



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

April 13, 2022

Mr. Joe Zapata  
Administrative Manager  
City of Houston  
1200 Travis, 10<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Houston, Texas 77002-6000

OR2022-10829

Dear Mr. Zapata:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 941989 (Ref. No. P02421-012422).

The Houston Police Department (the "department") received a request for certain information pertaining to a specified accident. You state some of the requested information does not exist.<sup>1</sup> You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.103, and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information, some of which is a representative sample.<sup>2</sup>

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes. You state the City of Houston is a civil service city under chapter 143 of the Local Government Code. Section 143.1214 of the Local Government Code provides in relevant part:

---

<sup>1</sup> The Act does not require a governmental body to release information that did not exist when a request for information was received or to prepare new information in response to a request. *See Econ. Opportunities Dev. Corp. v. Bustamante*, 562 S.W.2d 266, 267-68 (Tex. Civ. App.—San Antonio 1978, writ dismissed); Open Records Decision Nos. 605 at 2 (1992), 452 at 3 (1986), 362 at 2 (1983).

<sup>2</sup> We assume that the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

(b) The department shall maintain an investigatory file that relates to a disciplinary action against a fire fighter or police officer that was overturned on appeal, or any document in the possession of the department that relates to a charge of misconduct against a fire fighter or police officer, regardless of whether the charge is sustained, only in a file created by the department for the department's use. The department may only release information in those investigatory files or documents relating to a charge of misconduct:

- (1) to another law enforcement agency or fire department;
- (2) to the office of a district or United States attorney; or
- (3) in accordance with Subsection (c).

(c) The department head or the department head's designee may forward a document that relates to disciplinary action against a fire fighter or police officer to the director or the director's designee for inclusion in the fire fighter's or police officer's personnel file maintained under Sections 143.089(a)-(f) only if:

- (1) disciplinary action was actually taken against the fire fighter or police officer;
- (2) the document shows the disciplinary action taken; and
- (3) the document includes at least a brief summary of the facts on which the disciplinary action was based.

Local Gov't Code § 143.1214(b)-(c). You state the submitted information is maintained in the department's internal investigative files and relates to investigations by the department of alleged misconduct by department officers. You also state the requestor is not a representative from another law enforcement agency, a fire department, or the office of a district or United States attorney. *See id.* § 143.1214(b)(1)-(2). Thus, based on your representations and our review, we conclude, with the exception of the CR-3 accident report, the department must withhold Exhibit 4 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 143.1214 of the Local Government Code.<sup>3</sup> However, we note the CR-3 accident report is maintained independently from the police officer's internal file. Further, we note Exhibits 2, 3, and 5 consist of videos, photos, and claim information which is also maintained independently from the police officer's internal file. In this instance, the requestor has specifically requested this information, which is maintained for law enforcement purposes separate and apart from any internal files. The department may

---

<sup>3</sup> As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure.

not engraft the confidentiality afforded to records under section 143.1214 to records that exist independently of the internal files. Accordingly, the remaining information is not confidential under section 143.1214 of the Local Government Code, and the department may not withhold it under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

As noted above, Exhibit 4 contains a CR-3 accident report form completed pursuant to chapter 550 of the Transportation Code. Section 550.065 applies only to a written report of an accident required under section 550.061, 550.062, or 601.004. Transp. Code § 550.065(a)(1). Chapter 550 requires the creation of a written report when the accident resulted in injury to or the death of a person or damage to the property of any person to the apparent extent of \$1,000 or more. *Id.* §§ 550.061 (operator's accident report), .062 (officer's accident report). An accident report is privileged and for the confidential use of the Texas Department of Transportation or a local governmental agency of Texas that has use for the information for accident prevention purposes. *Id.* § 550.065(b). However, a governmental entity shall release an accident report in accordance with subsections (c) and (c-1). *Id.* § 550.065(c), (c-1). Section 550.065(c) provides a governmental entity shall release an accident report to a person or entity listed under this subsection. *Id.* § 550.065(c).

Here, the requestor is a person listed under section 550.065(c). Thus, the department must release the CR-3 accident report to this requestor pursuant to section 550.065(c) of the Transportation Code. Although the department asserts sections 552.103 and 552.108 to withhold the information, a statutory right of access prevails over the Act's general exceptions to public disclosure. *See, e.g.,* Open Records Decision Nos. 613 at 4 (1993) (exceptions in Act cannot impinge on statutory right of access to information), 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exception to disclosure under the Act). Because sections 552.103 and 552.108 are general exceptions under the Act, the requestor's statutory access under section 550.065(c) prevails and the department may not withhold the information under section 552.103 or section 552.108 of the Government Code. Thus, the department must release the accident report to the requestor pursuant to section 550.065(c).

Section 552.108(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime." Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state Exhibits 2, 3, and 5 relate to an ongoing investigation, and release of that information would interfere with the investigation and prosecution of the case. Based upon this representation, we conclude the release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the information at issue.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure “basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime.” Gov’t Code § 552.108(c). Section 552.108(c) refers to the basic information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. See 531 S.W.2d at 186-187; see also Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Accordingly, with the exception of basic information, the department may withhold Exhibits 2, 3, and 5 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.<sup>4</sup>

In summary, with the exception of the CR-3 accident report, the department must withhold Exhibit 4 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 143.1214 of the Local Government Code. The department must release the CR-3 accident report to the requestor pursuant to section 550.065(c) of the Transportation Code. With the exception of basic information, which must be released, the department may withhold Exhibits 2, 3, and 5 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Emily Kunst  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

EK/jxd

---

<sup>4</sup> As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure for this information, except to note basic information described in *Houston Chronicle* is generally not excepted from public disclosure under section 552.103 of the Government Code. Open Records Decision No. 597 (1991). Further, we do not address the applicability of section 1701.661(a) of the Occupations Code to the submitted video recordings. See generally Occ. Code § 1701.661(a), (e).

Mr. Joe Zapata - Page 5

Ref: ID# 941989

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)