



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

June 22, 2022

Mr. Jason Miller
Assistant City Attorney
City of Mesquite
P.O. Box 850137
Mesquite, Texas 75185-0137

OR2022-17807

Dear Mr. Miller:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 954646.

The Mesquite Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a specified incident. You claim portions of the submitted information are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.130, and 552.136 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

You state the department will redact public citizens' dates of birth pursuant to Open Records Letter No. 2015-24970 (2015).¹ Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has found personal

¹ Open Records Letter No. 2015-24970 authorizes the department to withhold public citizens' dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy without requesting a ruling from this office. See Open Records Decision No. 673 at 7-8 (2001) (listing elements of second type of previous determination under section 552.301(a) of the Government Code).

financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is excepted from required public disclosure under common-law privacy. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 523 (1989) (common-law privacy protects credit reports, financial statements, and other personal financial information), 373 (1983) (sources of income not related to financial transaction between individual and governmental body protected under common-law privacy). The Third Court of Appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). Upon review, we find some of the submitted information satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in the *Industrial Foundation*. However, the requestor has a right of access to some of the otherwise private information as the authorized representative of one of the individuals at issue. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023(a) (“a person or person’s authorized representative has a special right of access, beyond the right of the general public, to information held by a governmental body that relates to a person and that is protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person’s privacy interests”); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individual requests information concerning herself). The department may not withhold the private information pertaining to the requestor’s client under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the information we indicated not belonging to the requestor’s client under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure information relating to a motor vehicle operator’s or driver’s license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.130. We note section 552.130 is designed to protect the privacy of individuals. Thus, the requestor has a right of access to his client’s motor vehicle record information, and it may not be withheld from her under section 552.130. *See id.* § 552.023 (person or person’s authorized representative has special right of access to records that contain information relating to the person that are protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person’s privacy interests); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individual requests information concerning himself). Accordingly, with the exception of the motor vehicle record information pertaining to the requestor’s client, the department must withhold all visible and audible license plate numbers, registration stickers, driver’s license information, and personal identification issued from another country under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.136 of the Government Code provides, “[n]otwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a government body is confidential.” Gov’t Code § 552.136(b); *see id.* § 552.136(a) (defining “access device”). This office has determined an insurance policy number is an access device number for purposes of this exception. *See* Open Records Decision No. 684 at 9 (2009). We note section 552.136 is designed to protect the privacy of individuals. Thus, the requestor has a right of access to his client’s insurance policy number and such information may not be withheld from him under section 552.136. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.023; Open Records Decision 481 at 4. Accordingly, with the

exception of the information pertaining to the requestor's client, the department must withhold the remaining insurance policy numbers under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must withhold the information we indicated not belonging to the requestor's client under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. With the exception of the motor vehicle record information pertaining to the requestor's client, the department must withhold all visible and audible license plate numbers, registration stickers, driver's license information, and personal identification issued from another country under section 552.130 of the Government Code. With the exception of the information pertaining to the requestor's client, the department must withhold the remaining insurance policy numbers under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.²

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Cesar Mata
Attorney
Open Records Division

CM/jxd

Ref: ID# 954646

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

² We note the requestor has a right of access to some of the information being released. See Gov't Code § 552.023(a); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987). Thus, if the department receives another request for the same information from a different requestor, the department must again seek a decision from this office.