



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

May 12, 2022

Ms. Lauren Downey
Public Information Coordinator
Assistant Attorney General
Office of the Attorney General
P.O. Box 12548
Austin, Texas 78711-2548

OR2022-13718

Dear Ms. Downey:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 947285 (PIR No. R011808).

The Office of the Attorney General (the "OAG") received a request for any contracts, invoices, and records of payment to a specified law firm during a defined time period. The OAG states it will release most of the responsive information and will rely on Open Records Letter Nos. 2022-08260 (2022) and 2021-36194 (2021) with respect to some of the requested information.¹ The OAG claims some of the submitted information is privileged under Texas Rule of Evidence 503. We have considered the submitted argument and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, the OAG acknowledges the submitted information is subject to section 552.022 of the Government Code. Section 552.022(a)(16) provides for the required public disclosure of "information that is in a bill for attorney's fees and that is not privileged under the attorney-client privilege" unless it is "made confidential under [the Act] or other law[.]" Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(16). The submitted information consists of an attorney fee bill subject to section 552.022(a)(16). This information must be released unless it is made

¹ See Open Records Decision No. 673 (2001) (so long as law, facts, and circumstances on which prior ruling was based have not changed, first type of previous determination exists where requested information is precisely the same information as was addressed in a prior attorney general ruling, ruling is addressed to same governmental body, and ruling concludes that information is or is not excepted from disclosure).

confidential under the Act or other law. *Id.* The Texas Supreme Court has held the Texas Rules of Evidence are “other law” that make information expressly confidential for the purposes of section 552.022. *In re City of Georgetown*, 53 S.W.3d 328, 336 (Tex. 2001). Therefore, we will consider the OAG’s assertion of the attorney-client privilege under Texas Rule of Evidence 503.

Texas Rule of Evidence 503(b)(1) provides:

A client has a privilege to refuse to disclose and to prevent any other person from disclosing confidential communications made to facilitate the rendition of professional legal services to the client:

- (A) between the client or the client’s representative and the client’s lawyer or the lawyer’s representative;
- (B) between the client’s lawyer and the lawyer’s representative;
- (C) by the client, the client’s representative, the client’s lawyer, or the lawyer’s representative to a lawyer representing another party in a pending action or that lawyer’s representative, if the communications concern a matter of common interest in the pending action;
- (D) between the client’s representatives or between the client and the client’s representative; or
- (E) among lawyers and their representatives representing the same client.

TEX. R. EVID. 503(b)(1). A communication is “confidential” if not intended to be disclosed to third persons other than those to whom disclosure is made to further the rendition of professional legal services to the client or reasonably necessary to transmit the communication. *Id.* 503(a)(5). Accordingly, in order to withhold attorney-client privileged information from disclosure under rule 503, a governmental body must (1) show that the document is a communication transmitted between privileged parties or reveals a confidential communication, (2) identify the parties involved in the communication, and (3) show that the communication is confidential by explaining that it was not intended to be disclosed to third persons and that it was made in furtherance of the rendition of professional legal services to the client. Open Records Decision No. 676 at 6-7 (2002). Upon a demonstration of all three factors, the entire communication is confidential under rule 503, provided the client has not waived the privilege or the communication does not fall within the purview of the exceptions to the privilege enumerated in rule 503(d). *Huie v. DeShazo*, 922 S.W.2d 920, 922 (Tex. 1996) (privilege extends to entire communication, including facts contained therein); *In re Valero Energy Corp.*, 973 S.W.2d 453, 457 (Tex.

App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1998, orig. proceeding) (privilege attaches to complete communication, including factual information).

The OAG asserts the information it marked constitutes privileged attorney-client communications between the OAG's outside counsel and the OAG that were made for the purpose of the rendition of legal services to the OAG. The OAG states the communications at issue have not been, and were not intended to be, disclosed to third parties. Based upon the OAG's representations and our review, we find the OAG has established the information at issue constitutes attorney-client communications under rule 503. Accordingly, the OAG may withhold the information it marked pursuant to rule 503. The OAG must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

James M. Graham
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JMG/eb

Ref: ID# 947285

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)