



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

May 4, 2022

Ms. Holly Voth
Assistant City Attorney
City of San Angelo
72 West College Avenue
San Angelo, Texas 76903

OR2022-12680

Dear Ms. Voth:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 945535 (City's File No. P003562-020922).

The City of San Angelo (the "city") received a request for information pertaining to a specified incident.¹ You state you do not have information responsive to a portion of the request.² You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note, although the city indicates the submitted CR-3 report was submitted as supporting documentation, upon review, we find the CR-3 report is responsive to the request for information because it pertains to the incident at issue and contains some of the

¹ The city provides documentation showing it sought and received clarification of the information requested. See Gov't Code § 552.222 (providing if request for information is unclear, governmental body may ask requestor to clarify request); see also *City of Dallas v. Abbott*, 304 S.W.3d 380, 387 (Tex. 2010) (holding that when a governmental entity, acting in good faith, requests clarification or narrowing of an unclear or overbroad request for information, the ten-day period to request an attorney general ruling is measured from the date the request is clarified or narrowed).

² The Act does not require a governmental body that receives a request for information to create information that did not exist when the request was received. See *Econ. Opportunities Dev. Corp. v. Bustamante*, 562 S.W.2d 266 (Tex. Civ. App.—San Antonio 1978, writ dismissed); Open Records Decision Nos. 605 at 2 (1992), 563 at 8 (1990), 555 at 1-2 (1990), 452 at 3 (1986), 362 at 2 (1983).

information specified in the request. Accordingly, we will consider the applicability of any exceptions to disclosure of the CR-3 report. We will also consider the city's arguments against disclosure of the remaining information.

Next, we note you have only submitted body worn camera recordings and a CR-3 accident report pertaining to the specified incident. Although you state you submitted a representative sample of information, the submitted information is not representative of all the types of information requested. Please be advised, this open records letter ruling applies only to the type of information the city submitted for our review. This ruling does not authorize the city to withhold any information that is substantially different from the type of information the city submitted to this office. *See* Gov't Code § 552.302 (where request for attorney general decision does not comply with requirements of Gov't Code § 552.301, information is presumed to be public). Accordingly, to the extent the city maintained information responsive to the remaining portions of the request that is substantially different from the type of information submitted to this office on the date the city received the request, we assume you have released it. If you have not released any such information, you must do so at this time. *See id.* §§ 552.301(a), .302; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 664 (2000) (if governmental body concludes no exceptions apply to requested information, it must release information as soon as possible).

Next, we note the submitted information contains police officers' body worn camera recordings. Body worn cameras are subject to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code. Chapter 1701 provides the procedures a requestor must follow when seeking a body worn camera recording. Section 1701.661(a) provides the following:

A member of the public is required to provide the following information when submitting a written request to a law enforcement agency for information recorded by a body worn camera:

- (1) the date and approximate time of the recording;
- (2) the specific location where the recording occurred; and
- (3) the name of one or more persons known to be a subject of the recording.

Occ. Code § 1701.661(a). We note the requestor provided the requisite information under section 1701.661(a) for some of the body worn camera recordings at issue. As these body worn camera recordings were properly requested pursuant to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code, we will address your arguments against their disclosure. However, the requestor did not give the requisite information under section 1701.661(a) for the remaining body worn camera recordings at issue, which we indicated. As the requestor did not properly request the remaining body worn camera recordings pursuant to chapter 1701, our

ruling does not reach this information, and it need not be released to the requestor.³ However, pursuant to section 1701.661(b), a “failure to provide all the information required by Subsection (a) to be part of a request for recorded information does not preclude the requestor from making a future request for the same recorded information.” *Id.* § 1701.661(b).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 of the Government Code encompasses information made confidential by other statutes. Body worn cameras are subject to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code. As noted above, the requestor provides the requisite information for the body worn camera recordings at issue. However, section 1701.661(f) provides, in relevant part:

A law enforcement agency may not release any portion . . . of a recording involving the investigation of conduct that constitutes a misdemeanor punishable by fine only and does not result in arrest, without written authorization from the person who is the subject of that portion of the recording or, if the person is deceased, from the person’s authorized representative.

Id. § 1701.661(f). You state the remaining recordings pertain to the investigation of conduct that constitutes a misdemeanor punishable by fine only and which did not result in an arrest. You also state you have not received a written authorization for release from all of the subjects of the recordings. *See id.* Accordingly, we find the city must withhold the remaining body worn camera recordings under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.661(f) of the Occupations Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information subject to chapter 550 of the Transportation Code. Section 550.065 applies only to a written report of an accident required under section 550.061, 550.062, or 601.004. *See* Transp. Code § 550.065(a)(1). Chapter 550 requires the creation of a written report when the accident resulted in injury to or the death of a person or damage to the property of any person to the apparent extent of \$1,000 or more. *Id.* §§ 550.061 (operator’s accident report), .062 (officer’s accident report). An accident report is privileged and for the confidential use of the Texas Department of Transportation or a local governmental agency of Texas that has use for the information for accident prevention purposes. *Id.* § 550.065(b). However, a governmental entity shall release an accident report in accordance with subsections (c) and (c-1). *Id.* § 550.065(c), (c-1). Section 550.065(c) provides a governmental entity shall release an accident report to a person or entity listed under this subsection. *Id.* § 550.065(c).

In this instance, the requestor is not a person listed under section 550.065(c). Thus, the submitted accident report is confidential under section 550.065(b), and the city must

³ As we are able to make this determination, we need not address your arguments against disclosure of this information.

withhold it under section 552.101 of the Government Code. However, section 550.065(c-1) requires the city to create a redacted accident report that may be requested by any person. *Id.* § 550.065(c-1). The redacted accident report may not include the information listed in subsection (f)(2). *Id.* Therefore, the requestor has a right of access to the redacted accident report. Thus, the city must release the redacted accident report pursuant to section 550.065(c-1) of the Transportation Code.

In summary, for the body worn camera recordings that the requestor did not properly request pursuant to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code, which we indicated, our ruling does not reach this information and it need not be released. The city must withhold the remaining body worn camera recordings under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.661(f) of the Occupations Code. The city must withhold the CR-3 accident report under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 550.065(b) of the Transportation Code but must release the redacted accident report pursuant to section 550.065(c-1) of the Transportation Code

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Pearlie Gault
Attorney
Open Records Division

PG/jm

Ref: ID# 945535

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)