



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

March 14, 2022

Mr. Robert Gervais
City Attorney
City of Manvel
P.O. Box 187
Manvel, Texas 77578

OR2022-07548

Dear Mr. Gervais:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 937377 (Reference Nos. PIR 21-223, PIR 21-224, PIR 22-004, and PIR 22-008).

The Manvel Police Department (the "department") received four requests from different requestors for information pertaining to a specified incident.¹ The department states it will redact certain information pursuant to sections 552.136(b) and 552.147(b) of the Government Code.² You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

¹ We note the department sought and received clarification of the information requested from one of the requestors. *See* Gov't Code § 552.222 (providing if request for information is unclear, governmental body may ask requestor to clarify request); *see also* *City of Dallas v. Abbott*, 304 S.W.3d 380, 387 (Tex. 2010) (holding when governmental entity, acting in good faith, requests clarification of unclear or overbroad request for public information, ten-business-day period to request attorney general opinion is measured from date request is clarified or narrowed)

² Section 552.136 of the Government Code permits a governmental body to withhold the information described in section 552.136(b) without the necessity of seeking a decision from this office. *See* Gov't Code § 552.136(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.136(e). *See id.* § 552.136(d), (e). Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office. *See id.* § 552.147(b).

Initially, we note the information at issue contains CR-3 accident reports that are subject to chapter 550 of the Transportation Code. Section 550.065 of the Transportation Code applies only to a written report of an accident required under section 550.061, 550.062, or 601.004. *See* Transp. Code § 550.065(a)(1). Chapter 550 requires the creation of a written report when the accident resulted in injury to or the death of a person or damage to the property of any person to the apparent extent of \$1,000 or more. *Id.* §§ 550.061 (operator's accident report), .062 (officer's accident report). An accident report is privileged and for the confidential use of the Texas Department of Transportation or a local governmental agency of Texas that has use for the information for accident prevention purposes. *Id.* § 550.065(b). However, a governmental entity shall release an accident report in accordance with subsections (c) and (c-1). *Id.* § 550.065(c), (c-1). Section 550.065(c) provides a governmental entity shall release an accident report to a person or entity listed under this subsection. *Id.* § 550.065(c).

In this instance, the requestors are persons listed under section 550.065(c). Although you assert section 552.108 of the Government Code for this information, a statutory right of access prevails over the Act's general exceptions to public disclosure. *See, e.g.,* Open Records Decision Nos. 613 at 4 (1993) (exceptions in Act cannot impinge on statutory right of access to information), 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exception to disclosure under the Act). Because this section is a general exception under the Act, the requestor's statutory access under section 550.065(c) prevails and the department may not withhold the information at issue under section 552.108 of the Government Code. The department also raises section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy for the CR-3 accident reports. However, because a statutory right of access prevails over the common law, no portion of the CR-3 accident reports may be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code on the basis of common-law privacy. *See CenterPoint Energy Houston Elec. LLC v. Harris County Toll Rd. Auth.*, 436 F.3d 541, 544 (5th Cir. 2006) (common law controls only where there is no conflicting or controlling statutory law); *Collins v. Tex Mall, L.P.*, 297 S.W.3d 409, 415 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2009, no pet.) (statutory provision controls and preempts common law only when statute directly conflicts with common law principle).

Additionally, we understand you to assert section 552.130 of the Government Code for the motor vehicle record information contained in the CR-3 accident reports. As noted above, a statutory right of access generally prevails over the Act's general exceptions to disclosure. *See, e.g.,* ORDs 613 at 4, 451. However, because section 552.130 has its own access provisions, we conclude section 552.130 is not a general exception under the Act. Thus, we must address the conflict between the confidentiality provided under section 552.130 of the Government Code and the right of access provided under section 550.065(c) of the Transportation Code for the accident report. Where information falls within both a general and a specific provision of law, the specific provision prevails over the general. *See Horizon/CMS Healthcare Corp. v. Auld*, 34 S.W.3d 887, 901 (Tex. 2000) ("more specific statute controls over the more general"); *Cuellar v. State*, 521 S.W.2d 211 (Tex. Crim. App. 1975) (under well-established rule of statutory construction, specific statutory provisions prevail over general ones); Open Records Decision Nos. 598 (1991), 583 (1990), 451. Section 550.065(c) specifically provides access only to accident reports of the type at issue, while section 552.130 generally excepts motor vehicle record information maintained in

any context. Thus, we conclude the access to the accident reports provided under section 550.065(c) is more specific than the general confidentiality provided under section 552.130. Therefore, the department may not withhold any portion of the information at issue under section 552.130. Accordingly, the department must release the CR-3 accident reports to these requestors pursuant to section 550.065(c) of the Transportation Code.

Next, we note the remaining information contains court-filed documents subject to section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code. Section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code provides for required public disclosure of “information that is also contained in a public court record,” unless the information is made confidential under the Act or other law. Gov’t Code § 552.022(a)(17). Although you seek to withhold this information under section 552.108 of the Government Code, this section is a discretionary exception and does not make information confidential under the Act. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions), 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to Gov’t Code § 552.108 subject to waiver). Therefore, the department may not withhold the court-filed documents we marked under section 552.108 of the Government Code. We also note common-law privacy is not applicable to information contained in public court records. *See Austin Chronicle Corp. v. City of Austin*, No. 03-08-00596-CV, 2009 WL 483232 (Tex. App.—Austin Feb. 24, 2009, no pet.) (mem. op., not designated for publication); *see also Cox Broadcasting Corp. v. Cohn*, 420 U.S. 496 (1975) (action for invasion of privacy cannot be maintained where information is in public domain); *Star-Telegram v. Walker*, 834 S.W.2d 54 (Tex. 1992) (law cannot recall information once in public domain). Therefore, the department may not withhold any information contained in the marked court-filed documents under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, you also raise section 552.130, which makes information confidential under the Act. Therefore, we will address the applicability of section 552.130 to the information subject to section 552.022(a)(17).

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime.” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state the information at issue pertains to a pending criminal investigation. We note, however, the information at issue includes a DIC-24 Statutory Warning, a copy of which was provided to the individual at issue. You have not explained how releasing this information, which has already been seen by the individual, would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). Therefore, the DIC-24 form may not be withheld under section 552.108(a)(1). However, based on your representations and our review, we conclude the release of the remaining information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are

present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the remaining information at issue.

However, we note section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. See 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; see also Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). We note basic information does not include dates of birth or motor vehicle record information encompassed by section 552.130 of the Government Code. See ORD 127 at 3-4. Accordingly, with the exception of the DIC-24 form and the basic information, the department may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.³

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. The court of appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). Thus, the department must withhold date of birth we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information you marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must release the CR-3 accident reports to these requestors pursuant to section 550.065(c) of the Transportation Code. The department must release the court-filed documents we marked pursuant to section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code. With the exception of the DIC-24 form and the basic information, which must be released, the department may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. In releasing the DIC-24 form, the department must withhold the date of birth we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy and the motor vehicle record information you marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. In releasing the court-filed documents the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information you marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

³ As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure of this information. Further, we need not address the applicability of section 1701.661(a) of the Occupations Code to the submitted video recordings. See generally Occ. Code § 1701.661(a), (e).

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Jennifer Copeland
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JC/jxd

Ref: ID# 937377

Enc. Submitted documents

c: 4 Requestors
(w/o enclosures)