



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

March 23, 2022

Ms. Alicia K. Kreh
Counsel for the Town of Flower Mound
Taylor, Olson, Adkins, Sralla, Elam, L.L.P.
6000 Western Place, Suite 200
Fort Worth, Texas 76107

OR2022-08310

Dear Ms. Kreh:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 938375.

The Flower Mound Police Department (the "department"), which you represent, received a request for information pertaining to a named individual. The department claims some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the claimed exceptions and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses section 58.008(b) of the Family Code, which provides as follows:

Except as provided by Subsection (c), law enforcement records concerning a child and information concerning a child that are stored by electronic means or otherwise and from which a record could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

- (1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as adult records, accessible only under controls that are separate and distinct from the controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subsection (c) or Subchapter B, D, or E.

Fam. Code § 58.008(b); *see also id.* § 51.03(a)-(b) (defining “delinquent conduct” and “conduct indicating a need for supervision” for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). Section 58.008(b) is applicable to records of juvenile conduct that occurred before, on, or after September 1, 2017. *See* Act of May 28, 2017, 85th Leg., R.S., ch. 746, § 22. The juvenile must have been at least ten years old and less than seventeen years of age when the conduct occurred. *See* Fam. Code § 51.02(2) (defining “child” for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). Upon review, we find report numbers 12009219, 12013955, 12022073, and 13009657 involve juvenile offenders, so as to fall within the scope of that section. The exceptions in section 58.008 do not appear to apply. Therefore, the department must generally withhold these reports under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.008(b) of the Family Code.¹ The remaining information is not confidential under section 58.008(b), and the department may not withhold it under section 552.101 on that ground.

However, we understand the requestor is conducting a background investigation of the named individual for an employment position of national security or public trust on behalf of the Defense Counterintelligence and Security Agency (“DCSA”). Executive Order Number 13869 transfers the responsibility of background investigations from the Office of Personnel Management to the Department of Defense (“DoD”). Executive Order No. 13869. The DCSA is a component of the DoD and is the primary federal entity responsible for conducting background investigation for the federal government. Exec. Order No. 13869, § 2(c)(i), (iii). As a component of a covered agency, the DCSA has a right of access to the criminal history record information (“CHRI”) of state and local criminal justice agencies when it receives the consent of the individual being investigated for release of such information. *See* 5 U.S.C. § 9101(b)(1), (c); *id.* § 9101(a)(6)(A) (defining “covered agency” to include DoD). CHRI is defined as “information collected by criminal justice agencies on individuals consisting of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, indictments, informations, or other formal criminal charges, and any disposition arising therefrom, sentencing, correction supervision and release[,]” but does not include “identification information such as fingerprint records to the extent that such information does not indicate involvement in the criminal justice system.” *Id.* § 9101(a)(2). We note the submitted Federal Bureau of Investigation (“FBI”) number constitutes CHRI generated by the FBI.

¹ As our ruling is dispositive, we do not address the other arguments of the department to withhold this information.

Federal law provides DCSA's right of access to CHRI preempts state confidentiality provisions. *Id.* § 9101(b)(4) (section 9101 "shall apply notwithstanding any other provision of law of any State"). However, federal law also provides DCSA's right of access is contingent on receiving written consent from the individual under investigation for the release of such CHRI. *See* 5 U.S.C. § 9101(c). The requestor has submitted written consent from the named individual for the release of that individual's CHRI. Federal law provides the DCSA's right of access to CHRI preempts state confidentiality provisions. *Id.* § 9101(b)(4) (section 9101 "shall apply notwithstanding any other provision of law of any State"). Accordingly, we conclude the DCSA has a right of access to this individual's CHRI in the submitted documents. Thus, the department must release the named individual's CHRI, including his FBI number. The department must withhold the remaining information in report numbers 12009219, 12013955, 12022073, and 13009657 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.008(b) of the Family Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 261.201(a) of the Family Code, which provides as follows:

[T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act], and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

- (1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and
- (2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). Upon review, we find report number 12010352 was used or developed in an investigation under chapter 261. *See id.* §§ 101.003(a) (defining "child" for purposes of section 261.201), 261.001(1), (4) (defining "abuse" and "neglect" for purposes of section 261.201). Thus, the information is within the scope of section 261.201 of the Family Code. The department does not indicate it has adopted a rule that governs the release of this type of information. Therefore, we assume no such rule exists. Accordingly, the department must withhold report number 12010352 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. *See* Open Records Decision No. 440 at 2 (1986) (predecessor statute).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered

intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in the *Industrial Foundation* decision. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). The Third Court of Appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). The department must withhold the submitted dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. We also find some of the remaining information, which we have marked, satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in the *Industrial Foundation* decision. Accordingly, the department must also withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, the remaining information is not confidential under common-law privacy, and the department may not withhold it under section 552.101 on that ground.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Upon review, we find section 552.130 is not applicable to some of the information that the department seeks to withhold under that section. Thus, the department may not withhold this information, which we have marked for release, under section 552.130. Nevertheless, we agree the department must withhold the remaining information it has marked on that ground.

In summary, the department must release the submitted CHRI of the named individual, including his FBI number, pursuant to federal law. The department must withhold the following: (1) the remaining information in report numbers 12009219, 12013955, 12022073, and 13009657 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.008(b) of the Family Code; (2) report number 12010352 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code; (3) the submitted dates of birth and the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy; and (3) with the exception of the information we have marked for release, the information it has marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.²

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open

² Because the requestor has a special right of access to some of the information being released, the department must again seek a decision from this office if it receives a request for the same information from another requestor.

Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

James L. Coggeshall
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JLC/jm

Ref: ID# 938375

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)