



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

May 23, 2022

Mr. Leonard V. Schneider  
Counsel for the City of Huntsville  
Liles Parker PLLC  
2261 Northpark Drive, Suite 445  
Kingwood, Texas 77339

OR2022-14770

Dear Mr. Schneider:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 949666.

The City of Huntsville (the "city"), which you represent, received a request for the personnel file of a named peace officer. You state you will release some information. You also state you will redact certain information pursuant to sections 552.130(c) and 552.147(b) of the Government Code.<sup>1</sup> You claim some of the submitted information is not subject to the Act. You also claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.115, 552.117, 552.119, 552.136, 552.137, and 552.140 of the Government Code. We have considered the submitted arguments and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the submitted information includes an officer's Texas Commission of Law Enforcement ("TCOLE") identification number. Section 552.002(a) of the Government defines "public information" as the following:

---

<sup>1</sup> Section 552.130(c) allows a governmental body to redact the information described in section 552.130(a) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). *See id.* § 552.130(d), (e). Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office. *See id.* § 552.147(b).

[I]nformation that is written, produced, collected, assembled, or maintained under a law or ordinance or in connection with the transaction of official business:

- (1) by a governmental body;
- (2) for a governmental body and the governmental body:
  - (A) owns the information;
  - (B) has a right of access to the information; or
  - (C) spends or contributes public money for the purpose of writing, producing, collecting, assembling, or maintaining the information; or
- (3) by an individual officer or employee of a governmental body in the officer's or employee's official capacity and the information pertains to official business of the governmental body.

Gov't Code § 552.002(a). In Open Records Decision No. 581 (1990), this office determined certain computer information, such as source codes, documentation information, and other computer programming, that has no significance other than its use as a tool for the maintenance, manipulation, or protection of public property is not the kind of information made public under section 552.021 of the Government Code. We understand the officer's TCOLE identification number is a unique computer-generated number assigned to a peace officer for identification in TCOLE's electronic database, and may be used as an access device number on the TCOLE website. Thus, we find the officer's TCOLE number does not constitute public information under section 552.002 of the Government Code. Therefore, the officer's TCOLE number is not subject to the Act and need not be released to the requestor.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." *Id.* § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses chapter 411 of the Government Code, which pertains to criminal history record information ("CHRI") generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center. Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. *Id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code makes CHRI the Texas Department of Public Safety ("DPS") maintains confidential, except DPS may disseminate this information as provided in subchapters E-1 and F of chapter 411 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 411.083(a). Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI, but a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are

entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090-.127. Thus, any CHRI generated by the federal government or another state may not be made available to the requestor except in accordance with federal regulations. *See* ORD 565. Upon review, we find a portion of the remaining information, consists of CHRI that is confidential under section 411.083. Thus, the city must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code.<sup>2</sup> However, we find the city has not demonstrated any portion of the remaining information consists of CHRI for purposes of chapter 411 of the Government Code, and the city may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

You assert some of the remaining information is confidential under former section 1703.306 of the Occupations Code, which provided for the confidentiality of certain polygraph information. However, the 87th Legislature repealed former chapter 1703 of the Occupations Code effective September 1, 2021. Act of May 31, 2021, 87th Leg., R.S., HB 1560, § 2.01(1). Accordingly, the city may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with former section 1703.306 of the Occupations Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by federal law, such as section 1324a of title 8 of the United States Code. Section 1324a governs I-9 forms and their related documents. This section provides an I-9 form and “any information contained in or appended to such form, may not be used for purposes other than for enforcement of this chapter” and for enforcement of other federal statutes governing crime and criminal investigations. *See* 8 U.S.C. § 1324a(b)(5); *see also* 8 C.F.R. § 274a.2(b)(4). Release of the submitted I-9 form in this instance would be “for purposes other than enforcement” of the referenced federal statutes. Upon review, we conclude you have failed to demonstrate any of the remaining information is confidential pursuant to section 1324a of title 8 of the United States Code. Accordingly, the city may not withhold the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information made confidential by section 12.003 of the Human Resources Code. Section 12.003 of the Human Resources Code provides, in relevant part:

(a) Except for purposes directly connected with the administration of the assistance programs of the [Texas Health and Human Services Commission (the “commission”)] or Department of Aging and Disability Services [(“DADS”)], as applicable, it is an offense for a person to solicit, disclose, receive, or make use of, or to authorize, knowingly permit, participate in, or acquiesce in the use of the names of, or any information concerning, persons applying for or receiving assistance if the information is directly or indirectly derived from the records, papers, files, or communications of the

---

<sup>2</sup> As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address the remaining argument against disclosure of this information.

commission or [DADS] or acquired by employees of the commission or [DADS] in the performance of their official duties.

