



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

February 17, 2022

Ms. P. Armstrong
Assistant City Attorney
City of Dallas
1400 Botham Jean Boulevard
Dallas, Texas 75215

OR2022-04816

Dear Ms. Armstrong:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 930829 (ORR# D032032-100221).

The Dallas Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a specified internal affairs investigation. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code.¹ We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses section 58.008 of the Family Code, which provides, in part:

(b) Except as provided by Subsection (c), law enforcement records concerning a child and information concerning a child that are stored by electronic means or otherwise and from which a record could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

¹ We note the department did not comply with section 552.301 of the Government Code in requesting this decision with respect to some of the submitted information. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(b), (e). Nonetheless, because sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code can provide compelling reasons to overcome the presumption of openness, we will consider the applicability of these exceptions to the submitted information. *See id.* §§ 552.007, .302, .352.

- (1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult records;
- (2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as adult records, accessible only under controls that are separate and distinct from the controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and
- (3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subsection (c) or Subchapter B, D, or E.

Fam. Code § 58.008(b); *see also id.* § 51.03(a) (defining “delinquent conduct” for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). Section 58.008(b) is applicable to records of juvenile conduct that occurred before, on, or after September 1, 2017. *See* Act of May 28, 2017, 85th Leg., R.S., ch. 746, § 22. The juvenile must have been at least 10 years old and less than 17 years of age when the conduct occurred. *See* Fam. Code § 51.02(2) (defining “child” for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). You assert a portion of the submitted information is confidential under section 58.008(b) of the Family Code. Upon review, we find some of the submitted information involves a juvenile offender, so as to fall within the scope of section 58.008(b). You state that none of the exceptions in section 58.008 apply. Accordingly, the department must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.008(b) of the Family Code.² However, we find the remaining information consists of internal administrative records that do not constitute juvenile law enforcement records for purposes of section 58.008(b). Therefore, the department may not withhold any portion of the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.008(b) of the Family Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by section 773.091 of the Health and Safety Code, which provides in part:

- (a) A communication between certified emergency medical services [(“EMS”)] personnel or a physician providing medical supervision and a patient that is made in the course of providing emergency medical services to the patient is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.
- (b) Records of the identity, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by emergency medical services personnel or by a physician providing medical supervision that are created by the emergency medical services personnel or physician or maintained by an emergency medical services provider are confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

...

² As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure of this information.

(g) The privilege of confidentiality under this section does not extend to information regarding the presence, nature of injury or illness, age, sex, occupation, and city of residence of a patient who is receiving emergency medical services.

Health & Safety Code § 773.091(a)-(b), (g). Some of the remaining information consists of records made and maintained by EMS personnel. Upon review, we find section 773.091 is applicable to the information at issue. Thus, with the exception of the information subject to section 773.091(g), which is not confidential and must be released, the department must withhold the information you marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 773.091(b) of the Health and Safety Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. The Third Court of Appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). This office has held common-law privacy protects the identity of the juvenile offender. *See* Open Records Decision No. 394 (1983); *cf.* Fam. Code § 58.008(b). Upon review, we find portions of the remaining information satisfy the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, the department must withhold the information we marked and indicated under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we find the department has not demonstrated any of the remaining information at issue is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public concern or it pertains to an individual who is deidentified. Thus, the department may not withhold any portion of the remaining information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information you marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.008(b) of the Family Code. With the exception of the information subject to section 773.091(g), which must be released, the department must withhold the information you marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 773.091(b) of the Health and Safety Code. The department must withhold the information we marked and indicated under

section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the motor vehicle record information you marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.

The department also asks this office to issue a previous determination that would permit it to withhold information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.008 of the Family Code without requesting a ruling from this office. Open Records Decision No. 673 (2001). We decline to issue such a previous determination at this time. Accordingly, this letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

D. Michelle Case
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

DMH/jm

Ref: ID# 930829

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)