



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

June 8, 2022

Ms. Jacqueline Villarreal
Assistant District Attorney
Hidalgo County
100 East Cano Street
Edinburg, Texas 78539

OR2022-16476

Dear Ms. Villarreal:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 952718 (File No. 2022-0046-DA.SO).

The Hidalgo County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff's office") received a request for (1) certain information pertaining to a specified dash camera; (2) certain information pertaining to body worn cameras of the sheriff's office; (3) certain information pertaining to specified incidents; and (4) certain information pertaining to specified courses. You state you will release some information to the requestor. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.1315, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information protected by section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides, in relevant part, as follows:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act], and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

¹ We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. See Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). Upon review, we find Exhibit B was used or developed in an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect conducted by the sheriff's office. *See id.* §§ 101.003(a) (defining "child" for purposes of this section as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes), 261.001(1), (4) (defining "abuse" and "neglect" for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code). Accordingly, we find this information is subject to chapter 261 of the Family Code. The sheriff's office does not indicate it has adopted a rule that governs the release of this type of information and therefore, we assume no such regulation exists. Given that assumption, we conclude the sheriff's office must withhold Exhibit B under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code.² *See* Open Records Decision No. 440 at 2 (1986) (predecessor statute).

Section 552.108(b)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure the internal records and notations of law enforcement agencies and prosecutors when their release would interfere with law enforcement and crime prevention. Gov't Code § 552.108(b)(1); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 531 at 2 (1989) (quoting *Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(b)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.108(b)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706. Section 552.108(b)(1) is intended to protect "information which, if released, would permit private citizens to anticipate weaknesses in a police department, avoid detection, jeopardize officer safety, and generally undermine police efforts to effectuate the laws of this State. *See City of Fort Worth v. Cornyn*, 86 S.W.3d 320, 327 (Tex. App.—Austin 2002, no pet.). This office has concluded section 552.108(b)(1) excepts from public disclosure information relating to the security or operation of a law enforcement agency. *See, e.g.,* Open Records Decision Nos. 531 (release of detailed use of force guidelines would unduly interfere with law enforcement), 252 (1980) (section 552.108 of the Government Code is designed to protect investigative techniques and procedures used in law enforcement), 143 (1976) (disclosure of specific operations or specialized equipment directly related to investigation or detection of crime may be excepted). Section 552.108(b)(1) is not applicable, however, to generally known policies and procedures. *See, e.g.,* ORDs 531 at 2-3 (Penal Code provisions, common-law rules, and constitutional limitations on use of force not protected), 252 at 3 (governmental body failed to indicate why investigative procedures and techniques requested were any different from those commonly known).

² As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address the remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

The sheriff's office states Exhibit F, if released, would interfere with law enforcement or prosecution of crime. The sheriff's office argues release of the information at issue "would impair, frustrate, and interfere with the [ability of the sheriff's office] to effectively detect [and] investigate potential or future crime[.]" The sheriff's office further argues release of the information at issue would provide suspects and criminals with the knowledge of how to activate and deactivate body worn cameras and thus, suspects and criminals "would be able to undermine police efforts, possibly avoid arrest, and thwart the officer's ability to intervene safely." Based upon these representations and our review, we agree the release of some of the information at issue would interfere with law enforcement. Accordingly, the sheriff's office may withhold the information we marked under section 552.108(b)(1) of the Government Code.³ However, we find you have failed to demonstrate the release of any remaining portion of Exhibit F would interfere with law enforcement or crime prevention. Therefore, the sheriff's office may not withhold any remaining portion of Exhibit F under section 552.108(b)(1) of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by chapter 418 of the Government Code. As part of the Texas Homeland Security Act (the "HSA"), sections 418.176 through 418.182 were added to chapter 418 of the Government Code. These provisions make confidential certain information related to terrorism. Section 418.181 of the Government Code provides the following:

Those documents or portions of documents in the possession of a governmental entity are confidential if they identify the technical details of particular vulnerabilities of critical infrastructure to an act of terrorism.

Gov't Code § 418.181; *see also id.* § 421.001(2) (defining "critical infrastructure" to include all public or private assets, systems, and functions vital to security, governance, public health and safety, economy, or morale of state or nation). The fact that information may relate to a governmental body's security concerns does not make the information *per se* confidential under the HSA. *See* Open Records Decision No. 649 at 3 (1996) (language of confidentiality provision controls scope of its protection). Furthermore, the mere recitation by a governmental body of a statute's key terms is not sufficient to demonstrate the applicability of a claimed provision. As with any exception to disclosure, a governmental body asserting one of the confidentiality provisions of the HSA must adequately explain how the responsive records falls within the scope of the claimed provision. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(e)(1)(A) (governmental body must explain how claimed exception to disclosure applies).

Although you assert the remaining portions of Exhibit F are confidential under section 418.181, we find you have failed to demonstrate the information at issue identifies the technical details of particular vulnerabilities of critical infrastructure to an act of terrorism. *See id.* § 421.001(2). Consequently, the information at issue is not confidential under section 418.181 of the Government Code. Therefore, the sheriff's office may not withhold any remaining portion of Exhibit F under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 418.181 of the Government Code.

³ As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address the remaining argument against disclosure of this information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by chapter 411 of the Government Code, which makes confidential criminal history record information (“CHRI”) generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center. *See id.* § 411.083(a). Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual laws with respect to the CHRI it generates. *See id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that the Texas Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except DPS may disseminate this information as provided by chapter 411, subchapter F, or subchapter E-1 of the Government Code. *See Gov’t Code* § 411.083(a). Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090-.127. Thus, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with chapter 411, subchapter F, of the Government Code. Upon review, we find you have failed to demonstrate any portion of Exhibit G consists of confidential CHRI. Therefore, the sheriff’s office may not withhold any portion of Exhibit G under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code and federal law.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. The Third Court of Appeals has concluded public citizens’ dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). We note information relating to domestic violence is generally not protected by common-law privacy. *See* Open Records Decision No. 611 at 1 (1992) (family violence is a crime, not a private matter). We also note the public has a legitimate interest in the details of a crime. *See* Open Records Decision No. 400 at 4 (1983); *see generally Lowe v. Hearst Communications, Inc.*, 487 F.3d 246, 250 (5th Cir. 2007) (noting “legitimate public interest in facts tending to support an allegation of criminal activity” (citing *Cinel v. Connick*, 15 F.3d 1338, 1345-46 (5th Cir. 1994))).

Upon review, we find the sheriff’s office must withhold all public citizens’ dates of birth in Exhibits C, D, and E under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we find you have failed to demonstrate any remaining portion of Exhibits C and D are highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public interest. Thus, the sheriff’s office may not withhold any remaining portion of Exhibits C and D under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the sheriff's office must withhold the motor vehicle record information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. However, we find you have failed to demonstrate any of the remaining information is subject to section 552.130. Thus, the sheriff's office may not withhold any of the remaining information on that basis.

In summary, the sheriff's office must withhold Exhibit B under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. The sheriff's office may withhold the information we marked under section 552.108(b)(1) of the Government Code. The sheriff's office must withhold all public citizens' dates of birth in Exhibits C, D, and E under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The sheriff's office must withhold the motor vehicle record information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The sheriff's office must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Kimbell Kesling
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

KK/be

Ref: ID# 952718

c: Requestor