



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

June 14, 2022

Ms. Heather Silver
Assistant City Attorney
City of Dallas
1500 Marilla Street
Dallas, Texas 75201

OR2022-17176

Dear Ms. Silver:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 953750 (ORR# D023615).

The Dallas Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a specified accident. The department claims some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.108 and 552.130 of the Government Code.¹ We have considered the claimed exceptions and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.²

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information subject to chapter 550

¹ The department acknowledges, and we agree, it did not comply with the requirements of section 552.301 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(b), (e). Nevertheless, sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code and third-party interests can provide compelling reasons to overcome the presumption of openness caused by a failure to comply with section 552.301. The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 at 2 (1987), 480 at 5 (1987). Thus, we will consider whether the submitted information must be withheld on those grounds.

² We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

of the Transportation Code. Section 550.065 applies only to a written report of an accident required under section 550.061, 550.062, or 601.004. Transp. Code § 550.065(a)(1). Chapter 550 requires the creation of a written report when the accident resulted in injury to or the death of a person or damage to the property of any person to the apparent extent of \$1,000 or more. *Id.* §§ 550.061 (operator's accident report), .062 (officer's accident report). An accident report is privileged and for the confidential use of the Texas Department of Transportation or a local governmental agency of Texas that has use for the information for accident prevention purposes. *Id.* § 550.065(b). However, a governmental entity shall release an accident report in accordance with subsections (c) and (c-1). *Id.* § 550.065(c), (c-1). Section 550.065(c) provides a governmental entity shall release an accident report to a person or entity listed under this subsection. *Id.* § 550.065(c).

The submitted information contains a CR-3 accident report that is subject to chapter 550 of the Transportation Code. We are unable to determine whether the requestor is a person listed under section 550.065(c). Thus, we must rule conditionally. Although the department asserts section 552.108 to withhold the information, a statutory right of access prevails over the Act's general exceptions to public disclosure. *See, e.g.,* Open Records Decision Nos. 613 at 4 (1993) (exceptions in Act cannot impinge on statutory right of access to information), 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exception to disclosure under the Act). Because section 552.108 is a general exception under the Act, statutory access under section 550.065(c) prevails and the department may not withhold the information under section 552.108 of the Government Code. Accordingly, if the requestor is a person listed under section 550.065(c) of the Transportation Code, then the department must release the CR-3 accident report pursuant to section 550.065(b) of the Transportation Code. If the requestor is not a person listed under section 550.065(c), then the department must withhold the report under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 550.065(b) of the Transportation Code. Nevertheless, section 550.065(c-1) requires the department to create a redacted accident report that may be requested by any person. *Id.* § 550.065(c-1). The redacted accident report may not include the information listed in subsection (f)(2). *Id.* Therefore, if the requestor is not a person listed under section 550.065(c), then the department must release the redacted accident report pursuant to section 550.065(c-1) of the Transportation Code.

We note the remaining information contains a court-filed document that is subject to section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code, which provides the following:

Without limiting the amount or kind of information that is public information under this chapter, the following categories of information are public information and not excepted from required disclosure unless made confidential under this chapter or other law:

...

(17) information that is also contained in a public court record[.]

Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(17). Section 552.108 is discretionary and does not make information confidential under the Act. *See* Open Records Decision No. 177 (1977)

(governmental body may waive statutory predecessor to section 552.108); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally). Therefore, the department may not withhold the information subject to section 552.022(a)(17), which we have marked, under section 552.108. However, section 552.130 of the Government Code makes information confidential under the Act. Accordingly, we will consider the applicability of section 552.130 to the information at issue.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. The department must withhold the information it has marked in the court-filed document under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.108(a) of the Government Code exempts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the information at issue would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706, 710 (Tex. 1977). The department has submitted correspondence from the Dallas County District Attorney's Office (the “district attorney's office”) objecting to the release of the remaining information that the department has marked under section 552.108(a)(1) because it relates to a pending criminal investigation or prosecution. Based on this representation, we conclude the release of this information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177, 186-87 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (delineating law enforcement interests present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, the department may withhold the remaining information it has marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code on behalf of the district attorney's office.³

In summary, if the requestor is a person listed under section 550.065(c) of the Transportation Code, then the department must release the CR-3 accident report pursuant to section 550.065(b) of the Transportation Code. If the requestor is not a person listed under section 550.065(c), then the department must withhold the submitted accident report under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 550.065(b) of the Transportation Code, but release the redacted accident report pursuant to section 550.065(c-1) of the Transportation Code. With the exception of the information that the department has marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code, which the department must withhold, the department must release the information we have marked under section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code. The department may withhold the remaining information it has marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code

³ As we are able to make this determination, we do not address the department's arguments to withhold this information or the applicability of section 1701.661(a) of the Occupations Code to the submitted video recording. *See generally* Occ. Code § 1701.661(a), (e).

on behalf of the district attorney's office. The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

James L. Coggeshall
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JLC/mo

Ref: ID# 953750

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)