



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

June 16, 2022

Ms. Evette P. Ugues  
Assistant County Attorney  
El Paso County Attorney's Office  
500 East San Antonio  
Room 503, County Courthouse  
El Paso, Texas 79901

OR2022-17366

Dear Ms. Ugues:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 952319 (OP-22-0308).

El Paso County (the "county") received a request for information pertaining to certain grievances involving named individuals.<sup>1</sup> You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.103, 552.107, and 552.111 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, you inform us some of the submitted information is not responsive to the instant request for information. This ruling does not address the public availability of the non-responsive information, which you marked, and the county need not release it in response to this request.

Next, we note some of the responsive information is subject to section 552.022 of the Government Code. Section 552.022(a) provides, in relevant part, as follows:

---

<sup>1</sup> The county states it sought and received clarification of the information requested. See Gov't Code § 552.222 (providing if request for information is unclear, governmental body may ask requestor to clarify request); see also *City of Dallas v. Abbott*, 304 S.W.3d 380, 387 (Tex. 2010) (holding that when a governmental entity, acting in good faith, requests clarification or narrowing of an unclear or overbroad request for information, the ten-day period to request an attorney general ruling is measured from the date the request is clarified or narrowed).

(a) [T]he following categories of information are public information and not excepted from required disclosure unless made confidential under this chapter or other law:

(1) a completed report, audit, evaluation, or investigation made of, for, or by a governmental body, except as provided by Section 552.108[.]

Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(1). Exhibit E consists of a completed report subject to section 552.022(a)(1) that must be released unless it is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code or expressly made confidential under the Act or other law. *See id.* Although you assert the information at issue is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.103, 552.107, and 552.111 of the Government Code, these sections are discretionary and do not make information confidential under the Act. *See Dallas Area Rapid Transit v. Dallas Morning News*, 4 S.W.3d 469, 475-76 (Tex. App.— Dallas 1999, no pet.) (governmental body may waive Gov't Code § 552.103); *see also* Open Records Decision Nos. 676 at 10-11 (attorney-client privilege under Gov't Code § 552.107(1) may be waived), 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions), 470 at 7 (1987) (statutory predecessor to section 552.111 subject to waiver). Therefore, none of the information at issue may be withheld under sections 552,103, 552.107 or 552.111. However, the Texas Supreme Court has held the Texas Rules of Evidence are “other law” that make information expressly confidential for the purposes of section 552.022. *In re City of Georgetown*, 53 S.W.3d 328, 336 (Tex. 2001). Thus, we will consider your assertion of the attorney-client privilege under Texas Rule of Evidence 503 for Exhibit E. Additionally, we will consider your arguments for the information not subject to section 552.022.

Texas Rule of Evidence 503 enacts the attorney-client privilege. Rule 503(b)(1) provides:

A client has a privilege to refuse to disclose and to prevent any other person from disclosing confidential communications made to facilitate the rendition of professional legal services to the client:

(A) between the client or the client's representative and the client's lawyer or the lawyer's representative;

(B) between the client's lawyer and the lawyer's representative;

(C) by the client, the client's representative, the client's lawyer, or the lawyer's representative to a lawyer representing another party in a pending action or that lawyer's representative, if the communications concern a matter of common interest in the pending action;

(D) between the client's representatives or between the client and the client's representative; or

(E) among lawyers and their representatives representing the same client.

TEX. R. EVID. 503(b)(1). A communication is “confidential” if is not intended to be disclosed to third persons other than those to whom disclosure is made in furtherance of the rendition of professional legal services to the client or those reasonably necessary for the transmission of the communication. *Id.* 503(a)(5).

Thus, in order to withhold attorney-client privileged information from disclosure under rule 503, a governmental body must (1) show the document is a communication transmitted between privileged parties or reveals a confidential communication; (2) identify the parties involved in the communication; and (3) show the communication is confidential by explaining it was not intended to be disclosed to third persons and it was made in furtherance of the rendition of professional legal services to the client. *See* ORD 676. Upon a demonstration of all three factors, the information is privileged and confidential under rule 503, provided the client has not waived the privilege or the document does not fall within the purview of the exceptions to the privilege enumerated in rule 503(d). *See Huie v. DeShazo*, 922 S.W.2d 920, 923 (Tex. 1996) (privilege extends to entire communication, including facts contained therein); *In re Valero Energy Corp.*, 973 S.W.2d 453, 457 (Tex. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1988, orig. proceeding) (privilege attaches to complete communication, including factual information).

You state Exhibit E consists of a privileged communication between an attorney for the county and county employees and officials. You state the information was communicated in furtherance of the rendition of professional legal services to the county. Further, you state the information at issue was intended to be and has remained confidential. Based upon your representations and our review, we find you have demonstrated the applicability of the attorney-client privilege to the information at issue. *Cf. Harlandale Indep. Sch. Dist. v. Cornyn*, 25 S.W.3d 328 (Tex. App.—Austin 2000, pet. denied) (concluding attorney’s entire investigative report was protected by attorney-client privilege where attorney was retained to conduct investigation in her capacity as attorney for purpose of providing legal services and advice). Accordingly, the county may withhold Exhibit E under rule 503 of the Texas Rules of Evidence.

You claim section 552.107 of the Government Code for the remaining responsive information. Section 552.107(1) protects information that comes within the attorney-client privilege. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.107(1). The elements of the privilege under section 552.107 are the same as those for rule 503. When asserting the attorney-client privilege, a governmental body has the burden of providing the necessary facts to demonstrate the elements of the privilege in order to withhold the information at issue. *See* ORD 676 at 6-7. Section 552.107(1) generally excepts an entire communication that is demonstrated to be protected by the attorney-client privilege. *See Huie*, 922 S.W.2d at 923.

You state the remaining responsive information consists of communications between attorneys for the county and county employees. You state the communications were made for the purpose of facilitating the rendition of professional legal services to the county. You further state the communications were intended to be and have remained confidential.

Based upon your representations and our review, we find the information at issue consists of privileged attorney-client communications. Accordingly, the county may withhold the remaining responsive information under section 552.107(1) of the Government Code.<sup>2</sup>

In summary, the county may withhold Exhibit E under rule 503 of the Texas Rules of Evidence. The county may withhold the remaining responsive information under section 552.107(1) of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

D. Michelle Case  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

DMH/jm

Ref: ID# 952319

c: Requestor

---

<sup>2</sup> As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address the remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.