



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

March 10, 2022

Mr. Jason Sorensen
Assistant County Attorney
Kerr County
700 Main Street, Suite BA-103
Kerrville, Texas 78028

OR2022-07257

Dear Mr. Sorensen:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 934216.

The Kerr County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff's office") received a request for information pertaining to a specified case involving the requestor. You state the sheriff's office has released some information to the requestor. You claim some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the submitted information includes a grand jury subpoena and information obtained pursuant to a grand jury subpoena. The judiciary is expressly excluded from the requirements of the Act. Gov't Code § 552.003(1)(B). This office has determined, for purposes of the Act, a grand jury is a part of the judiciary and, therefore, not subject to the Act. *See* Open Records Decision No. 411 (1984). Further, records kept by a governmental body that is acting as an agent for a grand jury are considered records in the constructive possession of the grand jury and are also not subject to the Act. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 513 (1988), 411, 398 (1983). The fact that information collected or prepared by another person or entity is submitted to the grand jury does not necessarily mean such information is in the grand jury's constructive possession when the same information also is held in the other person's or entity's own capacity. Information held by another person or entity but not produced at the direction of the grand jury may well be protected under one of the Act's specific exceptions to disclosure, but such information is not excluded from the reach of the Act by the judiciary exclusion. *See* ORD 513. Thus, to the extent the sheriff's office holds the submitted grand jury records solely as an agent of the grand jury, such information consists of records of the judiciary that are not subject to disclosure under

the Act and the sheriff's office is not required to release it in response to the present request.¹ To the extent the sheriff's office holds the information at issue in its own capacity and not solely as an agent of the grand jury, we will address your argument against disclosure of this information.

Next, we note the information at issue involves an alleged violation of section 32.51 of the Penal Code, which provides, “[a] person commits an offense if the person, with the intent to harm or defraud another, obtains, possesses, transfers, or uses an item of . . . identifying information of another person without the other person's consent[.]” Penal Code § 32.51(b)(1). For purposes of section 32.51, “identifying information” includes an individual's name and financial institution account number. *Id.* § 32.51(a)(1)(A), (C). Article 2.29 of the Code of Criminal Procedure pertains to alleged violations of section 32.51 that occurred on or after September 1, 2005, and provides:

(a) A peace officer to whom an alleged violation of Section 32.51, Penal Code, is reported shall make a written report to the law enforcement agency that employs the peace officer that includes the following information:

- (1) the name of the victim;
- (2) the name of the suspect, if known;
- (3) the type of identifying information obtained, possessed, transferred, or used in violation of Section 32.51, Penal Code; and
- (4) the results of any investigation.

(b) On the victim's request, the law enforcement agency shall provide the report created under Subsection (a) to the victim. In providing the report, the law enforcement agency shall redact any otherwise confidential information that is included in the report, other than the information described by Subsection (a).

Crim. Proc. Code art. 2.29. For purposes of article 2.29, an offense is committed on or after September 1, 2005, if no “element of the offense occurs before that date.” Act of Jun. 17, 2005, 79th Leg., R.S., ch. 294, § 1(b), 2005.

In this instance, the information at issue pertains to an allegation of credit card abuse, which constitutes an alleged violation of section 32.51. We note the requestor is the victim of the alleged identity theft listed in the report, and the alleged offense occurred after September 1, 2005. Thus, report number 2021-03401 is subject to article 2.29 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. *See* Crim. Proc. Code art. 2.29. Although the sheriff's office seeks to withhold some of the information at issue under section 552.108, this exception does not make information confidential. Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 586 (1991) (governmental body may waive section 552.108).

¹ In that instance, as we are able to make this determination, we need not address your argument against disclosure of this information.

Therefore, the sheriff's office may not withhold any portion of report number 2021-03401 under section 552.108 of the Government Code. However, because sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code make information confidential, we will address their applicability to the report at issue.² Additionally, we will address your argument under section 552.108 of the Government Code against disclosure of the remaining information.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime.” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state the information you indicated pertains to an ongoing criminal investigation. Based on your representations and our review, we conclude the release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Accordingly, with the exception of the information subject to article 2.29 of the Criminal Code, which we have marked, the sheriff's office may withhold the remainder of the information you indicated under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. This section encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. The Third Court of Appeals has concluded public citizens’ dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). However, we note the requestor has a right of access to information pertaining to himself that would otherwise be confidential under common-law privacy. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.023 (person or person’s authorized representative has special right of access to records that contain information relating to the person that are protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person’s privacy interests); ORD 481 at 4 (privacy theories not implicated when individual requests information concerning himself). Accordingly, with the exception of the requestor’s date of birth, the sheriff's office must withhold the dates of birth within the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure information relating to a motor vehicle operator’s or driver’s license, motor vehicle title or registration,

² The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. We note section 552.130 is designed to protect the privacy of individuals. Thus, the requestor has a right of access to his own motor vehicle record information, and it may not be withheld from him under section 552.130. *See id.* § 552.023; ORD 481 at 4. Accordingly, the sheriff's office must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, to the extent the sheriff's office holds the submitted grand jury records solely as an agent of the grand jury, such information consists of records of the judiciary that are not subject to disclosure under the Act and the sheriff's office is not required to release it in response to the present request. With the exception of the information subject to article 2.29 of the Criminal Code, which we have marked and which must generally be released, the sheriff's office may withhold the remainder of the information you indicated under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. With the exception of the requestor's date of birth, the sheriff's office must withhold the dates of birth within the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The sheriff's office must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The sheriff's office must release the remaining information to this requestor.³

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Blake Brennan
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

BBX/mo

³ As noted above, the requestor has a special right of access to some of the information being released in this instance. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023(a); ORD 481 at 4. Because such information is confidential with respect to the general public, if the sheriff's office receives another request for this information from a different requestor, the sheriff's office must again seek a ruling from this office. Additionally, we note the remaining information includes social security numbers pertaining to individuals other than the requestor. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. Gov't Code § 552.147(b).

Mr. Jason Sorensen - Page 5

Ref: ID# 934216

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)