



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

May 24, 2022

Mr. Hunter W. Mattocks
Counsel for the City of Allen
Nichols, Jackson, Dillard, Hager & Smith, L.L.P.
1800 Lincoln Plaza, 500 North Akard
Dallas, Texas 75201

OR2022-14876

Dear Mr. Mattocks:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 949599 (ORR# PD-2022-193).

The Allen Police Department (the "department"), which you represent, received a request for all reports involving a specified address or the requestor. You state you have released some information to the requestor. We understand you will redact social security numbers pursuant to section 552.147(b) of the Government Code.¹ You claim some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.130 of the Government Code.² We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

We note report number 12075880 pertains to an alleged violation of section 32.51 of the Penal Code, which provides, "[a] person commits an offense if the person, with the intent to harm or defraud another, obtains, possesses, transfers, or uses an item of . . . identifying information of another person without the other person's consent[.]" Penal Code § 32.51(b)(1). For purposes of section 32.51, "identifying information" includes an individual's name and financial institution account number. *Id.* § 32.51(a)(1)(A), (C).

¹ Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office. *See* Gov't Code § 552.147(b).

² Although you do not cite to section 552.130 of the Government Code in your brief to this office, we understand you to raise this section based on your markings.

Article 2.29 of the Code of Criminal Procedure pertains to alleged violations of section 32.51 that occurred on or after September 1, 2005, and provides:

(a) A peace officer to whom an alleged violation of Section 32.51, Penal Code, is reported shall make a written report to the law enforcement agency that employs the peace officer that includes the following information:

- (1) the name of the victim;
- (2) the name of the suspect, if known;
- (3) the type of identifying information obtained, possessed, transferred, or used in violation of Section 32.51, Penal Code; and
- (4) the results of any investigation.

(b) On the victim's request, the law enforcement agency shall provide the report created under Subsection (a) to the victim. In providing the report, the law enforcement agency shall redact any otherwise confidential information that is included in the report, other than the information described by Subsection (a).

Crim. Proc. Code art. 2.29. For purposes of article 2.29, an offense is committed on or after September 1, 2005, if no "element of the offense occurs before that date." Act of Jun. 17, 2005, 79th Leg., R.S., ch. 294, § 1(b).

In this instance, report number 12075880 pertains to an allegation of fraudulent use of identifying information, which constitutes an alleged violation of section 32.51. We note the requestor is listed as the victim, and the alleged offense occurred after September 1, 2005. Therefore, we find report number 12075880 is subject to article 2.29 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. *See* Crim. Proc. Code art. 2.29. Although the department seeks to withhold the information at issue under section 552.108 of the Government Code, this exception does not make information confidential. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 586 (1991) (governmental body may waive section 552.108). Therefore, report number 12075880 may not be withheld under section 552.108 of the Government Code. However, because sections 552.101 and 552.130 are confidentiality provisions, we will address their applicability. Additionally, we will address the department's arguments under section 552.108 of the Government Code against disclosure of the remaining information.

Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information concerning an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. *See* Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that has concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A) (governmental body must provide comments explaining why exceptions raised should apply to information requested). You state the information you marked in some of the

remaining reports relates to closed criminal cases that did not result in convictions or deferred adjudications. Based on this representation and our review, we conclude the department may withhold the information you marked in the remaining reports under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.³

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 of the Government Code encompasses section 411.083 of the Government Code, which pertains to criminal history record information (“CHRI”). CHRI generated by the National Crime Information Center (“NCIC”) or by the Texas Crime Information Center (“TCIC”) is confidential under federal and state law. CHRI means “information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions.” *Id.* § 411.082(2). Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI obtained from the federal government or other states. *See* Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual laws with respect to CHRI it generates. *See id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI the Texas Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F or subchapter E-1, of the Government Code. *See* Gov’t Code § 411.083(a). Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090-.127. Thus, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with chapter 411, subchapter F, of the Government Code. We further note Federal Bureau of Investigation (“FBI”) numbers constitute CHRI generated by the FBI. Upon review, we find the department must withhold the FBI numbers you have marked in the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with chapter 411 of the Government Code and federal law. However, the department has failed to demonstrate the remaining information at issue consists of confidential CHRI. Therefore, the department may not withhold any portion of the remaining information at issue under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. The Third Court of Appeals has concluded public citizens’ dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied)

³ As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address the remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

(mem. op.). Because “the right of privacy is purely personal[,]” that right “terminates upon the death of the person whose privacy is invaded[.]” *Moore v. Charles B. Pierce Film Enters., Inc.*, 589 S.W.2d 489, 491 (Tex. Civ. App.—Texarkana 1979, writ ref’d n.r.e.); *see also Justice v. Belo Broad. Corp.*, 472 F. Supp. 145, 147 (N.D. Tex. 1979) (“action for invasion of privacy can be maintained only by a living individual whose privacy is invaded” (quoting RESTATEMENT (SECOND) OF TORTS § 6521)); Attorney General Opinions JM-229 (1984) (“the right of privacy lapses upon death”), H-917 (1976) (“We are . . . of the opinion that the Texas courts would follow the almost uniform rule of other jurisdictions that the right of privacy lapses upon death.”); Open Records Decision No. 272 (1981) (“the right of privacy is personal and lapses upon death”). Thus, with the exception of the requestor’s date of birth, to which the requestor has a right of access pursuant to section 552.023 of the Government Code, the department must withhold all living public citizens’ dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.023(a) (“person’s authorized representative has special right of access, beyond right of general public, to information held by governmental body that relates to person and that is protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person’s privacy interests”); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individual requests information concerning herself). However, we find you have failed to demonstrate any of the remaining information is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public concern. Thus, none of the remaining information may be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator’s license, driver’s license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.130. We note section 552.130 protects personal privacy. Because the right of privacy lapses at death, motor vehicle record information that pertains solely to a deceased individual may not be withheld under section 552.130. *See Moore*, 589 S.W.2d at 491; *see also* Attorney General Opinions JM-229; H-917; ORD 272. We note section 552.130 is designed to protect the privacy of individuals. Thus, the requestor has a right of access to her own motor vehicle record information and it may not be withheld from her under section 552.130. *See id.* § 552.023; ORD 481 at 4. Accordingly, except for information belonging to the requestor and driver’s license information pertaining to the deceased individual, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information it marked in the remaining information under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, except for report number 12075880, which is subject to article 2.29 of the Criminal Code, the department may withhold the information you marked pursuant to section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code. The department must withhold the FBI numbers you have marked in the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with chapter 411 of the Government Code and federal law. With the exception of the requestor’s date of birth, the department must withhold all living public citizens’ dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. Except for information belonging to the requestor and driver’s license information pertaining to the deceased individual, the department must

withhold the motor vehicle record information it marked in the remaining information under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Amy Shipp
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

ALS/jm

Ref: ID# 949599

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)