



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

April 28, 2022

Ms. Katheryne Ellison  
Assistant General Counsel  
Houston Independent School District  
4400 West 18th Street  
Houston, Texas 77092-8501

OR2022-12118

Dear Ms. Ellison:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 941691 (Reference No. V020822).

The Houston Independent School District (the "district") received a request for any and all employment records pertaining to a named individual. You claim portions of the submitted information are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.102, and 552.117 of the Government Code. We have considered the claimed exceptions and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.<sup>1</sup>

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses section 1324a of title 8 of the United States Code. Section 1324a governs I-9 forms and their related documents. This section provides an I-9 form and "any information contained in or appended to such form, may not be used for purposes other than for enforcement of this chapter" and for enforcement of other federal statutes governing crime and criminal investigations. *See* 8 U.S.C. § 1324a(b)(5); *see also* 8 C.F.R. § 274a.2(b)(4). In this instance, release of the

---

<sup>1</sup> We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

submitted I-9 form and attached documents would be “for purposes other than for enforcement” of the referenced federal statutes. Thus, we find the submitted I-9 form and related documents are confidential pursuant to section 1324a of title 8 of the United States Code. Accordingly, the district must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1324a of title 8 of the United States Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides, in relevant part:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act], and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under [chapter 261 of the Family Code] and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under [chapter 261 of the Family Code] or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). You contend the information you marked was used or developed in an investigation under chapter 261. We note the district is not an agency authorized to conduct an investigation under chapter 261 of the Family Code. *See id.* § 261.103 (listing agencies that may conduct child abuse investigations). Additionally, we note the information at issue consists of administrative records. Upon review, we find you have failed to establish this information consists of files, reports, records, communications, or working papers used or developed in an investigation under chapter 261. Further, we find you have not demonstrated the information at issue consists of a report of child abuse or neglect or was used or developed in an investigation under chapter 261. *See id.* § 261.001(1), (4) (defining “abuse” and “neglect” for purposes of Family Code ch. 261). Therefore, we conclude section 261.201 is not applicable to the information you marked, and the district may not withhold it under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 21.355 of the Education Code, which provides, in relevant part, “[a] document evaluating the performance of a teacher or administrator is confidential and not subject to disclosure under [the Act].” Educ. Code § 21.355(a). Additionally, the Third Court of Appeals has concluded a written reprimand constitutes an evaluation for purposes of section 21.355, as it “reflects the principal’s judgment regarding [a teacher’s] actions, gives corrective

direction, and provides for further review.” *Abbott v. North East Indep. Sch. Dist.*, 212 S.W.3d 364 (Tex. App.—Austin 2006, no pet.). This office has interpreted section 21.355 to apply to any document that evaluates, as that term is commonly understood, the performance of a teacher or administrator. *See* Open Records Decision No. 643 (1996). In Open Records Decision No. 643, we determined for purposes of section 21.355, the word “teacher” means a person who is required to and does in fact hold a teaching certificate under subchapter B of chapter 21 of the Education Code and who is in the process of teaching, as that term is commonly defined, at the time of the evaluation. *See id.* at 4. We also determined for purposes of section 21.355, an “administrator” means a person who is required to, and does in fact, hold an administrator’s certificate under subchapter B of chapter 21 of the Education Code, and is performing the functions as an administrator, as that term is commonly defined, at the time of the evaluation. *Id.*

You assert the information you marked is confidential under section 21.355 of the Education Code. You provide documentation showing the individual at issue held the appropriate certification under chapter 21 of the Education Code at the time the information at issue was created. Upon review, we find some of the information you marked consists of evaluations of a teacher’s or administrator’s performance as contemplated by section 21.355. Accordingly, the district must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 21.355 of the Education Code.<sup>2</sup> However, we find the district has failed to demonstrate the remaining information at issue consists of documents evaluating the performance of a teacher or administrator for purposes of section 21.355 of the Education Code. Therefore, the district may not withhold any of the remaining information at issue under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 21.355 of the Education Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by section 21.048 of the Education Code, which addresses teacher certification examinations. Section 21.048(c-1) provides as follows:

The results of an examination administered under this section are confidential and are not subject to disclosure under [the Act], unless the disclosure is regarding notification to a parent of the assignment of an uncertified teacher to a classroom as required by Section 21.057.

Educ. Code § 21.048(c-1). Upon review, we find the information we marked consists of certification exam results of a teacher for the district. We have no indication section 21.057 of the Education Code is applicable in this instance. Accordingly, the district must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 21.048 of the Education Code.

---

<sup>2</sup> As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address the remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

Section 552.102(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy.” Gov’t Code § 552.102(a). The Texas Supreme Court held section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure the dates of birth of state employees in the payroll database of the Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts. *Tex. Comptroller of Pub. Accounts v. Attorney Gen. of Tex.*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). Thus, under *Texas Comptroller*, section 552.102(a) is applicable to the birth date of an employee of a governmental body in a record maintained by his or her employer in an employment context. Accordingly, the district must withhold the former employee’s date of birth in the remaining information under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code.

