



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

June 10, 2022

Ms. Stephanie Hernandez
Administrative Support Specialist
City of Carrollton
P.O. Box 110535
Carrollton, Texas 75011-0535

OR2022-16795

Dear Ms. Hernandez:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 953178 (City ID Nos. T003302 and T003375).

The City of Carrollton (the "city") received two requests from different requestors for a specified incident report. You claim portions of the submitted information are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.137 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the doctrine of the common-law privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. The Third Court of Appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). However, we note the second requestor has a right of access to her own date of birth and it may not be withheld from her under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. *See Gov't Code § 552.023(a)* (person or person's authorized representative has special right of access to records that contain information relating to the person that are protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person's privacy interests); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy

theories not implicated when individuals request information concerning themselves). Nevertheless, the city must withhold the public citizen's date of birth you have marked from the first requestor under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.¹

Section 552.137 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body" unless the member of the public consents to its release or the e-mail address is of a type specifically excluded by subsection (c). *See Gov't Code* § 552.137(a)-(c). We note the second requestor has a right of access to her own e-mail address pursuant to section 552.137(b) of the Government Code. *See id.* § 552.137(b). The e-mail address at issue is not excluded by subsection (c). Therefore, the city must withhold the personal e-mail address you have marked from the first requestor under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owner affirmatively consents to its public disclosure.²

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" *Gov't Code* § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state the remaining information you have marked pertains to a pending criminal investigation or prosecution. Based upon this representation, we conclude the release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the information at issue. Therefore, the city may withhold the remaining information you have marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

In summary, the city: (1) must withhold the public citizen's date of birth you have marked from the first requestor under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy; (2) must withhold the personal e-mail address you have marked from the first requestor under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owner affirmatively consents to its public disclosure; (3) may withhold the remaining information you have marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code; and (4) must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

¹ As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure of this information.

² As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure of this information.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Tim Neal
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

TN/jm

Ref: ID# 953178

Enc. Submitted documents

c: 2 Requestors
(w/o enclosures)