



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

August 1, 2022

Mr. Jay Dale
City Attorney
City of Pasadena
P. O. Box 672
Pasadena, Texas 77501-0672

OR2022-22476

Dear Mr. Dale:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 962840 (PIR SL2277).

The Pasadena Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a specified incident involving a named individual. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Generally, only highly intimate information that implicates the privacy of an individual is withheld. However, in certain instances, an entire report must be withheld to protect the individual's privacy.

In this instance, you seek to withhold the entirety of the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However,

upon review, we find you have not demonstrated, nor does it otherwise appear, this is a situation in which the entirety of the information at issue must be withheld to protect an individual's privacy. Therefore, the department may not withhold the entirety of the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information made confidential by other statutes. Some of the submitted information consists of footage from a department officer's body worn camera. Body worn cameras are subject to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code. Section 1701.661(a) of the Occupations Code states the information a requestor must provide when seeking a body worn camera recording. *See* Occ. Code § 1701.661(a). We note the requestor provides the requisite information for the submitted body worn camera recording. However, section 1701.661(f) provides,

A law enforcement agency may not release any portion of a recording made in a private space, or of a recording involving the investigation of conduct that constitutes a misdemeanor punishable by fine only and does not result in arrest, without written authorization from the person who is the subject of that portion of the recording or, if the person is deceased, from the person's authorized representative.

Id. § 1701.661(f). Upon review, we find portions of the submitted body worn camera recording, which we have indicated, were made in a private space. *See* Occ. Code § 1701.651(3) (defining "private space" for purposes of section 1701.661(f) as "a location in which a person has a reasonable expectation of privacy, including a person's home."). We have no indication the department has received written authorizations for release from all of the subjects of these portions of the recording. *See id.* § 1701.661(f). Accordingly, the department must withhold the information we have indicated under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.661(f) of the Occupations Code.¹ Upon review, however, we find you have failed to demonstrate the remaining information is confidential under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.661(f) of the Occupations Code, and the department may not withhold it on this basis.

As noted above, section 552.101 of the Government Code encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which is subject to the two-part test discussed above. *Indus. Found.*, 540 S.W.2d at 685. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). This office also has found personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 523 (1989) (common-law privacy protects credit reports, financial statements, and other personal financial information), 373 (1983) (sources of income not related to financial transaction between individual and governmental body protected under common-law privacy). Further, the Third Court of Appeals has concluded public

¹ As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address the remaining argument against disclosure of the submitted information.

citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.).

Upon review, we find some of the information at issue satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, the department must withhold the information we have marked and indicated under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we find you have failed to demonstrate the remaining information at issue is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public concern. Therefore, the department may not withhold any portion of the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release.² *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked and all visible license plates and registration stickers in the remaining information under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must withhold the information we have indicated under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.661(f) of the Occupations Code. The department must withhold the information we have marked and indicated under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked and all visible license plates and registration stickers in the remaining information under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable

² The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Erin Groff
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

EMG/jm

Ref: ID# 962840

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)