



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

July 25, 2022

Mr. Enoch Basnett  
Assistant District Attorney  
Cherokee County  
P.O. Box 450  
Rusk, Texas 75785

OR2022-21811

Dear Mr. Basnett:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 959155.

The Cherokee County District Attorney's Office (the "district attorney's office") received a request for information pertaining to a specified incident involving the requestor's step-daughter.<sup>1</sup> You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.108 and 552.1085 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we must address the procedural obligations of the district attorney's office under section 552.301 of the Government Code, which prescribes the procedures that a governmental body must follow in asking this office to decide whether requested information is excepted from public disclosure. Pursuant to section 552.301(e), a governmental body must submit to this office within fifteen business days of receiving a request for information a copy of the written request for information. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(e)(1)(B). The district attorney's office informs us it received the request for information on April 29, 2022. However, as of the date of this ruling, the district attorney's office has not submitted to this office a copy of the request. Therefore, the district attorney's office failed to comply with section 552.301(e).

---

<sup>1</sup> As the district attorney's office has not submitted a copy of the request for information, we take our description from its brief.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption that the requested information is public and must be released unless there is a compelling reason to withhold the information from disclosure. *See id.* § 552.302; *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ). Because sections 552.101, 552.1085, and 552.130 of the Government Code can provide compelling reasons to overcome the presumption of openness, we will address the applicability of these sections to the information at issue.<sup>2</sup> However, we find the district attorney's office has failed to establish a compelling reason to address section 552.108 of the Government Code.

Next, we note some of the requested information consists of officers' body worn camera recordings. Body worn cameras are subject to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code. Chapter 1701 provides the procedures a requestor must follow when seeking a body worn camera recording. Section 1701.661(a) provides:

A member of the public is required to provide the following information when submitting a written request to a law enforcement agency for information recorded by a body worn camera:

- (1) the date and approximate time of the recording;
- (2) the specific location where the recording occurred; and
- (3) the name of one or more persons known to be a subject of the recording.

Occ. Code § 1701.661(a). In this instance, the requestor does not give the requisite information under section 1701.661(a). As the requestor did not properly request the body worn camera recordings at issue pursuant to chapter 1701, our ruling does not reach this information and it need not be released.<sup>3</sup> However, pursuant to section 1701.661(b), a "failure to provide all the information required by Subsection (a) to be part of a request for recorded information does not preclude the requestor from making a future request for the same recorded information." *Id.* § 1701.661(b).

Section 552.1085(c) of the Government Code provides the following:

- (c) A sensitive crime scene image in the custody of a governmental body is confidential and excepted from the requirements of Section 552.021 and a governmental body may not permit a person to view or copy the image except as provided by this section. This section applies to any sensitive

---

<sup>2</sup> The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 at 2 (1987), 480 at 5 (1987).

<sup>3</sup> As we are able to make this determination, we need not address the remaining argument against disclosure of this information.

crime scene image regardless of the date that the image was taken or recorded.

Gov't Code § 552.1085(c). For purposes of section 552.1085, "sensitive crime scene image" means "a photograph or video recording taken at a crime scene, contained in or part of a closed criminal case, that depicts a deceased person in a state of dismemberment, decapitation, or similar mutilation or that depicts the deceased person's genitalia." *See id.* § 552.1085(a)(6). Upon review, we find the district attorney's office has not established section 552.1085 is applicable to the information at issue. Therefore, the district attorney's office may not withhold any of the information at issue on that ground.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." *Id.* § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in the *Industrial Foundation* decision. *Id.* at 683. The Third Court of Appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at \*3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). Nevertheless, because "the right of privacy is purely personal[.]" that right "terminates upon the death of the person whose privacy is invaded[.]" *Moore v. Charles B. Pierce Film Enters., Inc.*, 589 S.W.2d 489, 491 (Tex. Civ. App.—Texarkana 1979, writ ref'd n.r.e.); *see also Justice v. Belo Broad. Corp.*, 472 F. Supp. 145, 147 (N.D. Tex. 1979) ("action for invasion of privacy can be maintained only by a living individual whose privacy is invaded" (quoting Restatement (Second) of Torts § 6521 (1977))); Attorney General Opinions JM-229 (1984) ("the right of privacy lapses upon death"), H-917 (1976) ("We are . . . of the opinion that the Texas courts would follow the almost uniform rule of other jurisdictions that the right of privacy lapses upon death."); Open Records Decision No. 272 (1981) ("the right of privacy is personal and lapses upon death"). Accordingly, the district attorney's office must withhold the dates of birth of all living individuals in the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country. *See Gov't Code § 552.130.* Section 552.130 protects personal privacy. Thus, the requestor has a right of access to his motor vehicle record information pursuant to section 552.023 of the Government Code and it may not be withheld from under section 552.130. In addition, as discussed above, the right of privacy is a personal right that lapses at death. *See Moore*, 589 S.W.2d at 491; Attorney General Opinions JM-229, H-917; ORD 272. Thus, with the exception of the driver's license information pertaining to the deceased as well as the motor vehicle record information pertaining to the requestor, the district

attorney's office must withhold the information we indicated under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, as the requestor did not properly request the body worn camera recordings at issue pursuant to chapter 1701, our ruling does not reach this information and it need not be released. The district attorney's office must withhold the dates of birth of all living individuals in the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. With the exception of the driver's license information pertaining to the deceased as well as the motor vehicle record information pertaining to the requestor, the district attorney's office must withhold the information we indicated under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The district attorney's office must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Chase D. Young  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

CDY/be

Ref: ID# 959155

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)