Hum. Res. Code § 12.003(a). The term “assistance” in sections 12.003 and 21.012 includes “all forms of assistance and services for needy persons authorized by Subtitle C” of title 2 of the Human Resources Code. *Id.* § 11.001(1); *see also id.* ch. 31 et seq. (Assistance Programs). In Open Records Decision No. 584 (1991), this office concluded that “[t]he inclusion of the words ‘or any information’ juxtaposed with the prohibition on disclosure of the names of [the commission’s] clients clearly expresses a legislative intent to encompass the broadest range of individual client information, and not merely the clients’ names and addresses.” ORD 584 at 3. Consequently, it is the specific information pertaining to individual clients, and not merely the clients’ identities, that is made confidential under section 12.003. *See also* 42 U.S.C. § 1396a(a)(7) (state plan for medical assistance must provide safeguards that restrict use or disclosure of information concerning applicants and recipients to purposes directly connected with administration of plan); 42 C.F.R. §§ 431.300 *et seq.*; Open Records Decision No. 166 (1977).

You assert some of the remaining information is confidential under section 12.003. However, section 12.003 only applies to information “derived from the records, papers, files, or communications of the commission or [DADS].” Hum. Res. Code § 12.003(a). Upon review, we find you have not demonstrated the information at issue consists of information “derived from the records, papers, files, or communications of the commission or [DADS].” We therefore conclude the city may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 12.003 of the Human Resources Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information made confidential by the Medical Practice Act (“MPA”), subtitle B of title 3 of the Occupations Code, which governs release of medical records. Section 159.002 of the MPA provides, in relevant part:

- (a) A communication between a physician and a patient, relative to or in connection with any professional services as a physician to the patient, is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.
- (b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.
- (c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient’s behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

Occ. Code § 159.002(a)-(c). Information subject to the MPA includes both medical records and information obtained from those medical records. *See id.* §§ 159.002, .004. This office

has concluded the protection afforded by section 159.002 extends only to records created by either a physician or someone under the supervision of a physician. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 487 (1987), 370 (1983), 343 (1982). We have further found when a file is created as a result of a hospital stay, all the documents in the file referring to diagnosis and treatment constitute physician-patient communications or “[r]ecords of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that are created or maintained by a physician.” Open Records Decision No. 546 (1990).

Upon review, we find a portion of the remaining information, which we marked, constitutes records of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that were created or are maintained by a physician and information obtained from a patient’s medical records. Accordingly, the city must withhold the marked information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the MPA. However, we find the city has not demonstrated any portion of the remaining information consists of medical records for purposes of the MPA, and the city may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 on that basis.

Section 552.102(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy.”<sup>3</sup> Gov’t Code § 552.102(a). The Texas Supreme Court held section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure the dates of birth of state employees in the payroll database of the Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts. *Tex. Comptroller of Pub. Accounts v. Attorney Gen. of Tex.*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). Accordingly, the city must withhold the employee’s date of birth we marked under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). This office has found personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 600 (1992) (employee’s designation of retirement beneficiary, choice of insurance carrier, election of optional coverages, direct deposit authorization, forms allowing employee to allocate pretax compensation to group insurance, health care or dependent care), 523 (1989) (common-law privacy protects credit reports, financial statements, and other personal financial information), 373 (1983) (sources of income not related to financial transaction between individual and governmental body protected under common-law privacy). However, this office has concluded the public has a legitimate interest in information that relates to public employees and their conduct in the workplace. *See, e.g.*, Open Records Decision Nos. 562 at 10 (1990) (personnel file

---

<sup>3</sup> The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision No. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

information does not involve most intimate aspects of human affairs but in fact touches on matters of legitimate public concern), 470 at 4 (1987) (job performance does not generally constitute public employee's private affairs), 455 at 9 (employment applicant's salary information not private), 444 at 4 (1986) (public has obvious interest in information concerning qualifications and performance of government employees), 405 at 2 (1983) (manner in which public employee's job was performed cannot be said to be of minimal public interest), 392 (1982) (reasons for employee's resignation ordinarily not private). We note some of the information at issue pertains to worker's compensation claims, and thus, there is a legitimate public interest in this information. *See* Open Records Decision No. 545 at 4 (1990) (attorney general has found kinds of financial information not excepted from public disclosure by common-law privacy to generally be those regarding receipt of governmental funds or debts owed to governmental entities). Upon review, we find some of the remaining information satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, the city must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.<sup>4</sup> However, we find you have failed to demonstrate the remaining information at issue is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public interest. Thus, the city may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

The city raises section 552.115 of the Government Code for the submitted birth certificates. Section 552.115 excepts from disclosure "[a] birth or death record maintained by the bureau of vital statistics of the Texas Department of Health or a local registration official[.]" Gov't Code § 552.115(a). Section 552.115 is applicable only to information maintained by the bureau of vital statistics or local registration officials. *See* Open Records Decision No. 338 (1982) (finding that statutory predecessor to section 552.115 excepted only those birth and death records which are maintained by the bureau of vital statistics and local registration officials). Because section 552.115 does not apply to information held by the city, the submitted birth certificates may not be withheld on this basis.

