



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

February 8, 2022

Ms. Savannah L. Koehler
Paralegal
City of New Braunfels
550 Landa Street
New Braunfels, Texas 78130

OR2022-03356

Dear Ms. Koehler:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 928966 (PD Control No. 4962-21).

The New Braunfels Police Department (the "department") received a request for any and all records pertaining to a named individual. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. The doctrine of common-law privacy protects a compilation of an individual's criminal history, which is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. United States Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history).

Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public.

The present request requires the department to compile unspecified law enforcement records concerning the named individual. We find this request for unspecified law enforcement records implicates the named individual's right to privacy. Therefore, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold any such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we note you have submitted information that does not list the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant. This information does not constitute part of a criminal history compilation of the named individual and may not be withheld on that basis. Accordingly, we will address your arguments against disclosure of this information.

Next, we note some of the remaining information was the subject of a previous request for information, as a result of which this office issued Open Records Letter No. 2021-35399 (2021). In that ruling, we determined the department must; (1) withhold the information it marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common law privacy; (2) withhold the information it marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code; and (3) release the remaining information. Section 552.007 of the Government Code provides information that has been voluntarily released to a member of the public may not subsequently be withheld from another member of the public, unless public disclosure of the information is expressly prohibited by law or the information is confidential under law. *See Gov't Code § 552.007; Open Records Decision Nos. 518 at 3 (1989), 490 at 2 (1988).* Accordingly, the department may not withhold previously released information unless its release is expressly prohibited by law or the information is confidential under law. Although you raise section 552.108 of the Government Code for some of the previously released information, section 552.108 is a discretionary exception to disclosure that protects a governmental body's interests and does not make information confidential under the Act. *See Gov't Code § 552.007; Open Records Decision No. 177 (1977) (governmental body may waive statutory predecessor to section 552.108).* Therefore, to the extent the information at issue was previously released, the department may not now withhold that information under section 552.108 of the Government Code. Nonetheless, we have no indication the law, facts, or circumstances on which the prior ruling was based have not changed. Accordingly, to the extent the information we indicated is identical to the information previously requested and ruled upon by this office, the department must continue to rely on Open Records Letter No. 2021-35399 as a previous determination and withhold or release the identical information in accordance with that ruling.¹ *See Open Records Decision No. 673 (2001)* (so long as law, facts, and circumstances on which prior ruling was based have not changed, first type of previous determination exists where requested information is precisely same information as was addressed in a prior attorney general ruling, ruling is addressed to same governmental body, and ruling concludes that

¹ As we are able to make this determination, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

information is or is not excepted from disclosure). We will also consider the exceptions you raise for the information not subject to the previous ruling.

Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information concerning an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. *See* Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that has concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A) (governmental body must provide comments explaining why exceptions raised should apply to information requested). You state the remaining information relates to closed criminal investigations that did not result in convictions or deferred adjudications. Based on this representation and our review, we agree section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable to the remaining information.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. *Id.* § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle Publishing Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). *See also* Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Thus, with the exception of the basic information, the department may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.²

As mentioned above, section 552.101 of the Government Code encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which is subject to the two-part test discussed above. *Indus. Found.*, 540 S.W.2d at 685. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). Upon review, we conclude some of the remaining information meets the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, the department must withhold the information you marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

In summary, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold any such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. To the extent the information we indicated is identical to the information previously requested and ruled upon by this office, the department must continue to rely on Open Records Letter No. 2021-35399 as a previous determination and withhold or release the identical information in accordance with that ruling. With the exception of the basic information, which must generally be released, the department may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(2) of the

² As we are able to make this determination, we do not address the applicability of section 1701.661(a) of the Occupations Code to the submitted video recordings. *See generally* Occ. Code § 1701.661(a), (e).

Government Code. In releasing basic information, the department must withhold the information you marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Pearlie Gault
Attorney
Open Records Division

PG/mo

Ref: ID# 928966

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)