



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

February 1, 2022

Mr. Ricardo Vela, Jr.
Assistant District Attorney
Dallas County District Attorney's Office
Frank Crowley Courts Building
133 North Riverfront Boulevard, LB-19
Dallas, Texas 75207-4399

OR2022-03053

Dear Mr. Vela:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 928259.

The Dallas County District Attorney's Office (the "district attorney's office") received three requests from the same requestor for information related to a specified incident. You state the district attorney's office has released some of the requested information. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.132, 552.136, 552.137, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note section 552.301(e)(1)(D) of the Government Code states a governmental body asking for an attorney general decision must, within fifteen business days of receiving a request, provide the attorney general with "a copy of the specific information requested, *or submit representative samples of information if a voluminous amount of information was requested.*" Gov't Code § 552.301(e)(1)(D) (emphasis added). We note, with respect to Exhibit H, the district attorney's office submitted a voluminous amount of information consisting of over 6,000 pictures and videos, rather than a representative sample. We have reviewed a representative sample of the voluminous information at issue.¹

Section 552.108 of the Government Code provides in part:

¹ To the extent the district attorney's office identifies confidential information subject to a provision not addressed in this ruling, the district attorney's office should contact the Open Government Hotline.

(a) Information held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime is excepted from [required public disclosure] if:

...

(4) it is information that:

(A) is prepared by an attorney representing the state in anticipation of or in the course of preparing for criminal litigation; or

(B) reflects the mental impressions or legal reasoning of an attorney representing the state.

(b) An internal record or notation of a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that is maintained for internal use in matters relating to law enforcement or prosecution is excepted from [required public disclosure] if:

...

(3) the internal record or notation:

(A) is prepared by an attorney representing the state in anticipation of or in the course of preparing for criminal litigation; or

(B) reflects the mental impressions or legal reasoning of an attorney representing the state.

Id. § 552.108(a)(4), (b)(3). A governmental body must explain how and why section 552.108 is applicable to the information at issue. *See id.* §§ 552.108, .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). The district attorney’s office argues the release of Exhibits D, E, and F would reveal the mental impressions or legal reasoning of prosecutors. Based on our review of the submitted information, we agree sections 552.108(a)(4) and 552.108(b)(3) are applicable to the information at issue. Accordingly, the district attorney’s office may withhold Exhibits D, E, and F under sections 552.108(a)(4) and 552.108(b)(3) of the Government Code.²

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 of the Government Code encompasses section 58.008 of the Family Code, which provides, in part:

² As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

(b) Except as provided by Subsection (c), law enforcement records concerning a child and information concerning a child that are stored by electronic means or otherwise and from which a record could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as adult records, accessible only under controls that are separate and distinct from the controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subsection (c) or Subchapter B, D, or E.

Fam. Code § 58.008(b); *see id.* § 51.03(a)-(b) (defining “delinquent conduct” and “conduct indicating a need for supervision” for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). We understand you to raise section 58.008(b) of the Family Code. Section 58.008(b) is applicable to records of juvenile conduct that occurred before, on, or after September 1, 2017. *See* Act of May 28, 2017, 85th Leg., R.S., ch. 746, § 22. The juvenile must have been at least 10 years old and less than 17 years of age when the conduct occurred. *See* Fam. Code § 51.02(2) (defining “child” for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). Upon review, we find you have not demonstrated the remaining information identifies a juvenile suspect or offender for purposes of section 58.008(b). Accordingly, the district attorney’s office may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.008(b) of the Family Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. However, the right to privacy is a personal right that lapses at death and the common-law right to privacy does not encompass information that relates only to a deceased individual. *Moore v. Charles B. Pierce Film Enters., Inc.*, 589 S.W.2d 489, 491 (Tex. Civ. App.—Texarkana 1979, writ ref’d n.r.e.); *see also Justice v. Belo Broad. Corp.*, 472 F. Supp. 145, 147 (N.D. Tex. 1979) (“action for invasion of privacy can be maintained only by a living individual whose privacy is invaded” (quoting RESTATEMENT (SECOND) OF TORTS § 652I (1977))); Attorney General Opinions JM-229 (1984) (“the right of privacy lapses upon death”), H-917 (1976) (“We are . . . of the opinion that the Texas courts would follow the almost uniform rule of other jurisdictions that the right of privacy lapses upon death.”); Open Records Decision No. 272 (1981) (“the right of privacy is personal and lapses upon death”). Accordingly, information pertaining to a deceased individual may not be withheld on common-law privacy grounds. Upon review, we find you have failed to

