



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

March 16, 2022

Mr. James Wang
Legal Counsel
Harris County Appraisal District
Post Office Box 920975
Houston, Texas 77292-0975

OR2022-07749

Dear Mr. Wang:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 936072 (Ref. No. 21-6061).

The Harris County Appraisal District (the "district") received a request for information regarding a specified address during a certain date range. You claim some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.136, 552.147, and 552.149 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). This office has also found personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 600 (1992) (employee's designation of retirement beneficiary, choice of insurance carrier, election of optional coverages, direct deposit authorization, forms allowing employee to allocate pretax compensation to group insurance, health care or dependent care), 523 (1989) (common-law privacy protects credit reports, financial statements, and other personal financial information), 373 (1983) (sources of income not related to financial transaction between individual and governmental body protected under

common-law privacy). The court of appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). Accordingly, the district must withhold the public citizen's date of birth you marked and the additional information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.136(b) of the Government Code provides, “[n]otwithstanding any other provision of this chapter, a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential.” Gov’t Code § 552.136(b). You state the submitted iFile numbers can be used to access confidential property information of value to property owners and third-party professionals involved in the protests of property tax appraisals. Based on these representations, we conclude the iFile numbers at issue are access device numbers for purposes of section 552.136(a). You also state the requestor is not the owner of the property to which the iFile numbers pertain. *See id.* § 552.023(a) (“[a] person or a person’s authorized representative has a special right of access, beyond the right of the general public, to information held by a governmental body that relates to the person and that is protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person’s privacy interests”); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individuals request information concerning themselves). Accordingly, the district must withhold the submitted iFile numbers under section 552.136(b) of the Government Code.

Section 552.147 of the Government Code provides that “[t]he social security number of a living person is excepted from” required public disclosure under the Act. Gov’t Code § 552.147(a). Accordingly, the district may withhold the social security number you marked under section 552.147(a).

Section 552.149 of the Government Code provides, in relevant part, the following:

(a) Information relating to real property sales prices, descriptions, characteristics, and other related information received from a private entity by the comptroller or the chief appraiser of an appraisal district under Chapter 6, Tax Code, is excepted from the requirements of [the Act].

(b) Notwithstanding Subsection (a), the property owner or the owner’s agent may, on request, obtain from the chief appraiser of the applicable appraisal district a copy of each item of information described by Section 41.461 (a)(2), Tax Code, and a copy of each item of information that the chief appraiser took into consideration but does not plan to introduce at the hearing on the protest. In addition, the property owner or agent may, on request, obtain from the chief appraiser comparable sales data from a reasonable number of sales that is relevant to any matter to be determined by the appraisal review board at the hearing on the property owner’s protest[.]

Id. § 552.149(a)-(b). You state the information you marked under section 552.149 pertains to real property sales prices, descriptions, characteristics, and other related information received from a private entity. You also state the requestor does not have a right of access to the information at issue pursuant to section 552.149(b). *See id.* § 552.149(b). Based on your representations and our review, we find the district must withhold the information you marked under section 552.149(a) of the Government Code.

In summary, the district must withhold the public citizen's date of birth you marked and the additional information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The district must withhold the submitted iFile numbers under section 552.136(b) of the Government Code. The district may withhold the social security number you marked under section 552.147(a) of the Government Code. The district must withhold the information you marked under section 552.149(a) of the Government Code. The district must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Chase D. Young
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CDY/jxd

Ref: ID# 936072

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)