Section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure the home address, home telephone number, emergency contact information, and social security number of a current or honorably retired peace officer, as well as information that reveals whether the current or honorably retired peace officer has family members, regardless of whether the current or honorably retired peace officer complies with sections 552.024 and 552.1175 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.117(a)(2); *id.* § 552.003(1-b) (defining "honorably retired" for purposes of the Act). We note, for purposes of section 552.117, "family member" means a spouse, minor child, or adult child who resides in the person's home. *See id.* § 552.117(c) (providing that "family member" has meaning assigned by Fin. Code § 31.006(d). We note section 552.117 also encompasses a personal cellular telephone number, unless the cellular service is paid for by a governmental body. *See* Open Records Decision No. 506 at 5-7 (1988) (statutory predecessor to section 552.117 not applicable to cellular telephone numbers provided and paid for by governmental body and intended for official use). Section 552.117(a)(2) applies to peace officers as defined by article 2.12 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. In this instance, however, it is unclear

---

<sup>4</sup> As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address the remaining argument against disclosure of this information.

whether the individual whose information is at issue is a current or honorably retired peace officer as defined by article 2.12. If the individual at issue is a current or honorably retired peace officer as defined by article 2.12, then the city must withhold the information we marked under section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code; however, the city may only withhold any marked cellular telephone number if the cellular telephone service is not paid for by a governmental body. Conversely, if the individual at issue is not a current or honorably retired peace officer as defined by article 2.12, the information at issue may not be withheld under section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code. In either instance, we find you have failed to demonstrate the applicability of section 552.117(a)(2) to the remaining information, and thus, no portion of the remaining information may be withheld under section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code.

If the individual at issue is not a current or honorably retired peace officer, then her personal information may be subject to section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code, which excepts from disclosure the home addresses and telephone numbers, emergency contact information, social security number, and family member information of a current or former employee of a governmental body who requests this information be kept confidential under section 552.024. Gov't Code § 552.117(a)(1). Section 552.117(a)(1) also applies to the personal cellular telephone number of a current or former official or employee of a governmental body, provided the cellular telephone service is not paid by a governmental body. *See* ORD 506 at 5-6. Whether a particular piece of information is protected by section 552.117(a)(1) must be determined at the time the request for it is made. *See* Open Records Decision No. 530 at 5 (1989). The city may only withhold the information at issue under section 552.117(a)(1) if the individual at issue elected confidentiality under section 552.024 prior to the date on which the request for this information was made. Therefore, to the extent the employee at issue timely requested confidentiality under section 552.024 of the Government Code, the city must withhold the information we marked under section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code; however, the city may only withhold any marked cellular telephone number if the cellular telephone service is not paid for by a governmental body.<sup>5</sup> Conversely, to the extent the employee at issue did not timely request confidentiality under section 552.024, the city may not withhold the information under section 552.117(a)(1). In either instance, we find you have failed to demonstrate the applicability of section 552.117(a)(1) to the remaining information, and thus, no portion of the remaining information may be withheld under section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code.

Section 552.140 of the Government Code provides a military veteran's DD-214 form or other military discharge record that is first recorded with, or that otherwise first comes into the possession of, a governmental body on or after September 1, 2003, is confidential for a period of seventy-five years and may only be disclosed in accordance with section 552.140 or in accordance with a court order. *See* Gov't Code § 552.140(a)-(b). Upon review, we find you have failed to demonstrate the applicability of section 552.140 to any of the remaining information at issue. Thus, the city may not withhold any of the remaining information at issue under section 552.140 of the Government Code.

---

<sup>5</sup> Regardless of the applicability of section 552.117 of the Government Code, we note section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office. *See* Gov't Code § 552.147(b).

After reviewing the remaining information, we have determined no novel or complex issue exists in the remaining information. Thus, we address your remaining claims in a summary ruling.

The city must withhold the information you indicated under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 6103(a) of title 26 of the United States Code. The city must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 611.002 of the Health and Safety Code. The city must withhold the information you indicated under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.306 of the Occupations Code. The city must withhold the information you indicated under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.454 of the Occupations Code. The city must withhold the fingerprints we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 560.003 of the Government Code. The city must withhold the firearm serial numbers it indicated under section 552.108(b)(1) of the Government Code. The city must withhold the personal e-mail addresses we marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owners affirmatively consent to their public disclosure. The city must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Pearlie Gault  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

PG/mo

Ref: ID# 949666

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)