at issue resigned or was terminated due to substantiated incidents of excessive force or violations of the law other than traffic offenses. The town must withhold the F-5 forms created prior to the effective date of the amendment under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with former section 1701.454 of the Occupations Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses former section 1701.306 of the Occupations Code, which provides:

(a) [TCOLE] may not issue a license to a person as an officer or county jailer unless the person is examined by:

(1) a licensed psychologist or by a psychiatrist who declares in writing that the person is in satisfactory psychological and emotional health to serve as the type of officer for which a license is sought; and

(2) a licensed physician who declares in writing that the person does not show any trace of drug dependency or illegal drug use after a physical examination, blood test, or other medical test.

(b) An agency hiring a person for whom a license as an officer or county jailer is sought shall select the examining physician and the examining psychologist or psychiatrist. The agency shall prepare a report of each declaration required by Subsection (a) and shall maintain a copy of the report on file in a format readily accessible to [TCOLE]. A declaration is not public information.

Act of May 17, 1999, 76th Leg., R.S., ch. 388, §1, 1999 Tex. Gen. Laws 1431, 2219 (current version at Occ. Code § 1701.306(a), (b)). The submitted L-2 and L-3 declaration forms were created prior to September 1, 2011. Although section 1701.306 of the Occupations

Code was amended in 2011 by the 82nd Legislature, L-2 and L-3 declaration forms created prior to September 1, 2011, are subject to the former version of section 1701.306, which was continued in effect for that purpose. *See* Act of May 30, 2011, 82nd Leg., R.S., ch. 1224, § 7. Upon review, the town must the L-2 and L-3 declaration forms created prior to September 1, 2011, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with former section 1701.306 of the Occupations Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses chapter 411 of the Government Code, which makes confidential criminal history record information (“CHRI”) generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center. *See* Gov’t Code § 411.083(a). Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual laws with respect to the CHRI it generates. *See id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that the Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except that DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter E-1 or subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov’t Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090-.127. Thus, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with chapter 411, subchapter E-1 or subchapter F of the Government Code. We note Federal Bureau of Investigation (“FBI”) numbers constitute CHRI generated by the FBI. Upon review, we find the information we marked consists of CHRI that is confidential under section 411.083 of the Government Code. Accordingly, the town must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code.²

Section 552.101 also encompasses information made confidential the Medical Practice Act (“MPA”), subtitle B of title 3 of the Occupations Code, which governs release of medical records. Section 159.002 of the MPA provides, in relevant part:

(b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient’s behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

² As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

Occ. Code § 159.002(b), (c). This office has concluded the protection afforded by section 159.002 extends to records created by either a physician or someone under the supervision of a physician and information obtained from those records. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 487 (1987), 370 (1983), 343 (1982). Upon review, we find none of the information at issue constitutes medical records subject to section 159.002. Accordingly, the town may not withhold any of the information at issue under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information made confidential by chapter 611 of the Health and Safety Code. Section 611.002 pertains to mental health records and provides, in pertinent part,

(a) Communications between a patient and a professional, and records of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient that are created or maintained by a professional, are confidential.

(b) Confidential communications or records may not be disclosed except as provided by Section 611.004 or 611.0045.

Health & Safety Code § 611.002(a)-(b); *see id.* § 611.001 (defining “patient” and “professional”). Section 611.001 defines a “professional” as (1) a person authorized to practice medicine, (2) a person licensed or certified by the state to diagnose, evaluate or treat mental or emotional conditions or disorders, or (3) a person the patient reasonably believes is authorized, licensed, or certified. *See id.* § 611.001(2). Upon review, we find none of the information at issue consists of mental health records that are subject to chapter 611 of the Health and Safety Code. Accordingly, the town may not withhold any portion of the information at issue on that basis.