Section 552.102(b) of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure “a transcript from an institution of higher education maintained in the personnel file of a professional public school employee[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.102(b). However, section 552.102(b) does not except from public disclosure the employee’s name, “the degree obtained[, ] or the curriculum on a transcript in the personnel file of the employee.” *Id.*; see also Open Records Decision No. 526 (1989). Accordingly, with the exception of the employee’s name, courses taken, and degrees obtained, the district must withhold the submitted college transcripts, which we marked, pursuant to section 552.102(b) of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. This office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. See Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). Additionally, this office has found that common-law privacy generally protects the identifying information of juvenile victims of abuse or neglect. See Open Records Decision No. 394 (1983); cf. Fam. Code § 261.201. We note, however, the public generally has a legitimate interest in information relating to public employment and public employees. See Open Records Decision Nos. 562 at 10 (1990) (personnel file information does not involve most intimate aspects of human affairs, but in fact touches on matters of legitimate public concern), 470 at 4 (1987) (public has legitimate interest in job qualifications and performance of public employees), 423 at 2 (1984) (scope of public employee privacy is narrow).

Upon review, we find some of the remaining information satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, the district must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we find you have failed to demonstrate any of the remaining information is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate

public concern. Therefore, none of the remaining information may be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure the home address and telephone number, emergency contact information, social security number, and family member information of a current or former employee or official of a governmental body who requests this information be kept confidential under section 552.024 of the Government Code, except as provided by section 552.024(a-1). *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.117(a)(1), .024. Section 552.024(a-1) of the Government Code provides, “[a] school district may not require an employee or former employee of the district to choose whether to allow public access to the employee’s or former employee’s social security number.” *Id.* § 552.024(a-1). Thus, the district may only withhold under section 552.117 the home address and telephone number, emergency contact information, and family member information of a current or former employee or official of the district who requests this information be kept confidential under section 552.024. We note section 552.117 is also applicable to personal cellular telephone numbers, provided the cellular telephone service is not paid for by a governmental body. *See* Open Records Decision No. 506 at 5-6 (1988) (section 552.117 is not applicable to cellular telephone numbers paid for by governmental body and intended for official use). Whether a particular item of information is protected by section 552.117(a)(1) must be determined at the time of the governmental body’s receipt of the request for the information. *See* Open Records Decision No. 530 at 5 (1989). Thus, information may be withheld under section 552.117(a)(1) only on behalf of a current or former employee or official who made a request for confidentiality under section 552.024 prior to the date of the governmental body’s receipt of the request for the information. Information may not be withheld under section 552.117(a)(1) on behalf of a current or former employee or official who did not timely request under section 552.024 the information be kept confidential. Accordingly, to the extent the individual at issue timely requested confidentiality under section 552.024 of the Government Code, the district must withhold the information we marked under section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code; however, the district may only withhold the marked cellular telephone numbers if the cellular telephone service is not paid for by a governmental body.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure information relating to a motor vehicle operator’s or driver’s license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country.<sup>3</sup> *See* Gov’t Code § 552.130. Accordingly, we find the district must withhold the motor vehicle record information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.137 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body[.]” unless the member of the public consents to its release or the

---

<sup>3</sup> The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470.

e-mail address is of a type specifically excluded by subsection (c). *Id.* § 552.137(a)-(c). The e-mail address at issue is not excluded by subsection (c). Accordingly, the district must withhold the e-mail addresses we marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owners affirmatively consent to their public disclosure.

Section 552.147(a-1) of the Government Code provides, “[t]he social security number of an employee of a school district in the custody of the district is confidential.” *See id.* § 552.147(a-1). Thus, section 552.147(a-1) makes the social security numbers of school district employees confidential, without such employees being required to first make a confidentiality election under section 552.024 of the Government Code. *Id.* § 552.024(a-1) (school district may not require employee or former employee of district to choose whether to allow public access to employee’s or former employee’s social security number). Reading sections 552.024(a-1) and 552.147(a-1) together, we conclude section 552.147(a-1) makes confidential the social security numbers of both current and former school district employees. Accordingly, the district must withhold the social security numbers we marked under section 552.147(a-1) of the Government Code.

In summary, the district must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1324a of title 8 of the United States Code. The district must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 21.355 of the Education Code. The district must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 21.048 of the Education Code. The district must withhold the former employee’s date of birth in the remaining information under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code. With the exception of the employee’s name, courses taken, and degrees obtained, the district must withhold the submitted college transcripts pursuant to section 552.102(b) of the Government Code. The district must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. To the extent the individual at issue timely requested confidentiality under section 552.024 of the Government Code, the district must withhold the information we marked under section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code; however, the district may only withhold the marked cellular telephone numbers if the cellular telephone service is not paid for by a governmental body. The district must withhold the motor vehicle record information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The district must withhold the e-mail addresses we marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owners affirmatively consent to their public disclosure. The district must withhold the social security numbers we marked under section 552.147(a-1) of the Government Code. The district must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and

responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

James M. Graham  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

JMG/jm

Ref: ID# 941691

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)