



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

May 3, 2022

Mr. Miguel Salinas
Staff Attorney
Brownsville Independent School District
1900 Price Road
Brownsville, Texas 78521-2417

OR2022-12512

Dear Mr. Salinas:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 945378 (Ref. No. 0222).

The Brownsville Independent School District (the "district") received a request for three categories of information pertaining to two named employees. You state the district has released some of the requested information. You state the district does not maintain information responsive to a portion of the request.¹ You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.102, and 552.117 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses other statutes, such as section 21.355 of the Education Code, which provides that "[a] document evaluating the performance of a teacher or administrator is confidential." Educ. Code § 21.355(a). This office has interpreted section 21.355 to apply to any document that evaluates, as that term is commonly understood, the performance of a teacher or an administrator. *See* Open Records Decision No. 643 (1996). Additionally, a court has concluded that a written reprimand constitutes

¹ The Act does not require a governmental body to release information that did not exist when a request for information was received or to prepare new information in response to a request. *See Econ. Opportunities Dev. Corp. v. Bustamante*, 562 S.W.2d 266, 267-68 (Tex. Civ. App.—San Antonio 1978, writ dismissed); Open Records Decision Nos. 605 at 2 (1992), 452 at 3 (1986), 362 at 2 (1983).

an evaluation for purposes of section 21.355, as it “reflects the principal’s judgment regarding [a teacher’s] actions, gives corrective direction, and provides for further review.” *Abbott v. North East Indep. Sch. Dist.*, 212 S.W.3d 364 (Tex. App.—Austin 2006, no pet.). In Open Records Decision No. 643, we concluded that a “teacher” for purposes of section 21.355 means a person who is required to and does in fact hold a certificate or permit required under chapter 21 of the Education Code and is teaching at the time of his or her evaluation. *See* ORD 643. In Open Records Decision No. 643, we also determined an “administrator” for purposes of section 21.355 means a person who is required to, and does in fact, hold an administrator’s certificate under subchapter B of chapter 21 of the Education Code, and is performing the functions as an administrator, as that term is commonly defined, at the time of the evaluation. *See id.*

You assert some of the submitted information consists of written evaluations that are confidential under section 21.355. You inform us, and have submitted documentation reflecting, the individual at issue held the appropriate certifications at the time of the evaluations. Based on your representations and our review, we agree the information we marked constitutes evaluations as contemplated by section 21.355. Accordingly, the district must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 21.355 of the Education Code.² However, we find you have failed to demonstrate any of the remaining information at issue constitutes a document evaluating the performance of a teacher or administrator for the purposes of section 21.355 of the Education Code. Therefore, the district may not withhold the remaining information at issue under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 21.355 of the Education Code.

Section 552.102(b) of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure “a transcript from an institution of higher education maintained in the personnel file of a professional public school employee[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.102(b). This exception further provides, however, that “the degree obtained or the curriculum on a transcript in the personnel file of the employee” are not excepted from disclosure. *Id.*; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 526 (1989). Thus, with the exception of the employees’ names, courses taken, and degrees obtained, the district must withhold the college transcripts we marked under section 552.102(b) of the Government Code.³

Section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure the home address and telephone number, emergency contact information, social security number, and family member information of a current or former employee or official of a governmental body who requests this information be kept confidential under section 552.024 of the Government Code, except as provided by section 552.024(a-1). *See* Gov’t Code § 552.117(a)(1), .024. Section 552.024(a-1) of the Government Code provides, “A school district may not require an employee or former employee of the district to choose whether to allow public access to the employee’s or former employee’s social security number.” *Id.*

² As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure of this information.

³ As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure of this information.

§ 552.024(a-1). Thus, the district may only withhold under section 552.117 the home address and telephone number, emergency contact information, and family member information of a current or former employee or official of the district who requests this information be kept confidential under section 552.024. Section 552.117(a)(1) also applies to the personal cellular telephone number of a current or former official or employee of a governmental body, provided the cellular telephone service is not paid by a governmental body. *See* Open Records Decision No. 506 at 5-6 (1988). Whether a particular item of information is protected by section 552.117(a)(1) must be determined at the time of the governmental body's receipt of the request for the information. *See* Open Records Decision No. 530 at 5 (1989). Thus, information may be withheld under section 552.117(a)(1) only on behalf of a current or former employee or official who made a request for confidentiality under section 552.024 prior to the date of the governmental body's receipt of the request for the information. Information may not be withheld under section 552.117(a)(1) on behalf of a current or former employee or official who did not timely request under section 552.024 the information be kept confidential. Therefore, to the extent the employees at issue timely requested confidentiality under section 552.024 of the Government Code, the district must withhold the information we marked under section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code; however, the district may only withhold the marked cellular telephone numbers if the cellular telephone services are not paid for by a governmental body. Conversely, to the extent the employees at issue did not timely request confidentiality under section 552.024, the district may not withhold the information under section 552.117(a)(1).

Although you state the district has redacted social security numbers pursuant to section 552.147(b) of the Government Code, we note the remaining information contains additional social security numbers.⁴ Section 552.147(a-1) of the Government Code provides, "[t]he social security number of an employee of a school district in the custody of the district is confidential." Gov't Code § 552.147(a-1). Thus, section 552.147(a-1) makes the social security numbers of school district employees confidential, without such employees being required to first make a confidentiality election under section 552.024 of the Government Code. *Id.* § 552.024(a-1) (school district may not require employee or former employee of district to choose whether to allow public access to employee's or former employee's social security number). Reading sections 552.024(a-1) and 552.147(a-1) together, we conclude section 552.147(a-1) makes confidential the social security numbers of both current and former school district employees. Upon review, we find the district must withhold the social security number you marked and the additional social security number we marked under section 552.147(a-1) of the Government Code.

In summary, the district must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 21.355 of the Education Code. With the exception of the employees' names, courses taken, and degrees obtained, the district must withhold the college transcripts we marked under section 552.102(b) of the Government Code. To the extent the employees at issue timely requested confidentiality under section 552.024 of the Government Code, the district must withhold the information

⁴ Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office. *See id.* § 552.147(b).

we marked under section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code; however, the district may only withhold the marked cellular telephone numbers if the cellular telephone services are not paid for by a governmental body. The district must withhold the social security number you marked and the additional social security number we marked under section 552.147(a-1) of the Government Code. The district must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Alex Burke
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

AB/jxd

Ref: ID# 945378

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)