Section 552.102(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy.” Gov’t Code § 552.102(a). The Texas Supreme Court held section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure the dates of birth of state employees in the payroll database of the Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts. *Tex. Comptroller of Pub. Accounts v. Attorney Gen. of Tex.*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). Accordingly, the town must withhold the employee’s date of birth it marked under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. This office has also found personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 600 (1992) (employee’s designation of retirement beneficiary,

choice of insurance carrier, election of optional coverages, direct deposit authorization, forms allowing employee to allocate pretax compensation to group insurance, health care or dependent care), 523 (1989) (common-law privacy protects credit reports, financial statements, and other personal financial information), 373 (1983) (sources of income not related to financial transaction between individual and governmental body protected under common-law privacy). However, the public generally has a legitimate interest in information that relates to public employment and public employees. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 542 (1990); 470 at 4 (public has legitimate interest in job qualifications and performance of public employees); 444 at 5-6 (1986) (public has legitimate interest in knowing reasons for dismissal, demotion, promotion, or resignation of public employees); 432 at 2 (1984) (scope of public employee privacy is narrow). Upon review, we find the information you marked, in addition to the information we marked, satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, the town must withhold the information it marked, in addition to the information we marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure the home address, home telephone number, emergency contact information, and social security number of a current or honorably retired peace officer, as well as information that reveals whether the current or honorably retired peace officer has family members, regardless of whether the current or honorably retired peace officer complies with sections 552.024 and 552.1175 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.117(a)(2); *id.* §552.003(1-b) (defining "honorably retired" for purposes of the Act). We note, for purposes of section 552.117, "family member" means a spouse, minor child, or adult child who resides in the person's home. *See id.* § 552.117(c). However, we note section 552.117 is not applicable to a former spouse and does not protect the fact that a governmental employee has been divorced. Section 552.117(a)(2) applies to peace officers as defined by article 2.12 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. We note section 552.117 also encompasses a personal cellular telephone number, unless the cellular service is paid for by a governmental body. *See* Open Records Decision No. 506 at 5-7 (1988) (statutory predecessor to section 552.117 not applicable to cellular telephone numbers provided and paid for by governmental body and intended for official use). Accordingly, the town must withhold the home addresses and telephone numbers and social security numbers you marked, in addition to the information we marked, under section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code; however, the cellular telephone numbers at issue may be withheld only if a governmental body does not pay for the cellular telephone services. The remaining information at issue does not consist of a home address or telephone number, social security number, emergency contact information, or family member information subject to section 552.117 of the Government Code. Thus, the town may not withhold any portion of the remaining information, which we marked for release, under section 552.117 of the Government Code.³

Section 552.1175 of the Government Code protects the home address, home telephone number, emergency contact information, date of birth, social security number, and family member information of certain individuals, when that information is held by a governmental body in a non-employment capacity and the individual elects to keep the

³ As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

information confidential. Gov't Code § 552.1175. Section 552.1175 applies, in part, to "current or honorably retired peace officers as defined by Article 2.12, Code of Criminal Procedure." *See id.* § 552.1175(a)(1); *see also id.* § 552.003(1-b) (defining "honorably retired" for purposes of the Act). Accordingly, to the extent the information at issue relates to an individual who elects to restrict access to the information in accordance with section 552.1175(b) of the Government Code, the town must withhold the information we marked under section 552.1175 of the Government Code. Conversely, if the individual whose information is at issue does not elect to restrict access to his information in accordance with 552.1175(b), the town may not withhold the information at issue under section 552.1175 of the Government Code. However, the remaining information you marked is not information subject to section 552.1175; thus, the town may not withhold the remaining information at issue on that basis

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. The town must withhold the motor vehicle record information it marked, in addition to the information we marked, under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the officer's TCOLE number is not subject to the Act and need not be released to the requestor. The town must withhold the F-5 forms created prior to the effective date of the amendment under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with former section 1701.454 of the Occupations Code. The town must the L-2 and L-3 declaration forms created prior to September 1, 2011, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with former section 1701.306 of the Occupations Code. The town must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code. The town must withhold the employee's date of birth it marked under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code. The town must withhold the information it marked, in addition to the information we marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The town must withhold the home addresses and telephone numbers and social security numbers you marked, in addition to the information we marked, under section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code. To the extent the information at issue relates to an individual who elects to restrict access to the information in accordance with section 552.1175(b) of the Government Code, the town must withhold the information we marked under section 552.1175 of the Government Code. The town must withhold the motor vehicle record information it marked, in addition to the information we marked, under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and

responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Cesar Mata
Attorney
Open Records Division

CM/jm

Ref: ID# 965829

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)