



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

May 24, 2022

Ms. Tessa K. Meredith
Counsel for the City of Pilot Point
Messer, Fort & McDonald, P.L.L.C.
6371 Preston Road, Suite 200
Frisco, Texas 75034

OR2022-14913

Dear Ms. Meredith:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 947316 (ORR ID: PP030722KC3).

The City of Pilot Point (the "city"), which you represent, received a request for video recordings pertaining to a specified arrest involving the requestor's client. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the submitted information includes police officers' body worn camera recordings. Body worn cameras are subject to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code. Chapter 1701 provides the procedures a requestor must follow when seeking a body worn camera recording. Section 1701.661(a) provides:

A member of the public is required to provide the following information when submitting a written request to a law enforcement agency for information recorded by a body worn camera:

- (1) the date and approximate time of the recording;
- (2) the specific location where the recording occurred; and

- (3) the name of one or more persons known to be a subject of the recording.

Occ. Code § 1701.661(a). In this instance, the requestor does not give the requisite information under section 1701.661(a) for some of the submitted body worn camera videos, which we have indicated. As the requestor did not properly request the body worn camera recordings at issue pursuant to chapter 1701, our ruling does not reach this information and it need not be released.¹ *See generally King v. Paxton*, 576 S.W.3d 881 (Tex. App.—Austin 2019, pet. denied). However, pursuant to section 1701.661(b), a “failure to provide all the information required by Subsection (a) to be part of a request for recorded information does not preclude the requestor from making a future request for the same recorded information.” *Id.* § 1701.661(b). Further, we note the requestor provided the requisite information under section 1701.661(a) for the remaining body worn camera recordings. Accordingly, the requestor properly requested the body worn camera recordings at issue, and we will consider the city’s remaining argument against disclosure of this information.

Article 2.1396 of the Code of Criminal Procedure provides:

A person stopped or arrested on suspicion of an offense under Section 49.04, 49.045, 49.07, or 49.08, Penal Code, is entitled to receive from a law enforcement agency employing the peace officer who made the stop or arrest a copy of any video made by or at the direction of the officer that contains footage of:

- (1) the stop;
- (2) the arrest;
- (3) the conduct of the person stopped during any interaction with the officer, including during the administration of a field sobriety test; or
- (4) a procedure in which a specimen of the person’s breath or blood is taken.

Crim. Proc. Code art. 2.1396. The remaining information includes video recordings made by or at the direction of officers employed by the town of the requestor’s client being stopped or arrested on suspicion of an offense under section 49.04 of the Penal Code. *See* Penal Code § 49.04 (“A person commits an offense if the person is intoxicated while operating a motor vehicle in a public place.”). Therefore, the requestor is entitled to receive a copy of these video recordings pursuant to article 2.1396 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. You raise section 552.130 of the Government Code for the information at issue. Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle

¹ As we are able to make this determination, we need not address your argument against disclosure of this information.

operator's or driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. Gov't Code § 552.130(a). We note a statutory right of access generally prevails over the Act's general exceptions to disclosure. *See* Open Record Decision Nos. 613 at 4 (1993) (exceptions in Act cannot impinge on statutory right of access to information), 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exception to disclosure under the Act). However, because section 552.130 has its own access provisions, we conclude section 552.130 is not a general exception under the Act. Thus, we must address the conflict between the confidentiality provided under section 552.130 of the Government Code and the right of access provided under article 2.1396 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. Where information falls within both a general and a specific provision of law, the specific provision prevails over the general. *See* Gov't Code § 311.026(b); *Horizon/CMS Healthcare Corp. v. Auld*, 34 S.W.3d 887, 901 (Tex. 2000) ("more specific statute controls over the more general"); *Cuellar v. State*, 521 S.W.2d 211 (Tex. Crim. App. 1975) (under well-established rule of statutory construction, specific statutory provisions prevail over general ones). In this instance, section 552.130 generally excepts motor vehicle record information maintained in any context, while article 2.1396 specifically provides access to certain video footage pertaining to certain intoxication offense arrests. Thus, we conclude the access under article 2.1396 is more specific than the general confidentiality provided under section 552.130. Additionally, we note article 2.1396 is the later enacted statute. *See* Gov't Code § 311.025(a) (if statutes enacted at different sessions of legislature are irreconcilable, statute latest in enactment prevails). Accordingly, the department may not withhold any portion of the video recordings at issue from the requestor under section 552.130 of the Government Code. Therefore, the department must release the portions of the video recordings that depict the stop, the arrest, or the conduct of the requestor's client during interactions with the officers, or a procedure in which a specimen of the requestor's blood or breath was taken. However, we will address your argument against disclosure of any remaining portions of the video recordings at issue.

As discussed above, section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See id.* § 552.130. Upon review, we find you failed to demonstrate any of the remaining information at issue is subject to section 552.130. Thus, the department may not withhold any of the remaining information at issue under section 552.130 of the Government Code. As no further exceptions to disclosure are raised, the city must release the submitted information to this requestor.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open

Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Erin Groff
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

EMG/be

Ref: ID# 947316

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)