demonstrate any of the remaining information is highly intimate or embarrassing to a living individual and of no legitimate public concern. Therefore, the district attorney's office may not withhold any portion of the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of constitutional privacy. Constitutional privacy consists of two interrelated types of privacy: (1) the right to make certain kinds of decisions independently, and (2) an individual's interest in avoiding disclosure of personal matters. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). The first type protects an individual's autonomy within "zones of privacy" which include matters related to marriage, procreation, contraception, family relationships, and child rearing and education. *Id.* The second type of constitutional privacy requires a balancing between the individual's privacy interests and the public's need to know information of public concern. *Id.* The scope of information protected is narrower than that under the common law doctrine of privacy; the information must concern the "most intimate aspects of human affairs." *Id.* at 5 (quoting *Ramie v. City of Hedwig Village, Texas*, 765 F.2d 490 (5th Cir. 1985)). We note the right to privacy is a personal right that lapses at death and therefore may not be asserted solely on behalf of a deceased individual. *See Moore*, 589 S.W.2d at 491. After review of the remaining information, we find you have failed to demonstrate how any portion of the information at issue falls within the zones of privacy or implicates a living individual's privacy interests for purposes of constitutional privacy. Therefore, the district attorney's office may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 on the basis of constitutional privacy.

The district attorney's office claims section 552.132 for some of the remaining information. Section 552.132 provides:

(a) Except as provided by Subsection (d), in this section, "crime victim or claimant" means a victim or claimant under Subchapter 56B, Code of Criminal Procedure, who has filed an application for compensation under that subchapter.

(b) The following information held by the crime victim's compensation division of the attorney general's office is confidential:

(1) the name, social security number, address, or telephone number of a crime victim or claimant; or

(2) any other information the disclosure of which would identify or tend to identify the crime victim or claimant.

(c) If the crime victim or claimant is awarded compensation under Article 56B.103 or 56B.104, Code of Criminal Procedure, as of the date of the award of compensation, the name of the crime victim or claimant and the amount of compensation awarded to that crime victim or claimant are public information and are not excepted from [required public disclosure].

(d) An employee of a governmental body who is also a victim under Subchapter B, Chapter 56B, Code of Criminal Procedure, regardless of whether the employee has filed an application for compensation under that subchapter, may elect whether to allow public access to information held by the attorney general's office or other governmental body that would identify or tend to identify the victim, including a photograph or other visual representation of the victim. An election under this subsection must be made in writing on a form developed by the governmental body, be signed by the employee, and be filed with the governmental body before the third anniversary of the latest to occur of one of the following:

- (1) the date the crime was committed;
- (2) the date employment begins; or
- (3) the date the governmental body develops the form and provides it to employees.

(e) If the employee fails to make an election under Subsection (d), the identifying information is excepted from disclosure until the third anniversary of the date the crime was committed. In case of disability, impairment, or other incapacity of the employee, the election may be made by the guardian of the employee or former employee.

Gov't Code § 552.132. In this instance, the information the district attorney's office seeks to withhold is held by the district attorney's office, not by the crime victim's compensation division of the attorney general's office. Therefore, section 552.132(b) is not applicable to any portion of the remaining information. Further, the district attorney's office does not inform us, and the submitted information does not reveal, the victim in the information at issue is an employee of any governmental body. Thus, the district attorney's office has failed to demonstrate the applicability of section 552.132(d) to any of the information. Accordingly, the district attorney's office may not withhold any portion of the information at issue under section 552.132 of the Government Code.

Section 552.136 of the Government Code provides, "[n]otwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential." *Id.* § 552.136(b); *see id.* § 552.136(a) (defining "access device"). However, we find you have not explained how any of the remaining information at issue consists of a credit card, debit card, or charge card number, or is an access device number used to obtain money, goods, services, or any item of value, or used to initiate the transfer of funds. *See id.*; *see also id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A) (governmental body must explain how claimed exception to disclosure applies). Therefore, we find you have failed to demonstrate the applicability of section 552.136 of the Government Code to the remaining information, and the district attorney's office may not withhold it on this ground.

Section 552.137 of the Government Code exempts from disclosure “an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body” unless the member of the public consents to its release or the e-mail address is of a type specifically excluded by subsection (c). *See id.* § 552.137(a)-(c). However, we find you have failed to demonstrate section 552.137 is applicable to any portion of the remaining information, and the district attorney’s office may not withhold any of the remaining responsive information at issue on that basis.

Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a government body to redact a living person’s social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. *See id.* § 552.147(b). Upon review, we find you have failed to demonstrate section 552.147 is applicable to any of the remaining information. Therefore, the district attorney’s office may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.147 of the Government Code.

In summary, the district attorney’s office may withhold Exhibits D, E, and F under sections 552.108(a)(4) and 552.108(b)(3) of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Chase D. Young
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CDY/ba

Ref: ID# 928259

c: Requestor