



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

February 16, 2022

Mr. Howard S. Slobodin
General Counsel
Trinity River Authority of Texas
P.O. Box 60
Arlington, Texas 76004

OR2022-04639

Dear Mr. Slobodin:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 931304.

The Trinity River Authority of Texas (the "authority") received a request for information pertaining to a specified request for proposals. Although you take no position as to whether the submitted information is excepted under the Act, you state release of the submitted information may implicate the proprietary interests of Alright Solutions, LLC; CentralSquare Technologies, LLC ("Central"); Oracle America, Inc.; Sierra-Cedar, LLC; and Tyler Technologies, Inc. Accordingly, you state, and provide documentation showing, you notified the third parties of the request for information and of the right to submit arguments to this office as to why the submitted information should not be released. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 542 (1990) (statutory predecessor to section 552.305 permits governmental body to rely on interested third party to raise and explain applicability of exception in the Act in certain circumstances). We have received comments from Central. We have considered the submitted arguments and reviewed the submitted information.

An interested third party is allowed ten business days after the date of its receipt of the governmental body's notice to submit its reasons, if any, as to why info relating to that party should not be released. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d)(2)(B). As of the date of this ruling, we have not received comments from any of the remaining third parties. Thus, we have no basis to conclude any of the remaining third parties have a protected proprietary interest in the submitted information. *See, e.g., id.* § 552.110 (requiring the provision of specific factual evidence demonstrating the applicability of the exception). Accordingly, the authority may not withhold any of the submitted information on the basis of any proprietary interest the remaining third parties may have in the information.

Central raises section 552.104 of the Government Code for a portion of its information. Section 552.104 excepts from disclosure information "if a governmental body demonstrates that release of the information would harm its interests by providing an advantage to a competitor or bidder in a particular ongoing competitive situation or in a particular competitive situation where the governmental body establishes the situation at issue is set to reoccur or there is a specific and demonstrable intent to enter into the competitive situation again in the future." *Id.* § 552.104(a) (emphasis added). In *Boeing Co. v. Paxton*, 466 S.W.3d 831 (Tex. 2015), the Texas Supreme Court held section 552.104 does not preclude third parties from raising section 552.104 as an exception to disclosure. *See Boeing*, 466 S.W.3d at 842. However, the Eighty-sixth Legislature has amended section 552.104 since the issuance of *Boeing*. *See* Act of May 25, 2019, 86th Leg., R.S., S.B. 943, § 3. Section 552.104 now expressly limits the protections of section 552.104 to governmental bodies. Gov't Code § 552.104(a). Therefore, we do not address Central's arguments under section 552.104 of the Government Code.

Section 552.110(c) of the Government Code states:

(c) Except as provided by Section 552.0222, commercial or financial information for which it is demonstrated based on specific factual evidence that disclosure would cause substantial competitive harm to the person from whom the information was obtained is [excepted from required disclosure].

Gov't Code § 552.110(c). Additionally, we note section 552.0222(b) lists certain types of information to which section 552.110 does not apply. *See id.* § 552.0222(b). Central argues some of its information consists of commercial or financial information subject to section 552.110(c). Upon review, we find Central has demonstrated some of the information at issue constitutes commercial or financial information, the release of which would cause substantial competitive harm. Accordingly, the authority must withhold the information we marked under section 552.110(c); however, to the extent the customer information is

made available to the public by Central, including but not limited to on its website or social media accounts, it may not be withheld under 552.110(c).¹ However, we find the remaining information at issue is subject to section 552.0222(b) and may not be withheld on the basis of section 552.110(c). Therefore, the authority may not withhold any of the remaining information at issue under section 552.110(c) of the Government Code.

Section 552.136(b) of the Government Code provides, “[n]otwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential.”² *Id.* § 552.136(b); *see id.* § 552.136(a) (defining “access device”). This office has concluded insurance policy numbers constitute access device numbers for purposes of section 552.136. *See* Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009). Accordingly, the authority must withhold the insurance policy numbers in the remaining information under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

We note some of the remaining materials at issue may be protected by copyright. A custodian of public records must comply with the copyright law and is not required to furnish copies of records that are copyrighted. Open Records Decision No. 180 at 3 (1977). A governmental body must allow inspection of copyrighted materials unless an exception applies to the information. *Id.*; *see* Open Records Decision No. 109 (1975). If a member of the public wishes to make copies of copyrighted materials, the person must do so unassisted by the governmental body. In making copies, the member of the public assumes the duty of compliance with the copyright law and the risk of a copyright infringement suit.

In summary, the authority must withhold the information we marked under section 552.110(c); however, to the extent the customer information is made available to the public by Central, including but not limited to on its website or social media accounts, it may not be withheld under 552.110(c) of the Government Code. The authority must withhold the insurance policy numbers in the remaining information under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The authority must release the remaining information; however, any information protected by copyright may only be released in accordance with copyright law.

¹ As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address the remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

² The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Emily Kunst
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

EK/jxd

Ref: ID# 931304

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

5 Third Parties
(w/o enclosures)