



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

April 11, 2022

Mr. Justin Smith
Records Division
North Richland Hills Police Department
P.O. Box 820609
North Richland Hills, Texas 76182-0609

OR2022-10556

Dear Mr. Smith:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 941314 (ORR# W008950).

The North Richland Hills Police Department (the "department") received a request for a specified incident report.¹ The department claims the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the claimed exception and reviewed the submitted information.

The submitted information concerns an alleged violation of section 32.51 of the Penal Code. Section 32.51(b)(1) provides "[a] person commits an offense if the person, with the intent to harm or defraud another, obtains, possesses, transfers, or uses an item of . . . identifying information of another person without the other person's consent or effective consent[.]" Penal Code § 32.51(b). Article 2.29 of the Code of Criminal Procedure pertains to alleged violations of section 32.51 that occurred on or after September 1, 2005, and provides as follows:

(a) A peace officer to whom an alleged violation of Section 32.51, Penal Code, is reported shall make a written report to the law enforcement

¹ We note the department received a prior request for the same information from this requestor. In response to the initial request, the department informs us it responded to the requestor within five business days and then withheld certain information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code, pursuant to the previous determination this office issued to the department in Open Records Letter No. 2017-10552 (2017). Subsequently, the requestor made a second request for the same information on January 24, 2022.

agency that employs the peace officer that includes the following information:

- (1) the name of the victim;
- (2) the name of the suspect, if known;
- (3) the type of identifying information obtained, possessed, transferred, or used in violation of Section 32.51, Penal Code; and
- (4) the results of any investigation.

(b) On the victim's request, the law enforcement agency shall provide the report created under Subsection (a) to the victim. In providing the report, the law enforcement agency shall redact any otherwise confidential information that is included in the report, other than the information described by Subsection (a).

Crim. Proc. Code art. 2.29. For purposes of article 2.29, an offense is committed on or after September 1, 2005, if no "element of the offense occurs before that date." Act of Jun. 17, 2005, 79th Leg., R.S., ch. 294, § 1(b), 2005 Tex. Gen. Laws 885. The requestor is the victim and the alleged offense occurred after September 1, 2005. Therefore, the information at issue is subject to article 2.29 of the Code of Criminal Procedure and must be released to the requestor, except to the extent the information is confidential. Crim. Proc. Code art. 2.29(b). Section 552.108 of the Government Code does not make information confidential. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 586 (1991) (governmental body may waive section 552.108). Thus, the department may not withhold the submitted information from this requestor under section 552.108 of the Government Code. However, because sections 552.136 and 552.137 of the Government Code are confidentiality provisions, we will address their applicability to this information.²

Section 552.136(b) of the Government Code provides, "[n]otwithstanding any other provision of this chapter, a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential." Gov't Code § 552.136(b). The department must withhold the submitted bank account numbers under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

Section 552.137 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body" unless the member of the public consents to its release or the e-mail address is of a type specifically excluded by subsection (c). *See id.* § 552.137(a)-(c). The remaining information contains an e-mail address of a member of the public that does not

² The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 at 2 (1987), 480 at 5 (1987).

appear to be of a type specifically excluded by section 552.137(c), and the department does not inform us a member of the public has affirmatively consented to its release. Therefore, the department must withhold the e-mail address of a member of the public in the remaining information under section 552.137 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must withhold the submitted bank account numbers under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The department must also withhold the e-mail address of a member of the public in the remaining information under section 552.137 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

James L. Coggeshall
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JLC/mo

Ref: ID# 941314

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)