



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

March 9, 2022

Mr. Justin Smith  
Manager, Records Division  
North Richland Hills Police Department  
P.O. Box 820609  
North Richland Hills, Texas 76182-0609

OR2022-07080

Dear Mr. Smith:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 933834 (NRHPD ORR# W007472-092321).

The North Richland Hills Police Department (the "department") received a request for the incident report pertaining to a specified case involving the requestor.<sup>1</sup> The department claims the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception the department claims and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the submitted information involves an alleged violation of section 32.51 of the Penal Code, which provides, "[a] person commits an offense if the person, with the intent to harm or defraud another, obtains, possesses, transfers, or uses an item of . . . identifying information of another person without the other person's consent[.]" Penal Code § 32.51(b)(1). For purposes of section 32.51, "identifying information" includes an individual's name and financial institution account number. *Id.* § 32.51(a)(1)(A), (C). Article 2.29 of the Code of Criminal Procedure pertains to alleged violations of section 32.51 that occurred on or after September 1, 2005, and provides:

(a) A peace officer to whom an alleged violation of Section 32.51, Penal Code, is reported shall make a written report to the law enforcement agency that employs the peace officer that includes the following information:

---

<sup>1</sup> We note department received an initial request for the same information from this requestor on June 4, 2021. In response to the initial request, the department informs us it released basic information to the requestor within five business days and withheld certain information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code, pursuant to the previous determination this office issued to the department in Open Records Letter No. 2017-10552 (2017). Subsequently, the requestor made a second request for the same information on December 6, 2021.

- (1) the name of the victim;
- (2) the name of the suspect, if known;
- (3) the type of identifying information obtained, possessed, transferred, or used in violation of Section 32.51, Penal Code; and
- (4) the results of any investigation.

(b) On the victim's request, the law enforcement agency shall provide the report created under Subsection (a) to the victim. In providing the report, the law enforcement agency shall redact any otherwise confidential information that is included in the report, other than the information described by Subsection (a).

Crim. Proc. Code art. 2.29. For purposes of article 2.29, an offense is committed on or after September 1, 2005, if no "element of the offense occurs before that date." Act of Jun. 17, 2005, 79th Leg., R.S., ch. 294, § 1(b).

In this instance, the submitted information pertains to a report of forgery, which constitutes an alleged violation of section 32.51. We note the requestor is the victim of the alleged identity theft listed in the report, and the alleged offense occurred after September 1, 2005. Therefore, the submitted information is subject to article 2.29 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. *See* Crim. Proc. Code art. 2.29. Although the department seeks to withhold the information at issue under section 552.108 of the Government Code, this exception does not make information confidential. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 586 (1991) (governmental body may waive section 552.108). Accordingly, the submitted may not be withheld under section 552.108 of the Government Code from this requestor. However, because sections 552.101, 552.130, and 552.136 of the Government Code make information confidential under the Act, we will consider the applicability of these exceptions to the information at issue.<sup>2</sup>

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. The Third Court of Appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at \*3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). Thus, the department must withhold the public citizen's date of birth we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

---

<sup>2</sup> The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.136 of the Government Code provides, “[n]otwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential.” *Id.* § 552.136(b); *see id.* § 552.136(a) (defining “access device”). Accordingly, the department must withhold the routing, bank account, and credit card numbers we have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must release the submitted information to this requestor pursuant to article 2.29 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. In releasing the submitted information, the department must withhold (1) the public citizen's date of birth we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy, (2) the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code, and (3) the routing, bank account, and credit card numbers we have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Gerald A. Arismendez  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

GAA/be

Ref: ID# 933834

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)