



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

March 4, 2022

Ms. Alicia K. Kreh
Counsel for the Town of Flower Mound
Taylor, Olson, Adkins, Sralla, & Elam, L.L.P.
6000 Western Place, Suite 200
Fort Worth, Texas 76107-4654

OR2022-06563

Dear Ms. Kreh:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 934782.

The Flower Mound Police Department (the "department"), which you represent, received a request for information pertaining to a named individual and specified incident. You state you will redact motor vehicle record information under section 552.130(c) of the Government Code, social security numbers under section 552.147(b) of the Government Code, and information pursuant to Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009).¹ You claim some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.1175 of the Government Code.² We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

¹ Section 552.130(c) of the Government Code allows a governmental body to redact the information described in section 552.130(a) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). *See id.* § 552.130(d), (e). Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office. *See id.* § 552.147(b). Open Records Decision No. 684 is a previous determination issued by this office authorizing all governmental bodies to withhold certain categories of information without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision.

² Although you raise section 552.117 of the Government Code. We note section 552.1175 is the proper exception to raise in this instance because the department does not hold the submitted information in a n employment capacity.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information protected by chapter 411 of the Government Code, which makes confidential criminal history record information (“CHRI”) generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center. *See id.* § 411.083(a). Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual laws with respect to the CHRI it generates. *See id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that the Texas Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except DPS may disseminate this information as provided by chapter 411, subchapter F, or subchapter E-1 of the Government Code. *See Gov’t Code* § 411.083(a). Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purposes. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090-.127. Thus, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with chapter 411, subchapter F, of the Government Code. We note Federal Bureau of Investigation (“FBI”) numbers constitute CHRI generated by the FBI. Upon review, we find portions of the submitted information consist of CHRI that is confidential under section 411.083. Thus, the department must generally withhold the information at issue under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code and federal law.

We note the requestor is a representative of the Federal Bureau of Investigation’s National Instant Criminal Background Check System (“NICS”) and has a right of access to some of the submitted information. Section 411.089(a) of the Government Code provides a criminal justice agency is entitled to obtain from the Texas Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) any CHRI maintained by the DPS about a person. *See Gov’t Code* § 411.089(a); *see also id.* § 411.083(b)(1) (DPS shall grant criminal justice agencies access to CHRI). In addition, section 411.087(a) of the Government Code provides, in part, as follows:

[A] person, agency, department, political subdivision, or other entity that is authorized by this subchapter or Subchapter E-1 to obtain from [DPS CHRI] maintained by [DPS] that relates to another person is authorized to:

...

(2) obtain from any other criminal justice agency in this state [CHRI] maintained by that criminal justice agency that relates to that person.

Id. § 411.087(a)(2). CHRI is defined as “information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions.” *See id.* § 411.082(2). However, a criminal justice agency that receives CHRI from another

criminal justice pursuant to section 411.087(a)(2) may only receive such information for a criminal justice purpose. *See id.* §§ 411.083(c), .087(b); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 655 (1997) (discussing limitations on release of criminal history record information). Thus, to the extent the requestor represents a “criminal justice agency,” the requestor is authorized to obtain CHRI concerning the named individual from the department pursuant to section 411.087(a)(2) of the Government Code, but only for a criminal justice purpose. *See Gov’t Code* §§ 411.083(c), .087(a)(2).

We understand the NICS is a criminal justice agency as defined by section 411.082. *See id.* § 411.082(3)(A). We also understand the information at issue will be used for a criminal justice purpose. Thus, the department must make the CHRI pertaining to the named individual available to the requestor. *See* Open Records Decision No. 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exceptions to disclosure under the Act).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered highly intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. The court of appeals has concluded public citizens’ dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). This office has also found some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). Upon review, we find the information we marked satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Thus, the department must withhold the public citizens’ dates of birth you marked and the additional information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.1175 of the Government Code protects the home address, home telephone number, emergency contact information, date of birth, social security number, and family member information of certain individuals when that information is held by a governmental body in a non-employment capacity and the individual elects to keep the information confidential. Gov’t Code § 552.1175. Section 552.1175 applies, in part, to “a current or former member of the United States Army, Navy, Air Force, Coast Guard, or Marine Corps, an auxiliary service of one of those branches of the armed forces, of the Texas military forces, as that term is defined by Section 437.001[.]” *Id.* § 552.1175(a)(15). Section 552.1175 also encompasses a personal cellular telephone number, unless the cellular telephone service is paid for by a governmental body. *See* Open Records Decision No. 506 at 5-6 (1988) (section 552.117 is not applicable to cellular telephone numbers paid for by governmental body and intended for official use). Thus, to the extent the information we marked pertains to an individual who elects to restrict access to the information in accordance with section 552.1175(b) of the Government Code, the department must withhold the information we marked under section 552.1175 of the Government Code;

however, the cellular telephone number at issue may be withheld only if a governmental body does not pay for the cellular telephone service. Conversely, if the individual does not elect to restrict access to their information in accordance with 552.1175(b), the marked may not withhold the information at issue under section 552.1175.

In summary, the department must withhold the public citizens' dates of birth you marked and the additional information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. To the extent the information we marked pertains to an individual who elects to restrict access to the information in accordance with section 552.1175(b) of the Government Code, the department must withhold the information we marked under section 552.1175 of the Government Code; however, the cellular telephone number at issue may be withheld only if a governmental body does not pay for the cellular telephone service. The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Amy Shipp
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

ALS/mo

Ref: ID# 934782

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)