



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

July 14, 2022

Mr. Tom Needham
Executive Assistant Criminal District Attorney
McLennan County
219 North 6th Street, Suite 200
Waco, Texas 76701

OR2022-20300

Dear Mr. Needham:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 957279.

The McLennan County Criminal District Attorney's Office (the "district attorney's office") received a request for information pertaining to the requestor and specified incidents. The district attorney's office claims some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.130, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the claimed exceptions and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides, in relevant part, as follows:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act], and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

- (1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and
- (2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

...

(k) Notwithstanding Subsection (a), an investigating agency, other than the [Texas Department of Family and Protective Services] or the Texas Juvenile Justice Department, on request, shall provide to the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child who is the subject of reported abuse or neglect, or to the child if the child is at least 18 years of age, information concerning the reported abuse or neglect that would otherwise be confidential under this section. The investigating agency shall withhold information under this subsection if the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of the child requesting the information is alleged to have committed the abuse or neglect.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a), (k). Upon review, we find Exhibit 3 was used or developed in an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect under chapter 261 of the Family Code. *See id.* §§ 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of section 261.201), 261.001(1), (4) (defining “abuse” and “neglect” for purposes of section 261.201). Thus, this information is within the scope of section 261.201(a). Although the requestor is a parent of the child victim, the requestor was suspected of committing the alleged or suspected abuse or neglect. Therefore, we determine the requestor does not have a right of access to this information under section 261.201(k). *See id.* § 261.201(k). Accordingly, we conclude the district attorney’s office must withhold Exhibit 3 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code.¹ *See* Open Records Decision No. 440 at 2 (1986) (predecessor statute).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses chapter 411 of the Government Code, which pertains to criminal history record information (“CHRI”) generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center. Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. *Id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code makes CHRI the Texas Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains confidential, except DPS may disseminate this information as provided in subchapters E-1 and F of chapter 411 of the Government Code. *See* Gov’t Code § 411.083(a). Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for criminal justice purposes. *See id.* § 411.083(b)(1), .089. The submitted information contains a Federal Bureau of Investigation (“FBI”) number that constitutes CHRI generated by the FBI. Therefore, the district attorney’s office must withhold the submitted FBI number under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code.

¹ As our ruling is dispositive, we do not address the other arguments of the district attorney’s office to withhold this information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in the *Industrial Foundation* decision. *Id.* at 683. The Third Court of Appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). The requestor has a right of access to her own date of birth pursuant to section 552.023 of the Government Code. *See Gov't Code* § 552.023(a) (“[a] person or a person’s authorized representative has a special right of access, beyond the right of the general public, to information held by a governmental body that relates to the person and that is protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person’s privacy interests”); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individuals request information concerning themselves). Nevertheless, the district attorney’s office must withhold the submitted dates of birth that do not pertain to the requestor under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator’s license, driver’s license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See Gov’t Code* § 552.130. Because section 552.130 protects personal privacy, the requestor has a right of access to her own motor vehicle record information pursuant to section 552.023 of the Government Code. *See id.* § 552.023(a); ORD 481 at 4. However, the district attorney’s office must withhold the submitted driver’s license numbers and issuing state that do not pertain to the requestor under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

The remaining information includes e-mail addresses of members of the public. Section 552.137 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body” unless the member of the public consents to its release or the e-mail address is of a type specifically excluded by subsection (c).² *See Gov’t Code* § 552.137(a)-(c). We note the requestor has a right of access to her own e-mail address pursuant to section 552.137(b) of the Government Code. *See Gov’t Code* § 552.137(b). However, the remaining e-mail addresses at issue do not appear to be of a type specifically excluded by section 552.137(c). The district attorney’s office does not inform us a member of the public has affirmatively consented to the release of any e-mail address contained in the submitted materials. Therefore, the district attorney’s office must withhold the submitted e-mail addresses that do not pertain to the requestor under section 552.137 of the Government Code.

² The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 at 2 (1987), 480 at 5 (1987).

Section 552.147(a) of the Government Code provides “[t]he social security number of a living person is excepted from” required public disclosure under the Act. Gov’t Code § 552.147(a). Because section 552.147 protects personal privacy, the requestor has a right of access to her own social security numbers pursuant to section 552.023 of the Government Code. *See id.* § 552.023(a); ORD 481 at 4. However, the district attorney’s office may withhold the submitted social security numbers that do not pertain to the requestor under section 552.147 of the Government Code.

In summary, the district attorney’s office must withhold the following: (1) Exhibit 3 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code; (2) the submitted FBI number under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code; (3) the submitted dates of birth that do not pertain to the requestor under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy; (4) the submitted driver’s license numbers and issuing state that do not pertain to the requestor under section 552.130 of the Government Code; and (5) the submitted e-mail addresses that do not pertain to the requestor under section 552.137 of the Government Code. The district attorney’s office may withhold the submitted social security numbers that do not pertain to the requestor under section 552.147 of the Government Code. The district attorney’s office must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

James L. Coggeshall
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JLC/jxd

Ref: ID# 957279

c: Requestor